

ACADEMY OF SCIENCES OF ALBANIA
SECTION OF SOCIAL AND ALBANOLOGHICAL SCIENCES

STUDIA ALBANICA

2

STUDIA ALBANICA

Editorial board:

Seit MANSAKU (Editor-in-Chief)
Muzafer KORKUTI (Deputy Editor-in-Chief)
Francesco ALTIMARI
Jorgo BULO
Ethem LIKAJ
Shaban SINANI
Marenglen VERLI
Pëllumb XHUFİ

© 2017, Academy of Sciences of Albania

ISSN 0585-5047

Academy of Sciences of Albania
Section of social and albanological sciences
Square “Fan Noli”, no. 7
Tirana

Kolec TOPALLI

SOME ARCHAIC FEATURES IN DE RADA'S WORK

De Rada is the greatest Arbëresh poet and one of the best classic authors of the Albanian literature, and also a publicist and philologist, folklorist and activist, central figure of our national Renaissance. His name is associated with one of the most difficult, but also the most glorified time periods both for Italy and Albania, as he fought for both these countries. He started his activity when the Albanian Renaissance movement was still in its first steps, and for 70 years was its source of inspiration. He is a valuable representative of the Albanian national conscience and Albanians awakening, a symbol of sacrifice for Homeland and Liberty, a ray of hope that was emerging for a free and independent nation.

The efforts he made in the realm of history of Albanian language are priceless. As here we find words, expressions, forms and structures that reflect an earlier stage of the language, they are of particular importance for the study of its history. These words were written in the Arbëresh dialect, which has preserved many archaic features due to its secession in the 15th century from the national language axes. In addition, De Rada was spontaneously inspired, and this natural inspiration makes his work a reflection of the native spoken language and of surrounding countryside.

His contribution to the history of the Albanian language could be investigated in some aspects. Lexically, De Rada uses enough old words, archaisms that are of great etymological interest.¹ The poet, shed light phonetically on some dialectal characteristics, that we find even in some other areas where Albanian is spoken, both in the areas where the Arbëresh live and beyond Adriatic, in the southern lands, but sometimes even in some northern territories, because of migrant's

¹ E. Çabej, *Në botën e arbëreshëve të Italisë*, Tiranë, 1987, 37 v.

mixture with the natives. Some grammar definitions that were used in an earlier Albanian and preserved in the work of the great poet are of special interest. As archaic definitions, they are used even by the ancient authors or are found through dialectical spoken language. Consequently, a comparative view of them would help to design the general framework of Albanian language development in earlier periods.

For the nominative system, we would point out the preservation of the neuter gender of the names that today have different gender such as; *ballë, krye, ujë, rrush* etc.; e.g. *Ngrëjti ballët e sbuljuar; Pruar e uli kriethit; gjithë kaqë ata uj; rrusht i dha të lamahurve*. As it's known, this gender has been the most vivid some centuries ago, but by time has gradually diminished, and today have only few such names. At this point, De Rada puts in evidence a characteristic of the earlier Albanian language, also reported by the ancient authors of Albanian literature.² Another archaic characteristic that is found in De Rada's work, is a characteristic of accusative definite form with *-t* ending, always accompanied by a preposition, a case form created within Albanian in an earlier period than the beginnings of the written Albanian which existed in all the spoken forms, but today has remained only for dialectical use³.

De Rada uses it intensively, e.g. *Ndë çerët e dhezurës; Uj të rī ndë dejtīt; Si drita ndë qiellit*. Another archaic features used by De Rada is the plural of genitive-dative with the old *-et* ending of names that end with a consonant; e.g. *shpīt e njerëzet; E garruam vëllezëret; Komini i Topenjet*. In the today Albanian this case form is used with the *-ve* ending, where the consonant *-v-* has interfered before the names ending with vowel and later has entered even on those names coming out by consonant.

De Rada preserves such forms even in another characteristic: the *-t* article at the definite form, which in the today Albanian is no longer used; e.g. *Shkundi borën e fushavet; E rëmpiem gjithëtonevet; Friti ër e malevet*. De Rada often uses the old form of definite ablative with *-shit* ending; as: *Dielli i sqepur reshīt; Shpejt edhe pra duarshit t'ona*. Also

² E. Çabej, *Histori gjuhësore dhe strukturor e dialektore e arbërishtes së Italisë*, SF, 1975/2, p. 59.

³ K. Topalli, *Gramatikë historike e gjuhës shqipe*, Tiranë, 2010, 397 v.

this form, that today is not used in the spoken Albanian, has been alive to the old authors, as Buzuku, Matrënga etc. being also used during the Renaissance period. We also find, traces of a declension paradigm of the feminine names, that come with the *-ja* ending at the definite case; e.g. *e bashk dërgon të fala shëndetës të katundit*. Regarding the plural of the nouns we could mention some metaphonic cases such as: *shtrete*, *kuel*, *rehe*, e.g. *të shprishta ndër shtrete*⁴; *Gjegji kuel se hinkëlin*⁵; *çë more rehet?*, and this category includes even the adjectives forms, e.g. *Dushqe të lert rrëjin te rët*.

In the pronominal system, De Rada uses the old form *u* of the pronoun *unë/I*; e.g. *U pushonj ndë kët dimër*; *u të më shoh*; *O e shkreta u*. This form was also used by Buzuku, and is preserved even today in the northern Albania regions, and in the lateral southern spoken Albanian.⁶ The *kjo* pronoun, he uses in the old form preserved with the vowel *-ë*; e.g. *Kā m'erth te kurmi gjith këjo gadhī*. Though towards these preserved forms, De Rada uses evolved forms of demonstrative pronoun, where the stunted vowel has fallen, like in today Geg dialect; e.g., *Cëgjohet e ndë kët gjëll*; *At dit më rrī me mālī*; *U pushonj ndë kët dimër*. The other indefinite pronoun of *tjetër* preserved in its old simple form without compound article, that is the oldest form; e.g. *Kalli jetërën te gjiri*; *ruan n'j'ill e jetërin*. Even this form, that has disappeared from the today Albanian, is found on Buzuku's work.⁷ Another pronoun, that has preserved the oldest form, is the reflexive *vetëhe*; e.g., *Vate tha me vetëhën*; *Besën e kām mbī vethën*; *E ktu vetëhën time*. This ancient form of pronoun is found in all the old Geg writers and from the shape especially agrees with the form of the Southern spoken dialect: çam. *me vet'he, për vet'he*.

Regarding the verbal system, we could mention some archaic forms in shape, that are disappeared in today Albanian, but are vivid preserved in some peripheral spoken. On the present forms, is preserved the old ending *-nj*; e.g. *t'i frīnj ajrin*. The paradigm of verb conjugation in *-mi*, that in the today Albanian is preserved only in the

⁴ E. Çabej, *Shumësi i singularizuar në gjuhën shqipe*, Tiranë, 1967, 97.

⁵ Këtë trajtë metafonike e ka edhe Kosova.

⁶ Sh. Demiraj, *Gramatikë historike e gjuhës shqipe*, Tiranë, 1986, 447.

⁷ Buzuku: *Tue kujtuom për kat porsī njani burë o jetëra gruo, qī kurajtë të ginë nukë di* (XXII/2a).

jam/to be, kam/to have e *them/said* verbs, at the De Rada's work have a greater extension, including even other verbs; e.g. *na ju ruami*; *Pas vëdekur, tha, na rromi*; *mbi anī shkomi detin*. Another ending of the verbs in the present tense is *-ën*, that in the today Albanian is taken by few monosyllabic verbs as, *si ikën, ecën, hipën*, while in the De Rada's work has greater extension as, e.g. *Ajo e gjegjën*; *Lulevet që tundën era*.⁸

Even this verbal paradigm, that is an inner development of the Albanian language, has been very vivid some centuries ago, as Buzuku proves along with other authors; but it has come decreasing, and from it has remained only a few traces of it in the today language. In some cases, the passive form has been formed directly from the active form, getting also the endings; e.g. *E zëgjonem e garepsur*; *Mos zgjonet mëma*.

These forms could be met in the Buzuku's work and in some other peripheral southern Albania spoken dialects, especially in the Çam dialect. More diverse from this side are the imperfect forms, especially on the third singular person, that comes without ending, because the *-te* ending is relatively new. Thus made, De Rada preserves the oldest forms when they would not have the ending; e.g. *Çë mi dil tek udha e lumit*. These forms are used by the northern authors and form the Çam spoken dialect in the south. A denser use has another form of imperfect tense with the *-ej* ending, which is the same with the ending of the impersonal form; e.g. *Por lumbårdh e Anakreontit / Ronej Tëmp e moçëme*; *E u pruar t' ikënej*; *Shkonej vajza mespurtek*; *Vucën ajo ngrënej*. Even this form is vivid in the southern Albanian regions, especially in the Çam dialect; e.g. *edhe rronej mirë me gja*. The auxiliary verbs are used by De Rada on syncope forms; e.g. *Vreshtat in të verdhullore*; *doin e kīn të bëjin*. Such forms are found in some Geg spoken dialects, especially in the Malësi (Highland) region.⁹

On the simple past tense, the created form through the second person contraction extends also in the first person; e.g. *Bardhullore u më e pē*. This form is more popular in all the spoken Arbëresh,¹⁰ nay,

⁸ Gj. Shkurtaj, *Ligjërimit arbëreshe*, Tiranë, 2006, 207.

⁹ Khs. Në rapsoditë e Veriut: *kīn* çetinat vetëm kreshtat; *In* bucelat plot raki, / *in* fuçijat plot me venë.

¹⁰ La Piana, *Studi linguistici albanesi*, Varia, Palermo, 1949, 86.

she is used by the old northern authors. It is also interesting the verb *vete/go*, that is used with the *-te* ending even in the simple past tense, also as some Southern Albania spoken dialects; e.g. *Nd'uj një ditë vate te mali*.¹¹ The consonant *-t* is often used in the simple past tense as a secondary ending; e.g. *Sbardhëtin anëzit, Ruatin pranë u shegëtin; muartin frënt e zaljevet; e porsitëtin të të ndërrōnj*. The future forms, as all the forms of the spoken Arbëresh are created with the auxiliary verb *kam/have* and with the subjunctive; e.g. *Kā të niset e magjepsur?; E pse kē t'e thuash?*. This form that could also be met in the work of the first author of Arbëresh literature, Lekë Matrënga, was not used at this side of the Adriatic, on exception of some traces in the lower Albanian Coastline.

Some cases of the Geg infinitive form with the *me* particle; e.g. *mënōj ca hēr me rruar* could be found among the non-inflective forms. The use of this form that derives from the southern dialect, originates in the mixture of the southern migrated element with northern region groups. The gerundive is exposed in three different forms: *tuke, tue e ture*; e.g., *djalīn tuke ninulur të sëmurēm; tue mbjedhur tërkuzën; Prā të vëhej ture tjerë*. From these, the particle *tuke* belongs the Tosk dialect, *tue* is on the Geg dialect, while *ture* is a novelty in the Arbëresh spoken dialect.

Among the solidified particles, the prepositions *ndë, mbë* have preserved their old form, as Buzuku and other writers after him apply; e.g. *Ndë çerët e dhezurës; Fjisin, se ndë vatërët s'īn të j'atërat e vrërët; Kallëzoret mbë dhemat mbajn kangjele*. Its oldest form preserves also the negative particle *së*; e.g. *Së leu ndër të mundasha; Së doi t'ikënej*.

The syntax developments are of particular linguistic interest. There are old linguistic structures, that have disappeared or are on the verge of extinction in the modern Albanian, but have been present in the ancient Albanian. Here we could mention the unperfected ablative case; e.g. *Mua më zëgjoi tue fjturuar qelqevet finestërës; Dielli i sqepur reshīt*. The ablative case requires the preposition *për*; e.g. *Më rëmpeftë për dorje; Si garea që del për sish*. In the today Albanian from this use has remained only some spoken dialectical footprints (compare in Geg. VP: *e kapi për dore, i doli për hundësh/take him by the hand, pay*

¹¹ Khs. në Çamëri: *edhe ashtu vate plaka* (Pedersen).

through the nose). In addition, in the De Rada's work we could find nouns without preposition to express a complemented place; e.g. *Vet Fjokat u m'u hjimisa*; *Kur jesh djāl e Salonik vajta*; *Po ndë javet vemi Art*¹².

We are dealing with an ancient characteristic feature, that is proved in the most ancient languages: compare lat. *Eo Romam*. In any case the adjective is declined together with the noun that placed before it; e.g. *Deljet ona u kīn gapur /Ljumravit të kaljthërve*. Such cases of decline of both parts of the word-group are found at the old writers and here and there in the dialectical spoken forms; e.g. at Buzuku: *ata lanë Zotnë e ujënavet gjallave*; Bogdani *themeli i gjithë vepëravit mirave*; in folklore: *Kur ka dalë m'bjeshkën ma t'naltën*.

For the use of articulation are to be put in evidence two important cases on the Albanian language history. De Rada uses less than in the today Albanian the so-called possessive articulation with the kinship names, especially in plural; e.g. *se ndë vatërët /S'in të j'atërat e vrërët; te i emti ndë Pëllast*. The other case is the use of the prepositive article in front of ethnic names; e.g. *Po nd'ān streksi një i Arbresh*, which is also used by the old authors; e.g., at Bardhi: *I katundas*; at Bogdani: *të gjytetasitë*¹³.

De Rada often uses the ethical dative, a pronominal form that shows affinity; e.g. *Mos më jē ti e dheut guaj?*; *Kā bāllt u më ja e reshta*; *Më ja e vū ndë dorjet*; *E më j'u duk i jati*. On possessive pronouns, is to be observed the frequent use of their position before the noun; e.g. *itëvëllā erdh me dhëntërrin*; *Po jot motër martoghet*; *Ahier in-zot i njomur prori*; *i biri t'in zoti*. Some of these pronouns have preserved the earlier form of the possessive form with the vowel -ë (compare *inë*), which in general has fallen because of the unaccented position on which the pronoun is shown on a syntagma followed by a noun.

Of special interest are some words group of popular character, with parataxis instead of hypotaxis, that is used in the modern Albanian; e.g. *Ç'është e ikën si ajri?*. This also gives us a characteristic of the ancient Albanian traces of which could be met in the old writers in the

¹²Sh. Demiraj, *Historia e gjuhës së shkruar shqipe* (dispençë), Tiranë, 1967, 43.

¹³E. Çabej, *Rreth disa çështjeve të historisë së gjuhës shqipe*; "Buletini i Universitetit Shtetëror të Tiranës. Seria Shkencat Shoqërore", Tiranë, 3, 1963, 75.

dialectical form; e.g.: on Budi: *E prifti mbet e j tha*; on Northern rhapsodies: *me shpata kanë nisë e po priten*; *Ça ka qitun e ka thanë*. De Rada uses the form of the verb in subjunctive, in a syntagma with another verb without *të* particle; e.g. *e s'kam vinj më*; *Dua vete mbë kjish*. Finally, we should put in evidence a special case the words order in the imperative form on the verbs use and the pronoun's short form; e.g. *Thomnie ju të dashurit*; *po mbamnie se jasht m'e vrasën*. Here we are dealing with two pronoun forms, that are divided from each-other from the verbal ending (*tho-më-ni-e*, *mba-më-ni-e*), differently from the modern Albanian, where the short united forms are generally put before the ending; but such forms as those of De Rada, are found on the Çam subdialect¹⁴.

As conclusion, we can say that De Rada's has preserved many archaic features, that are avoided in the modern Albanian. In his works we found the native spoken of the poet, in a wider view, the Arbëresh dialect, that in many aspects is archaic and preserves elements of the medieval Albanian. In parallel of these characteristics with archaic character, in his work are also found innovations, that belong to the Arbëresh spoken. For all these, the works of the great Maki poet have a special importance on the research about the history of the Albanian language.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Bardhi, F., *Franciscus Blancus, Dictionarium latino-epiroticum*. Romae, 1635 (Dict.).

Bogdani, P., *Cuneus Prophetarum*. Patavii, 1685.

Budi, P., *Dottrina Christiana*. Roma, 1618.

Budi, P., *Rituale Romanum*. Roma, 1621.

Budi, P., *Speculum Confessionis*. Roma, 1621.

Buzuku, Gj., *Il "Messale" di Giovanni Buzuku*. Riproduzione e trascrizione di Namik Ressuli. Città del Vaticano. 1958.

Buzuku, Gj., *"Meshari" i Gjon Buzukut (1555)*. Botim kritik. Punuar nga Eqrem Çabej. Pjesa e parë: Hyrje dhe transliterim. Pjesa e dytë: Faksimile dhe transkribim fonetik. Tiranë, 1968.

¹⁴Q. Haxhihasani, *Vështrim i përgjithshëm mbi të folmen e banorëve të Çamërisë*, DS II 1974, 13.

Çabej, E., *Rreth disa çështjeve të historisë së gjuhës shqipe*; në "Buletini i Universitetit Shtetëror të Tiranës. Seria Shkencat Shoqërore". Tiranë; 3, 1963.

Çabej, E., *Shumësi i singularizuar në gjuhën shqipe*. Tiranë, 1967.

Çabej, E., *Histori gjuhësore dhe strukturore dialektore e arbërishtes së Italisë*. SF 2, 1975.

Çabej, E., *Në botën e arbëreshëve të Italisë*. Tiranë, 1987.

De Rada, G., *Poesie albanesi del secolo XV - Canti di Milosao, figlio del despota di Scutari*. Napoli, 1836.

De Rada, G., *Grammatica della lingua albanese*. Prima parte. Firenze, 1871.

De Rada, G., *Skanderbeku i pafân. Storie del secolo XV. Libro II*. Coriliano Calabro, 1873.

De Rada, G., *Poesie albanesi*. Vol. II. Uno specchio di umano transito. Napoli, 1897 (Serafina Topia).

De Rada, G., *I canti premilosaici*. Edizione critica e traduzione italiana a cura di Francesco Altimari. Catanzaro, 1998.

De Rada, G., *Opera omnia X. Opere grammaticali*. Catanzaro, 2007.

Demiraj, Sh., *Historia e gjuhës së shkruar shqipe* (dispençë). Tiranë, 1967.

Demiraj, Sh., *Gramatikë historike e gjuhës shqipe*. Tiranë, 1986.

Folklor shqiptar II. Epika legjendare. Vëllimi i parë. Tiranë, 1966.

Haxhihasani, Q., *Vështrim i përgjithshëm mbi të folmen e banorëve të Çamërisë*. DS II 1974.

La Piana, M., *Studi linguistici albanesi*. Varia. Palermo, 1949.

Matranga, L., *E mbsuame e chræsteræ* (dorëshkrimi I). Roma, 1592.

Matranga, L., *E mbsuame e krështerë*. A cura di Matteo Mandalà. Caltanissetta, 2004.

Pedersen, H., *Albanesische Texte mit Glossar*. Leipzig, 1895.

Shkurtaj, Gj., *Ligjërimet arbëreshe*. Tiranë, 2006.

Topalli, K., *Forme grammaticali e costruzioni archaiche nell'opera di De Rada*; "Omaggio a Girolamo de Rada", Atti del V Seminario internazionale di Studi Italo-Albanesi (2-5 ottobre 2003) e altri contributi albanologici. A cura di Francesco Altimari e Emilia Conforti. Università della Calabria. Rende, 2008.

Topalli, K., *Kontributi i veprave të De Radës për historinë e gjuhës shqipe*; "Buletin Shkencor", Universiteti "Luigj Gurakuqi", Shkodër, 55, 2005.

Topalli, K., *Gramatikë historike e gjuhës shqipe*. Tiranë, 2010.

Ioannis VITALIOTIS

**THE FRESCO DECORATIONS OF THE CHURCHES OF
VOSKOPOJA/MOSCHOPOLIS WITHIN POST-BYZANTINE
PAINTING OF THE 17TH-18TH CENTURIES**

The tradition is a work of spirit, which also is a work of tradition.

Nicolás Gómez Dávila

In distinction from other Balkan urban centers such as Berat, Ohrid, Kastoria or Veria, which also have preserved church' frescos assets, Voskopojë (*Moskopolis*, *Μοσχόπολις*) is a new city. So, Voskopojë does not have paintings of the Byzantine age, but only post-Byzantine paintings.¹ From this point-of-view, Voskopojë might be compared mainly with some cities and towns with Orthodox populations of the Ottoman Empire, developed in bases of the artisan and trade activity and relatively fast, viz in the XVII and XVIII centuries. Among others, here we could mention Kozani, in the western Macedonia, and Tsaritsani and Aja in Thessaly. In these new centers,

I would like to thank my dear friend Aleksandër Naci, graduated from the University of Athens in Greek Literature and post-graduated from the Macedonia University, for the text corrections. I owe my friend Dr. Ahillino Palushi and the restorer and PhD candidate Mrs. Edlira Çausi a debt of special gratitude for all their help and the photographic material.

¹ For the mural church painting in Voskopojë see also: K. Kirchhainer, "Die Bildausstattungen der Kirchen von Voskopojë und ihre Stellung in der nachbyzantinischen Wandmalerei des 18. Jahrhunderts", in: M. Durand (red.), *Patrimoine des Balkans. Voskopojë sans frontières 2004*, Paris: Somogy, éditions d'art, 2005, pp. 53-73; K. Kallamata, "Rreth tipareve të reja të programit ikonografik në pikturën murale të shek. 18", in: Durand, op. cit., pp. 75-79. Both above-mentioned papers mainly point out the iconographic program of the churches. For the city's organization and for the church institutions there to the great population exodus on 1769, see the monumental work of the metropolitan Joakim Martinianos: Ιωακείμ Μαρτινιανός, μητροπολίτης Ξάνθης, *Η Μοσχόπολις, 1390-1930*, επιμέλεια Στίλπωνος Κυριακίδου, Θεσσαλονίκη: Εταιρεία Μακεδονικών Σπουδών, 1957, pp. 67-183.

the social and economic development was accompanied by the building and the depiction of new churches.²

From the many church monuments of Voskopoja, except Prodhrom monastery, today only five have been preserved today. About the architectural typology, the church of Shën(Saint) Prodhrom monastery belongs to a rare version called “athoni” type: naos is in the form of inscribed cross with a triapsidal dome, but the western flank is covered with a dome without kettledrum (semi-circular calotte). On the other hand, the basilicas that are preserved today within the city, all with big dimensions, are presented as typical samples from the late period of post-Byzantine church architecture: they are treble with a portico along one of the two longitudinal walls. Regarding the shelter, with characteristic exception of the Prophet Illya where we have a wooden roof and ceiling, the basilica of Voskopoja are covered in a complex system of arches, semi-circular calotte and archways in different forms. As it is understandable, inside there is the longitudinal axis that is on evidence, and concave surfaces that are especially big could be met on the other side.³ This characteristic creates challenges for the post-Byzantine painter, because new data are created: is decisively

²On the class development of the Balkan Orthodox merchants since the end of the XVII century and especially in the region that includes southern Albania, Macedonia, Epirus and Thessaly, see: T. Stojanovich, “The Conquering Balkan Orthodox Merchant”, *The Journal of Economic History* 20.2 (June 1960), pp. 234-313; A. Βακαλόπουλος, *Ιστορία της Μακεδονίας, 1354-1833*, Θεσσαλονίκη: Βάνιας, 1992², pp. 258-431 etj.; Π. Θ. Πιζάνιας, *Η ιστορία των νέων Ελλήνων. Από το 1400ε. έως το 1820*, Αθήνα: Βιβλιοπωλείον της Εστίας, 2014, pp. 241-281 etc.; O. Jens-Schmitt, “Epirus”, in: O. Jens-Schmitt - M. Metzeltin (red.), *Das Südosteuropa der Regionen*, Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2015, pp. 677-733. See also: P. F. Sugar, *Southeastern Europe under Ottoman rule, 1354-1804*, Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1977, pp. 187-248 etc.; D. Quataert, *The Ottoman Empire, 1700-1922*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005², pp. 37-53; R. Clogg, “The Greek Millet in the Ottoman Empire”, in: B. Braude (red.), *Christians and Jews in the Ottoman Empire: The Abridged Edition*, Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienr Publishers, 2014, pp. 109-131.

³ On the post-Byzantine church architecture in Albania, see: A. Meksi - P. Thomo, “Arkitektura pasbizantine në Shqipëri”, *Monumentet* 11 (1976), pp. 127-145 (new edition in: A. Meksi, *Studime për monumentet dhe resaurimin*, I, *Monumentet 197-1980* [Tirana 2015], nr. XIV); P. Thomo, *Kishat pasbizantine në Shqipërinë e Jugut*, Tiranë: KOASH, 1998, especially, for Korça region, pp. 37-96, 235-253.

influenced from the largeness and multifariousness of the iconographic program, and also by his structure.

Chronologically, the monuments that have preserved frescos until today are as following:

1. The church of Prodhrom monastery (Shën Joan Pararendësi), two kilometers from the city, painted a little bit later than 1632 and, at a second phase, in 1659.

2. The cathedral of Shën Mërisë (Saint Mary), in Sarxha neighborhood, painted in 1712. Here we can mention two painters, Theodhor Anagnosti (Θεόδωρος Αναγνώστη) and Sterjano (Στεργιανός).⁴ Also, in the southern narthex are preserved in bad conditions frescos who date in 1715.

3. The church of Shën Mëhill, in the Illia neighborhood,⁵ painted in 1722, from unknown painters.

4. The church of Shën Nikolla (called Shën Kollî), in Rue neighborhood, painted on 1726 “with the perceptive paintbrush of all-hermit Mr. David Selenicasi (Δαβίδ τοῦ Σελενιτζιότου)”, assisted by Konstandin (Κωνσταντίνος) and Kristo (Χρίστος). The southern portico was painted in 1750 from Konstandin (Κωνσταντίνος) and Athanas (Ἀθανάσιος) Zografi brothers, from Korça.

5. The church of Shën Thanas, in the Skamneliq neighborhood, painted in 1744 from the brothers Konstandin and Athanas. Also the southern portico was painted by them a year later, in 1745.

⁴ In the translation of the dedicating inscription from Th. Popa (*Mbishkrime të kishave të Shqipërisë*, Tiranë: Akademia e Shencave e RSH, 1998, pp. 164-165, nr. 326), the painters of the monument are presented as three by mistake: “Theodori, Anagnosti, Steriani” (the same thing on: Thomo, *Kishat pasbizantine*, op. cit., p. 61, note 46, Kirchhainer, “Die Bildausstattungen der Kirchen von Voskopoje”, op. cit., p. 54, 68). However, I think that we have two and not three artists, because *Anagnosti* should be considered as the surname of Theodor.

⁵ Theofan Popa, in the Albanian translation of the dedicating inscription of the Shën Mëhill church (*Mbishkrime*, op. cit., p. 168), mistakenly quotes the neighborhood as of “Shën Illiu”, while the metropolis Joakim Martinianos (*Η Μοσχόπολις*, op. cit., pp. 71-72, 94) gives the right name, *Illiu* (Ἰλλιον), viz, in the Vlach language, “e Illiës”; of course, as Martinianos presupposes, this is the name of the head of the tribe, who established the neighborhood.

6. The church of the prophet Ilya (Shën Illia) was built in 1751. The frescos that are preserved in bema (apse) should date a little earlier than the fall of Voskopoja period, in 1760.

The frescos ranking based on the contemporary style of the Balkan painters is in the present paper made for a better understanding of Voskopoja picture art.

The ancient frescos of Voskopoja are situated in **Shën Joan Prodhrom monastery**.⁶ The church (*katholiko*) of the monastery was build (or, likely was rebuild) with the expenses of the archon Mr. Gjergji Guxo (κὺρ κὺρ Γεώργι Γκοῦτζο), in 1632, according to a inscription, now totally disappeared. The baptistery (apse) painting changes a little from other frescos monuments. Thus, is explained even the existence of donor's short inscription (are preserved the names of Pjetër and Gerasim), which is half ruined.⁷

In any case, the frescos of the first phase date prior to 1659, when the church was completely painted. This last phase of embellishment is connected with the principal dedicating inscription, which is situated within the naos, on the western wall.⁸ This second inscription shows us that the embellishment was made in the time of hieromonk, Mr. Andon, (κὺρ Ἀντωνίου ἱερομονάχου) and of his beatitude, the first bishop of Justiniana and Ohrid, Mr. Ignat (mistakenly written Enati, Ἐνατίου), and the donor was the archon Mr. Mihal (κὺρ Μιχάλης), the son of the late Kostandin, together with his wife and children. Is very interesting the fact that the painter does not consider adding his name (or, was not allowed to do so by the monastery authorities) necessary.

⁶ On Shën Prodhrom church architecture, see: Thomo, *Kishat pasbizantine*, op. cit., pp. 57-60. On its painting see: Θ. Τσάμπουρας, *Τα καλλιτεχνικά εργαστήρια από την περιοχή του Γράμμου κατά τον 16ο και 17ο αιώνα: Ζωγράφοι από το Λινοτόπι, τη Γράμμοστα, τη Ζέρμα και το Μπουρμπουντσικό*, (disert. for the PhD degree, Αριστοτέλειο Πανεπιστήμιο Θεσσαλονίκης - Φιλοσοφική Σχολή - Τμήμα Ιστορίας και Αρχαιολογίας), 2013, 1, p. 362-367.

⁷ Δε[η]σ[ις] Πιερ [...] | Γερασίου [...] (: "Lutja e Pjetrit (...) Gerasimit") (Τσάμπουρας, *Τα καλλιτεχνικά εργαστήρια από την περιοχή του Γράμμου*, op. cit., v. I, p. 364).

⁸ For the inscriptions see: Popa, *Mbishkrime*, op. cit., pp. 158-159, nr. 306 (inscription of 1659); Τσάμπουρας, *Τα καλλιτεχνικά εργαστήρια από την περιοχή του Γράμμου*, op. cit., v. I, p. 363.

The careful examination of the two paintings phases leads us towards the famous painters from Linotopi village, in Gramoz Mountain. Unfortunately, the naos and bema frescos were heavily damaged by the fire, mainly the colors, because they are pallid. Nonetheless, narthex was saved, and thus the decor there, allows us to have a precise idea on author of the painting which dates in 1659.⁹ **(Fig. 1)** The artist seems that has somehow assimilated the baroque characteristics of Frangos Katelanos, distinguished post-Byzantine painter, active painter in western and northern Greece between 1530 and 1560.¹⁰ The decorated gypsum aureoles, gold in color, could be often met in Katelanos frescos, e.g., in the naos of Varlaami monastery in Meteora (1548).¹¹ **(Fig.2)** Also, the painter of the 1659 phase in the

⁹ About the author's identification of the first phase which is limited in baptistery, as I mentioned above, there is a disagreement between the specialists. We wait for the studies of Edlira Çausi, restorer and PhD candidate, who is involved in technical aspects on the Linotopi work in Albania. The results of this work would be very important for as many questions could be answered.

¹⁰ The painter Frango Katelanos was from Thiva, but seems that had mainly as epicenter the city of Ioannina. He has worked in Aetolia, in Ioannina, in Meteora, in Kastoria even in other countries of western Macedonia, also in Athos mountain, where his last work (and the only signed by him), the frescoes of Shën Nikolla chapel, in Lavë e Madhe (1560) is preserved. On Frango Katelanos, see: M.-M. Garidis, *La peinture murale dans le monde orthodoxe après la chute de Byzance, 1450-1600 et dans les pays sous domination étrangère*, Athènes: Spanos, 1989, pp. 172-173, 189-199, etc.; M. Χατζηδάκης - E. Δρακοπούλου, *Έλληνες ζωγράφοι μετά την Άλωση (1450-1830)*, v. 2, Αθήνα: Κέντρο Νεοελληνικών Ερευνών Ε.Ι.Ε., 1997, pp. 76-79; A. Semoglou, *Le décor mural de la chapelle athonite de Saint Nicolas (1560). Application d'un nouveau langage pictural par le peintre thébain Frangos Katelanos*, Villeneuve d'Ascq: Septentrion, 1998; A. Σέμογλου, "Ο εντοίχιος διάκοσμος του καθολικού της μονής Μυρτιάς στην Αιτωλία (φάση του 1539) και η θέση του στη ζωγραφική του α΄ μισού του 16ου αι.", *Εγνατία* 6 (2001-2002), pp. 185-237; M. Αχειμάστου-Ποταμιάνου, *Οι τοιχογραφίες της μονής των Φιλανθρωπινών στο Νησί των Ιωαννίνων*, Αθήνα: Αδάμ-Πέργαμος, 2004, pp. 51-143; N. Σιώμοκς, "Εικόνες από το αρχικό τέμπλο του ναού της Υπαπαντής στη Θεσσαλονίκη. Ανασύνθεση ενός συνόλου του 16ου αιώνα" ("Portable Icons of the original Iconostasis of the Hypapante Church in Thessaloniki. Reconstructing a Sixteenth-Century Set"), *Δελτίον της Χριστιανικής Αρχαιολογικής Εταιρείας* 27 (2006), pp. 321-334 (bibliography on Frango Katelano: op. cit., pp. 331, sh. nr. 94).

¹¹ Such halo on gypsum are not particularly common in the frescoes of the XVII century. Earlier than Shën Prodhrom of Voskopoja, belong to the katholiko of Shën Gjergji monstery in Eptachori, near Kastoria (1625) (Τσάμπουρας, *Τα καλλιτεχνικά*

monastery of Prodhrom, seems to have embraced the iconographic, as well as the aesthetic features of the School of Crete of the XVI century such as the clear organization of design, figures' monumentality, the purity and accuracy of the design.¹² At the same time, the art of the anonymous painter of Prodhrom monastery, imitating the style of XVI century, reproduces it in a more stylistic and simplified way, without the spirit of freedom.

This painter was rightfully identified as Nikolla (*Νικόλαος*) from Linotopi by Theohari Camburas. the Greek Byzantinist.¹³ To be more precise, we have to do with Nikolla nr. 4, because there have been six painters from Linotopi with the same name.¹⁴ Nikolla (4) belongs to the last phase of "Linotopi school." He is distinguished by his refined and decorating style, as attest the frescos dating of 1649 in the monastery of Shën Mërisë së Shpellës (*μονή Σπηλαίου*), near Grevena, and the frescos of 1652 in the monastery of Shpëtimtari (Savior) in Dhriovuno, near Siatista, (**Fig. 3**) both in the Greek Macedonia. Also the frescos of

εργαστήρια από την περιοχή του Γράμμουν, op. cit., v. II, fig. 545-547, 552α-γ). For this monument, painted by a group of anonymous painters, could have worked a certain Nikolla (*Νικολός*) from Linotopi, according to Theohari Tsamburas. Anyway, he cannot be identified with Nikolla (4), to whom are attributed the frescoes in the Prodhrom monastery of Voskopoja dated in 1659, as we would see below: Except the stylistic distinction, the previous signs as *Νικολός*, viz, in the popular form of the name, and not as *Νικόλαος*, as always does Nikolla (4). The same *Nikollo*, after the inscription's certificate, has collaborated with Mihal (signed as *Μιχαήλ*) from Linotopi and his son Konstandin in Shën Nikolla of Saraqinishta, Lunxhëri, on 1630 (see: Τσάμπουρας, *Τα καλλιτεχνικά εργαστήρια από την περιοχή του Γράμμουν*, op. cit., v. I, pp. 87-90, 176-182).

¹²See: M. Chatzidakis, *The Cretan Painter Theophanis: The First Phase of his Art in the Wall-Paintings of the Holy Monastery of Stavronikita* (translated by A. Doumas -J. Vulliamy), Mount Athos: Holy Monastery of Stavronikita, 1986.

¹³Τσάμπουρας, *Τα καλλιτεχνικά εργαστήρια από την περιοχή του Γράμμουν*, op. cit., v. I, p. 365-367. Generally, on the work of Nikolla (*Νικόλαος*) (4) from Linotopi see: Τσάμπουρας, op. cit., v. I, pp. 97-103, v. II, Kataloge, pp. 3-4, 9-10, fig. 677-804.

¹⁴Theoharis Tsamburas (op. cit.) identifies the painter *Nikolla (IV)* of Dhriovouno monastery (and of Prodhrom monastery in Voskopojë) as the homonymous painter, he also from Linotopi, of Shën Nikolla church of archon Thomanos in Kastoria (1639). In our opinion, if they are not two different persons, the style of painter Nikolla (4) has considerably evolved between the 1630 and 1650, as Tsamburas himself admits.

1654 in the monastery of Novo Hopovo, in Fruška Gora (northern Serbia) are attributed to the same artist.

Anyway, the work of Nikolla (4) in Voskopoja fully shows his maturity as painter and the final phase of his growth related to a decorative and “rich” style. Although the western iconographic methods have been applied, the classicist decor in the lower belt of the narthex in Prodhrom monastery is surprising, because it is unique in the painter's repertoire from Linotopi. (**Fig. 4**) This elegant combination of motives such as bourgeons, flowers, birds, masks and harps, is by no doubt devotedly copied from an engraving, or by some art object, imported from Western or Central Europe.

As we mentioned above, **the Cathedral of Shën Mërisë**, the biggest church of Voskopoja,¹⁵ was painted by Theodhori Anagnosti and Sterjano, two painters, coming from Agrafa, a mountainous region in Central Greece. (**Fig. 5**) It is somehow a paradox that Voskopoja, a city located far from Agrafa, preserves the most enlarged sample of the last phase of this “School.” Moreover, the cathedral of Shën Mërisë, as much as I know, happens to be the greatest monument adorned by the Agrafa painters.¹⁶

The expenses for the adornment were made by many donators, overall twelve persons, clerics and seculars, archons and simple people, all mentioned in the inscription: The priest Konstandin, priest of the lower order L Lazar, Adhami Papa, Dhimitri Prendo, Adhami Dhimitri, etc., in the time of the Korça metropolis bishopric and the late Sellasfor Daniil.¹⁷

The presentation of Agrafa people in Voskopoja in 1712 is surprising, because indeed, the XVII century marks the “School of

¹⁵On Shën Mëri cathedral architecture in Voskopoja, see: Thomo, *Kishat pasbizantine*, op. cit., pp. 61-65.

¹⁶On Shën Mëri painting see: Kirchhainer, “Die Bildausstattungen der Kirchen von Voskopoje”, op. cit., pp. 54, 67-68.

¹⁷The dedicating inscription was published by Th. Popa, *Mbishkrime*, op. cit., pp. 164-165, nr. 326 and by P. Thomo, *Kishat pasbizantine*, op. cit., p. 61, shën. 46. I am allowed to note that in these two published inscriptions are almost united by mistake by two different donators names, Adhami Papa and Dhimitri Prendo, in a way that they are presented as the same person, “Adam Papadhimiter Prendi(t).” On the other side, in Popa's translation, as we mentioned above (see note 5), both church's painters are presented as three (“Theodori, Anagnosti, Steriani”).

Agrafa” splendor.¹⁸ The “School of Agrafa” connects the “savant” picture of the XVI century, especially Frango Katelanos’s tradition (and also that of the School of Crete), with the artisan painting of the XVII century.¹⁹

As the **Shën Mëhill** frescos dated in 1722,²⁰ (**Fig. 6**) are closely connected with the cathedral’s painting, it might be said that these two monuments belong to the same atelier. In addition, we have to say that the expenses for the adornment of the Shën Mëhill frescos, as in the Cathedral case, were collectively made. The inhabitants of the “Ilyia” (*Ἡλίου*) neighborhood (*μαχαλᾶ*)” were the sponsors of the adornment of the Shën Mëhill frescos. Unfortunately, except Nikolla's name (perhaps a priest), the inscription is destroyed at the point where the names of the donors are mentioned. The name of the bishop mentioned here is “his beatitude” Joasaf, Ohrid’s archbishop, later mentioned even in the Shën Koll and Shën Thanas inscription.²¹

In our opinion, the fame of Agrafa painters of the XVII century, perhaps with some specified similarity of that “School” with Nikolla's painting (5) in the monastery of Prodhrom, as I mentioned above, should had played an important role to the invitation of Theodhor Anagnosti and Sterjanos in the Voskopoja city. Shën Mëria and Shën Mëhill frescos prove the final splendor of the “old” aesthetics, traditional and conservative, that in a paper has been named as “popular post-Byzantine mannerism” or “style of the 1600.”²² The “School of

¹⁸Nonetheless, we have even in the XVIII century a continuity of the painting in that area, from anonymous painters, almost locals, but even from coming painters. Such are Serafimi from Chios island, Dhimitri Anagnosti from Mecova, the priest Theodhori from Aja, eastern Thessaly; see I. K. Τσιουρήs, *Οι τοιχογραφίες της Μονής Αγίας Τριάδος Δρακότρυπας (1758) και η μνημειακή ζωγραφική του 18ου αιώνα στην περιοχή των Αγράφων*, Αθήνα: Ελληνικά Γράμματα, 2008, pp. 299-386.

¹⁹On “Agrafa school” in sh. 17, see Σ. Σδρόλια, *Οι τοιχογραφίες του καθολικού της μονής Πέτρας (1625) και η ζωγραφική των ναών των Αγράφων του 17ου αιώνα* (Μελέτες 1), Βόλος: ΥΠΑΙΘΠΑ – ΑΙΘΣ, 2012.

²⁰On Shën Mëhill church architecture, see: Thomo, *Kishat pasbizantine*, op. cit., pp. 70-72. For the frescoes of Shën Mëhill see also Kirchhainer, “Die Bildausstattungen der Kirchen von Voskopoje”, op. cit., pp. 54, 56-57, 67-68.

²¹Popa, *Mbishkrime*, op. cit., pp. 167-168, nr. 333.

²²I. Βιταλιώτης, “*Ἀρχὴ παιδεύσεως ἢ τῶν ὀνομάτων ἐπίσκεψις*: Γύρω ἀπὸ ὀρισμένα ζητήματα ὀρολογίας στὴ μελέτῃ τῆς μεταβυζαντινῆς ζωγραφικῆς” (“*The examination of names is the beginning of learning*: Some issues of terminology

Agrafa” style was totally linear, solid and stylized in Voskopja. A few years later, the ecclesiastical painting in Agrafa would adopt a more western style, which have as protagonist the priest Theodhori, from Aja.²³

The inscription **in the church of Shën Koll**²⁴ dated in 1726 is presented on verses. Moreover, this dedication is particularly long and sophisticated, because it praises and worship David Selenica, the main artist. The painting was financed from the late archon Mr. Haxhi Gjergji (κῶρ Χατζῆ Γεωργίου), at the time of Ohrid and Sellasfori Joasaf.²⁵

By that impressionist work of the painter from Selenica district of Vlora, we pass in another artistic place²⁶ (**Fig. 7**). The paintings clearly illustrate his artistic maturity. Up to now, he has painted some monuments in modest dimensions in Mount Athos such as the narthex of Shën Mëri Kukuzelisa chapel, in the Lavra e Madhe, in 1715. The decoration of great Voskopja basilica was challenging for him. The Cathedral of Shën Mëria played an important role in the adaption of the iconographic data in the Shën Koll church space.

The data show that David, by being a monk in Mount Athos, has collaborated with Dionysios another athonit monk. The latter was from

concerning the study of Post-Byzantine painting”), nē: X. Χοτζάκογλου (red.), *Χαριστήριος Τόμος στον Καθηγητή Δημήτριο Δ. Τριανταφυλλόπουλο* (= *Κυπριακές Σπουδές* 78 [2016-2017]), pp. 91-111.

²³ See: Τσιουρής, *Οι τοιχογραφίες της Μονής Αγίας Τριάδος Δρακότρυπας*, op. cit.

²⁴ On the Shën Koll church architecture, see: Thomo, *Kishat pasbizantine*, op. cit., pp. 65-69.

²⁵ See, *Mbishkrime*, op. cit., pp. 166-167, nr. 331.

²⁶ On the painting of Shën Koll church, see: Kirchhainer, “Die Bildausstattungen der Kirchen von Voskopje”, op. cit., pp. 56-57, 60, 63-66, 68-69; A. Palushi, *Jeta dhe vepra e David Selenicës, figurë e rëndësishme e pikturës pasbizantine* (disert. for PhD degree, Tirana University), 2016. About the painter David Selenica see also: M. Χατζηδάκης, *Έλληνες ζωγράφοι μετά την Άλωση (1450-1830)*, v. 1, Αθήνα: Κέντρο Νεοελληνικών Ερευνών Ε.Ι.Ε., 1987, 107-108; A. Tourta (red.), E. Drakopoulou (catalogue text), *Icons from the Orthodox Communities of Albania. Museum of Byzantine Culture, Collection of the National Museum of Medieval Art of Korce* (translated by D. Hardy), Thessaloniki: European Centre of Byzantine and Post-Byzantine Monuments – Kapon Editions, 2006, pp. 132-136, nr. 44-46; Γ. Τσιμπούκης, *Η Αποκάλυψη του Ιωάννη στη μνημειακή ζωγραφική του Αγίου Όρους*, Αθήνα: Bookstars, 2013, pp. 263-264.

Furna village, Agrafta. Dionysios, an ideologist painter, was a special case among post-Byzantine artists: not only because he has written *Hermeneia* (*Ερμηνεία*, "Interpretation"), a well-known iconographic manual. Here he enthusiastically speaks about the turn towards the genuine "source" of inspiration for the church painting. As incomparable example, the painter from Furna powerfully considers the painting of Protato church.²⁷ This cathedral of the Sacred Mountain was ornamented around 1300 from the legendary painter "Manuel Panselino", as this was believed to be his name in the XVIII century.²⁸ Consequently, Dionysios became the theoretician of the "Rinascimento" of the so-called "the first paleologist style" or "the voluminous style." it is clear that this artistic movement suites with the new spirit of XVIII century even with his encyclopedic tendency. David has adopted Dionysios stylistic preferences, clearly noted in his voluminous forms, and indirectly, his contemptuous stand towards the conservative style of the XVII century.

Although David is a more talented painter than Dionysios, he doesn't open a new path, but limits himself to the improve of the "neo-paleologist" style of his collaborator. As David is an artist of XVIII century, and not of XIV century, his art reflects the *Zeitgeist*: David's paleologist style used around 1300 shows a moderated naturalism,

²⁷ On the painter Dionysios from Fournas see: Χατζηδάκης, *Έλληνες ζωγράφοι*, op. cit., v. 1, 105-107; G. Kakavas, *Dionysios of Fournas (c. 1670 - C. 1745): Artistic Creation and Literary Description*, Leiden: Alexandros Press, 2008; E. N. Τσιγαρίδας, "Φορητές εικόνες του Διονυσίου του εκ Φουρνά των Αγράφων και του εργαστηρίου του στις Σέρρες" ("Portable Icons by Dionysios of Fournas in Serres"), *Μακεδονικά* 38 (2009), pp. 97-131; Idem (ed.), *Εικόνες Ιεράς Μονής Καρακάλλου, Άγιον Όρος: Ιερά Μονή Καρακάλλου*, 2011, pp. 201-246; Μ. Βασιλάκη, "Ακολουθώντας τα βήματα του Διονυσίου του εκ Φουρνά" ("Following the Footsteps of Dionysios of Fournas"), *Δελτίον της Χριστιανικής Αρχαιολογικής Εταιρείας* 33 (2012), pp. 379-386.

²⁸ The name of Manuel Panselinos as Protato painter is heralded in the later athonite tradition, perhaps not earlier than the XVIII century. During the lately restoring work were discovered inscriptions with the name of the painters Michael and Eutychi, on the saints Eustathi and Merkur presentation. These are well-known painters (the first among them has the last name Astrapa) connected with the monuments of Serb kralj Milutin; see: I. Κανονίδης (red.), *Πρωτότων. Η συντήρηση των τοιχογραφιών*, Πολύγυρος: Ιερά Κοινότητα Αγίου Όρους Άθω – Υπουργείο Πολιτισμού και Αθλητισμού, 2015, v. 2, pp. 22-23, 40-42 (Α. Νάστος, Σ. Στεφανίδης).

which could be met in the secondary elements. The decoration style, which characterizes David's artistic creation is a pure reflection of the spirit of the XVIII century.

Shën Thanas church,²⁹ as was earlier mentioned, represents the main work of the brothers Konstandin and Athanas Zografi from Korça in Voskopoja³⁰ (**Fig. 8**). Based on inscription within the naos, in the southern wall, the ornamenting ended in October 25, 1644 at the time of Joasaf, Ohrid bishop. Mr. Kosta Gjika was the main donor, while Mr. Vrusi Sofroni was the church's caretaker. The text shows us that the archons and "other Christians from the Skamel (Σκαμελίτου) neighborhood"³¹ also helped with the expenses. The southern portico was painted in July 28, 1665, according to a second inscription under the same caretaker. Here names of the donors are not mentioned, but likely they are the same as in the main church.³²

Five years later, in 1750, both painters from Korça would decorate the southern portico of Shën Kolli church with the apocalyptic cycle of

²⁹On the architecture of Shën Thanas church, see: Thomo, *Kishat pasbizantine*, op. cit., pp. 73-76.

³⁰On the painting of Shën Thanas church, see: Kirchhainer, "Die Bildausstattungen der Kirchen von Voskopoje", op. cit. p. 56, 63-66, 69; K. Kallamata, "About new features of iconographic program in the mural painting of 18 century", in: Durand, *Voskopoje sans frontières*, op. cit., pp. 75-79; M. Durand, "A propos de l'onomastique des Quarante Martyrs de Sébaste représentés dans l'église de Saint-Athanase (Shën Thanas) à Voskopoje : les sources iconographiques des peintres Constantin et Athanas Zografi", in: Durand, *Voskopoje sans frontières*, op. cit., p. 94-109; D. Mercier, "Représentation de textiles ottomans dans le décor de l'église Saint-Athanase (Shën Thanas) de Voskopoje", in: Durand, op. cit., pp. 110-120. On the painters Konstandin and Athanas Zografi from Korça and their atelier, see: Γ. Τσιγάρας, *Οι ζωγράφοι Κωνσταντίνος και Αθανάσιος από την Κορυτσά. Το έργο τους στο Άγιον Όρος (1752-1783)*, Αθήνα 2003; Tourta - Drakopoulou, *Icons from the Orthodox Communities of Albania*, op. cit., pp. 142-181, nr. 48-61; Τσιμπούκης, *Η Αποκάλυψη του Ιωάννη*, op. cit., pp. 266-269 etc.

³¹The Metropolitan Joakim Martiniano (*Η Μοσχόπολις*, op. cit., pp. 74-75) mentions exactly the name of neighborhood, *Skamneliq* (Σκαμνελίκι). This according to him, is the corrupted form of *Skamnelicili* word, which in the Vlach language, shows the first colons that have come from Skamneli village, near Meçova, in Ioannina region.

³²On the dedicated inscriptions at Shën Thanas church: Popa, *Mbishkrime*, op. cit., pp. 173-174, nr. 345 (the inscription in naos, 1744), 346 (the inscription is on colonnaded, 1745).

the Revelation by Joan. **(Fig. 9)** In addition, in the same region and year, Konstandin and Athanas painted Shën Anargjirëve church in Shën Pjetër and Pal monastery in Vithkuq.³³ I think, for certain, it is the same atelier which undertook the decoration of **Shën Illia (Prohet)** in Voskopoja.³⁴ In this parish church, the last that has been build in the city, seems that the frescos decoration was limited in bema, even why we don't know the extension of the original painting. Today, is preserved the in faded colors the Last Humbleness (the dead Christ, sit in His tomb, between His Mother and Joan Theolog) in prothesis **(Fig. 10)**. Some donors names are also included in a dedicating inscription under the revelation of the Virgin.³⁵ It is quite possible that the work of Zografi brothers from Voskopoja might have been a passport for the Sacred Mountain, where they undertook some great works up to 1783.

The “School of Korça” iconography is based on the post-Byzantine traditional models, and even on western themes, especially copied from engravings and reckoned in the eclectic and freer compositions, as if it was almost a collage. This procedure could be noted the Revelation's great cycle, which is one of their most loved and notably elaborated themes in which the inspiration from the western sources is clearly present.³⁶

Stylistically, the voluminous figures that we see in Konstandin and Athanas frescos, should be survival of the “neo-paleologist” style, as cultivated by Dionyses from Furna and David Selenica. Nevertheless, the form presentation is flat, and with shaded surface. The naturalist western tendency, theatrical positions and the abundant use of floral ornament replenish the impression that the art of Konstandin and

³³Popa, *Mbishkrime*, op. cit., pp. 176-177, nr. 354.

³⁴On the architecture of the prophet Shën Illia, see: Thomo, *Kishat pasbizantine*, op. cit., pp. 77-78.

³⁵The dedicating inscription of prothesis decorum is as follows: ΠΡΟΣΔΕΞΕ ΚΥΡΙΕ ΓΕΩΡΓΙΟΥ ΓΩ [...] ΑΙ ΘΕΟΔΩΡΟΥ ΑΡΣΕΝΙΟΥ ΙΕΡΟΜΟΙΝΑΧΟΥ; “Pranoje, o Zot, (lutjen e) Gjergjit Go [...]a, Theodorit, Arsen ieromonaku.”

³⁶Let's understand that the Revelation cycle in the katholiko exo-narthex of athon Ksiropotamu monastery (1783), work of Zografi brothers, is not only the most complete of Mount Athos, but also influenced in the Revelation presence in the athonite painting at the end of the XVIII century and in the beginning of the XIX century (see: Τσιμπούκης, *Η Αποκάλυψη του Ιωάννη*, op. cit., pp. 266-269, 351-363).

Athanas gives us. In other words, we already are within the painting's spirit of *rococo oriental*, often called *Turkish rococo* (or even baroque). This decorative style would deeply influence the Orthodox church painting, because it would incorporate many of her motives, and why not always in the same way and at the same level.³⁷ In any case, with this aesthetic mutation would gradually close the long period of the post-Byzantine art, just before the end of the XIX century. Consequently, the Zografi brothers from Korça represent not only the last phase of the ecclesiastical painting in Voskopoja, circa the middle of the XVIII century, but even entirely the beginning of the last phase of the post-Byzantine traditional painting.

CONCLUSIONS

The post-Byzantine painting shows that Voskopoja/Moschopolis is characterized by aesthetic change within the Balkan church art in a period of social and cultural transition, from the XVII century to the XVIII century. From this point of view, Voskopoja has a very diverse image of this special artistic expression.

As we mentioned above, the oldest frescos in Prodhrom monastery, as in the Shën Mëri and Shën Mëhill churches, illustrate the old and conservative aesthetic, viz the “Byzantine popular mannerism.” Especially the painting of Shën Mëri and Shën Mëhill represent a *fin de siècle*. Their frescos come as one of the latest demonstration of this style, that soon would belong to the past, being out of fashion. Ten years later, on 1726, in Shën Nikolla church even by the hand of David Selenica, we find a brilliant example of his paleologist “Rinascimento” style of “Manuel Panselino.” In the end, before the middle of this century, in Shën Thanas, but even in Shën Koll portico, the semi-

³⁷ On decorative and western tendency of the last phase of post-Byzantine painting, see: Χατζηδάκης, *Έλληνες ζωγράφοι*, op. cit., v. 1, pp. 108-113; Μ. Γαρίδης, *Διακοσμητική ζωγραφική. Βαλκάνια, Μικρασία 18ος-19ος αιώνες: Μπαρόκ και ροκοκό: Ανατολική και βυζαντινή κληρονομιά*, Αθήνα: Μέλισσα, 1996; Ν. Μερτζιμέκης – Ν. Σιώμκος, “Περί της ιστορίας του γρηγοριάτικου κελίου του Αγίου Τρύφωνα στις Καρυές Αγίου Όρους και του τοιχογραφικού του διακόσμου” (“On the History of St Tryphnon’s Cell of Gregorion Monastery at Karyes, Mount Athos, and its Wall Paintings”), *Δελτίον της Χριστιανικής Αρχαιολογικής Εταιρείας* 37 (2016), pp. 69-86.

westernized and semi- Byzantinized paintings of Konstandin and Athanas Zografi from Korça show the new taste of Voskopoja merchants in the period of Enlightenment beginnings.

However, this bourgeoisie virtuosity is generally reflected in the painters' selection that have participated in the ornament of city's churches. By no doubt, the lack of naivety open painting in Voskopoja is not casual.

It could be concluded that the post-Byzantine painting in Voskopoja/Moschopolis is not an isolated or local phenomenon, but could be understood only in the wide framework of the Balkan church painting of XVIII and, especially of the XVIII century. This does not turn down the fact that this southeastern Albanian city, a crossroad of languages' ethnicity within the Orthodox community under the Ottoman rule, is a very interesting *study case* even for the history of art. The evolution of the post-Byzantine painting in Voskopoja is of great interest for the specialists involved in the area, because it prepares us for big aesthetic changes in the characteristics of this art. At the same time, the Voskopoja church frescos offers an eloquent paradigm of "unity in diversity", which is an important feature of the Orthodox East pictorial arts.

PHOTOGRAPHIC MATERIAL



Fig.1: Prophet Elijah. 1659. Painter Nikolla (4) from Linotop (atrib.) Narthex of the church of Shën Joan Prodhrom monastery, Voskopoja (photo: Edlira Çaushti).



Fig. 2: Military saints. 1548. Painter Frango Katelano. Varlaam monastery, naos, Meteora (photo: I. Vitaliotis).



Fig. 3: The saints Trifon and Sevastiano. Painter Nikolla (4). 1653. Monastery of the Savior, Driovouno, Siatista (Greek Macedonia) (photo: I. Vitaliotis).



Fig. 4: Classicist motive with brairds, flowers, birds, masks and harps. 1659. Painter Nikolla (4) from Linotop (atrib.). Church nartex of Shën Joan Prodhrom monastery, Voskopoja (photo: Edlira Çaushti).



Fig. 5: Patriarch Noe and the scene from the Gospel. 1712. Painters Mihail Anagnosti and Theodhor, from Agrafa. Shën Mëri Cathedral, Voskopoja (photo: I. Vitaliotis).



Fig. 6: The Christ Emmanuel and angels. 1722. Painters Mihail Anagnosti and Theodhor, from Agrafa (atrib.). Shën Mëhill church, Voskopoja (photo: I. Vitaliotis).



Fig. 7: Shën Mëhill and Christ Anapeson. 1726. Painter David Selenica, aided from Konstandin and Kristo. Shën Nikolla church, Voskopoja (photo: I. Vitaliotis).



Fig. 8: Celestial liturgy, Communion of the Apostles and hierarchs in the (apse) bema. 1745. Painters the brothers Konstandin and Athanas Zografi, from Korça. The church of Shën Thanas, Voskopoja (photo: I. Vitaliotis).



Fig. 9: The scene from the Revelation of Joan cycle. 1750. Painters the brothers Konstandin and Athanas Zografi, from Korça. Southern portico. The church of Shën Nikolla, Voskopoja (photo: I. Vitaliotis).



Fig. 10: “The last Humbleness”. Bema, prothesis. Rr. 1751-1768. The church of Shën Illia, Voskopoja (photo: I. Vitaliotis).

Genciana ABAZI-EGRO

**AN ATTEMPT TO EVALUATE THE LITERARY HERITAGE:
ZEF JUBANI AND THE ALBANIAN LITERATURE OF THE
18TH CENTURY**

Abstract

In order to participate in the international debate on the issue of who are the Albanians, Zef Jubani published in 1871, *Raccolta di Canti Popolari e Rapsodie di Poemi Albanesi*. Being an Albanian of Albanian lands, unlike all who wrote about the Albanian issue and culture addressed to the European public, he had a great advantage: he knew well Albanian poets who had used different scripts in writing Albanian literature. So, in this work he offered a special approach. Through the literature Albanians have created for almost two centuries, he wanted "to judge the nature and the character of Albanian people and the changes that have taken place at different stages since last centuries to this day." In this context, he also provides a historical gallery of powerful Albanian. Through this gallery of famous people, he sought to help the spiritual and mental revival of Albanians, and to also raise the national pride and the establishing of national models. The literary past serves as a good motive for the present. A nation that has given birth to the powerful literary personalities, such as Pjetër Bogdani, Nezim Berati and Hysen Dobraçi, has the ability to realize this again.

In this anthology, Zef Jubani seeks to present a wider view of the Albanian literature. He has tried to build the path followed by Albanian poetry for more than a century and a half. The poems are accompanied by an evaluative analysis of the literary work of the poets themselves. Despite of being general considerations, these literary critiques mark the first attempt to understand these poets in the Albanian literary historiography, and to give them a position in the history of the Albanian literature.

Keywords: Albanian literature, literary heritage, Zef Jubani, literary anthology, Nezim Berati, bejtexhi

Introduction: Literary Heritage

In order to participate in the international debate of his time on the issue of who are the Albanians, Zef Jubani published in Trieste (Italy), in 1871, his monumental work *Raccolta di Canti Popolari e Rapsodie di Poemi Albanesi* [Collection of Popular Songs and Rhapsodies of Albanian Poems].¹ His origin from Albania provided him with a great advantage over the authors who wrote about the Albanian case and culture for the European opinion: he knew very well the Albanian poets who had used different scripts in writing Albanian. For that reason, he applied a special approach.

Through the literature created by Albanians for almost two centuries, he sought to “be judged on the nature and the character of the Albanian people, and on the changes that occurred in different historical periods since the past centuries up to today.”² In this context, he shaped a gallery of powerful Albanian people of mind. He represented this gallery of famous ancestors of Albanians in order to ensure the international recognition of the Albanian nation. On the other hand, through this approach, he asked to help the spiritual and mental revival of Albanians, and to also raise the national pride and the establishing of national models. To fulfill such an ambition, he wrote his book in Italian, while the poems he published in their original language, Albanian; to them he attaches the translation in Italian.

The second reason leading him to compile this anthology of Albanian poetry - first of its kind - is strictly related to the idea under discussion at that time on “the beginnings of a (Albanian) national literature.”³ In the Introductory part of his *Anthology*, Zef Jubani informs that in “the capital of the Ottoman Empire [Istanbul] a Literary Committee has been founded; it is entirely Albanian and it aims to

¹ *Raccolta di canti popolari e rapsodie di poemi albanesi tradotti nell'idioma italiano da Giuseppe Jubany*, Trieste: Tipografia del Lloyd Austriaco 1871, 116 pp. A selected translation in Albanian of Jubani's work is published by Jup Kastrati in 1966. See Zef Jubani (Ndokë Illia), *Vepra të zgjedhuna*, mbledhë dhe paraqitë nën kujdesin e Jup Kastratit. Tirana: Shtëpia Botonjëse “Naim Frashëri.”

² *Raccolta...* f. 3 [... si può giudicare dell'idole e del carattere del popolo Albanese, e della differenze sorvenuto nelle varie sue fasi dei secoli trascorsi sin oggi.] For this approach of Zef Jubani see also Rexhep Qosja, *Historia e Letërsisë Shqipe: Romantizmi I*, Tirana: Botimet Toena 2000, p. 125.

³ *Raccolta...*, p. 15.

establish the most appropriate bases for the promotion and making the Albanian national literature common.”⁴ Furthermore, the necessity of the “renaissance of the Albanian literature” has also been the subject of a discussion that Zef Jubani had with Dora D’Istria (Elena Gjika) at a meeting in Venice, as Dora D’Istria herself confirms to De Rada in the letter dated 27 March, 1867.⁵

According to Zef Jubani, the establishment of a common alphabet is a pre-condition for the progress of the Albanian national literature. The lack of a common alphabet, he considers as the main reason why Albanians didn’t have a satisfactory development of their literature. The Albanians only after establishing “... a system of letters that could fit all the sounds of their language, only then they will have their own literature with principles and rules appropriate to their character.”⁶ Applying into practice such an idea, Zef Jubani published the Albanian poems written with an alphabet created by himself. This alphabet was based on the Latin script and it is widely explained in the Introductory Section of this anthology. The main purpose of this alphabet was to provide a method to the reader “for a better spelling of the Albanian words,”⁷ without the responsibility to formalize this alphabet by being accepted by all Albanians. Zef Jubani’s alphabet did not succeed and was not followed by the others. However, his work was valuable as

⁴ *Raccolta...*, p. 19 [Già nella stessa capitale dell’Impero Ottomano, si è formato un comitato letterario puro Albanese, nell’intento di stabilire le basi piu acconcie per promuovere le basi piu acconcie per promuovere e rendere comune la nazionale letteratura ...].

⁵ This letter was first published by Ahmet Kondo. See: Ahmet Kondo, *Dora d’Istria për çështjen kombëtare shqiptare (Në letërkëmbimin e saj me Jeronim De Radën)*, Tirana: Shtëpia botuese “8 Nëntori” 1977, p. 67. In this edition the date of the letter is March 27, 1869. The Albanian scholar Jup Kastrati, referring to this publication, has given the same date for this letter. See Jup Kastrati, *Zef Jubani*, Tirana: Shtëpia botuese “8 Nëntori” 1987, p. 71. According to Merita Bruci, this letter was sent on March 27, 1867. See M. Sauku-Bruci, *Elena Ghika a Girolamo de Rada: lettere di una principessa*, Tirana: edizioni Bargjini 2004, p. 118.

⁶ *Raccolta...*, p. 19-20 [... costituendo un sistema di lettere, il quale possa assimilarsi alla sua lingua; in questo modo sarà posto in grado d’aversi la propria letteratura con principi e regole convenienti alla sua indole.].

⁷ *Raccolta...* p. 27.

“the principles set by Jubani served to the later compilers of the Albanian alphabets.”⁸

Zef Jubani bases the development of the national literature on two requirements: encouragement and cultivation. The continuous literary writing and the showing a progressive and strong interest are two aspects considered by Jubani as the main paths that Albanian literature will follow towards perfection, even though at that moment, the Albanian literature in his opinion was at “the stage of childhood” and was not internationally known.⁹ In this context, he also evaluates the publication of the literary heritage. According to Jubani, the literary past of the Albanians serves as a good motivating model for the present. Furthermore, a nation that has given birth to the powerful literary personalities, such as Pjetër Bogdani, Nezim Berati and Hysen Dobraçi, has the ability to realize this again.¹⁰

In this anthology, Zef Jubani seeks to present a wider view of the Albanian literature. Along with Albanian folk poems in this anthology he has also included poems of the Albanian poets: three poems taken from the book of Pjetër Bogdani named *Çeta e profetëve* (17th century); three poems of Hysen Dobraçi (18th century), while the poets Nezim Berati (18th century), Sali Pata (18th century) and Pjetër Zarishi (19th century) have been represented by one poem. At the end of the anthology he has included a poem of his own dedicated to Dora d'Istria, in order to represent “the new impulses” of the Albanian literature.¹¹

Through the publication of such a selection of Albanian poems, Jubani has tried to build the path followed by Albanian poetry for more than a century and a half. However, this was not enough for him. The poems are accompanied by an evaluative analysis of the literary work

⁸ Tomor Osmani, *Udha e shkronjave shqipe: historia e alfabetit*, Tiranë: Akademia e Shkencave 2008, p. 304.

⁹ *Raccolta...*, p. 12.

¹⁰ *Raccolta...*, p. 18-19.

¹¹ This poem was previously published in the anthology of ten poems dedicated to Dora D'Istria, written by ten Albanian personalities (two from the south area of Albania and two from the north, five from the Albanians settled in Italy, and one from the Albanians settled in Greece). This work was prepared by Demetrio Camarda with an Introductory part on Albanian writing history. See: *A Dora D'Istria gli Albanesi*, Livorno: G. Fabbreschi e Co. 1870, 126 pp.

of the poets themselves. Despite of being general considerations, these literary critiques mark the first attempt to understand these poets in the Albanian literary historiography, and to give them a position in the history of the Albanian literature. This effort is reflected also in the title given to his work.

Zef Jubani used the term *rapsodie* (*di Poemi Albanesi*) “rhapsodies (of Albanian poems)” for the selected poems differentiating them from the folk songs which he has defined by the term *raccolta* (*di Canti Popolari*) “collection (of popular songs).” In Italian the first meaning of the term *rapsodie* “rhapsody” is “epic songs, songs about knights”; but it also performs the meaning ‘selected parts and opinions of one or more authors, arranged in such a way as to form a whole.’ The usage of the term *rapsodie* Zef Jubani borrowed from the poet Jeronim De Rada who only five years ago had published a book named *Rapsodie d'un poema albanese...*¹² In this work, De Rada tried to construct an epic poem of Scanderbeg, the national hero of Albanians, based on the folk poems of the Albanians settled in Italy, after they fled Albanian territories in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. These folk poems are evaluated by De Rada as survived fragments of this epic poem of Scanderbeg. However, Zef Jubani has used the term *rapsodie* to establish a link between the Albanian Literature and the authors included in his anthology; while, De Rada used it to refer to a hypothetical Albanian epic poem. Such a fact is proved even by the Jubani’s usage of term *poems* in plural (*di poemi Albanesi*), while De Rada used it in singular form (*d'un poema albanese*).¹³

In order to remain within the framework of history, the author arranged the poems in a chronological order. The chronology has

¹² *Rapsodie d'un poema albanese raccolte nelle colonie del napoletano*, tradotte Da Girolamo De Rada e per cura di Lui e di N.J. De Coronei ordinate e messe in Luce, Firenze: Tipografia di Federigo Bencini 1866, 106 pp.

¹³ The anthological part of this book published by Zef Jubani, especially the poets of the 18th century, have not been a subject of research in the Albanian literary historiography. Based on a superficial finding, such as the term *rhapsodies* used in the works of De Rada and Jubani, it is noted only the influence that De Rada has had on the naming of the Jubani’s work. Rexhep Qosja even goes further by talking about the same concept that De Rada and Jubani have for the folk poems. See: Z. Jubani (Ndokë Illia), *Vepra të zgjedhura...*, p. 30; R. Qosja, *Historia e Letërsisë Shqipe: Romantizmi I ...*, p. 125.

determined the positioning of poems in this anthology, regardless of whether they were folk poems or poems written by a poet. This integrated literary edition should be explained with the fact that in the second half of the 19th century the literary heritage of Albanians was perceived as a whole (folk poems and art/literary poems); it also underlines the importance that folk literature had gained in the process of building national identity. On the other hand, the publication of literary poems together with folk literature will become a tradition in the following anthological texts of Albanian literature.¹⁴ Even in the *History of Albanian Literature* (1958), a special chapter of its own was dedicated to the folk literature, conceived as an introductory section.

The Poets of the 18th century

From the 18th century Albanian literature, Zef Jubani selected the poets Nezim Berati, Hysen Dobraqi and Sali Pata for his anthology. In fact, Nezim Berati and Hysen Dobraqi have been mentioned in literature even before this publication. The French consul in Shkodra, Hyacinthe Hecquard, in his book on Northern Albania, from the literary past of Albanians has singled out the poet Molla Hyseni from the Dobraqi, a village near to Shkodra city. He has published and translated in French three of his poems.¹⁵ These were Albanian poems that Zef Jubani himself had given to Hecquard at the time when he was the French consul in Shkodra. The same poems given to Hecquard, he also

¹⁴ The well-known collector of folk literature Thimi Mitko in his monumental work *Bëleta shqiptare*, besides the folk literature has also published literary/art poems. In later editions of this book during the 20th century, these poems are excluded. For a list of texts left out in the reprint publications see Gjergj Pekmezi "Shpjegim," in Thimi Mitko, *Bleta shqypëtare*, Wien 1924, p. 8-9. See also Thimi Mitko, *Bleta shqypëtare*, e përkthyer, përkthyer e radhiti Gjergj Pekmezi, Wien 1924; Thimi Mitko, *Bëleta shqypëtare*, në Mbledhës të hershëm të folklorit shqiptar II, Instituti i Folklorit, Tiranë 1961.

This tendency is also noticed in Sami Frashëri's unpublished work *Mbledhje këngëve shqip të vjetëra dhe të ra*. The selected poems from the literary work of Nezim Berati are published beside to 12 folk poems. Unlike Jubani, he has conceived the work in two parts, clearly differentiating the literary poems from the folk poems. See Sami Frashëri, *Mbledhje këngëve shqip të vjetëra dhe të ra*, Stamboll 1882. Arkivi Qendror i Shtetit, fondi i S. Frashërit, dosja nr. 1.

¹⁵ H. Hecquard, *Histoire et description de la haute Albanie ou Guégarie*, Paris: A. Bertrand [1858], p. 490, 496, 511-512.

selected for his anthology. Zef Jubani saw an obligation to the reader¹⁶ to publish these poems in Albanian original text.

Regarding Nezim Berati, this poet was known for the European opinion thanks to Georg von Hahn. In his classical book *Albanesische Studien*, H. von Hahn published 8 poems (132 verses) written by Nezim Berati, accompanied with general considerations about his literary work and some biographical remarks.¹⁷ Although with more inaccuracies¹⁸ this edition served as a reference source for later publications on Albanian literature until the first half of the 20th century. From *Albanesische Studien*, Zef Jubani took the same poem that Demetrio Camarda has also selected for his book.¹⁹

As Zef Jubani explains in the introduction, he selected Nezim Berati, Hysen Dobraqi and Sali Pata, because they are well-known poets among Albanians, but also because they all have established a special relationship with the reader. For the first two poets he says that they claim to have written poems about love, named by him *ashikrie* in Albanian or *anacreontic* in Italian. Writing about love and wine seems to be the connection between these two Albanian poets and Anacreon of Ancient Greece. This comparison was influenced by Camarda, who compared Nezim Berati with the Greek poet Anacreon.²⁰ Zef Jubani has gone much further; he made Nezim Berati part of the literary

¹⁶ *Raccolta...*, p. 4.

¹⁷ Heft 2, Jena: Fr. Mauke, 1853, p. 142-146.

¹⁸ The first problem that Hahn's publication presents is directly related to the authenticity of the verses published under the name of Nezim Berati. Of the eight published poems, only one of them (no. 8) is partly written by Nezim Berati. This poem (244 verses) is found in the *Albanian Diwan*. Hahn has published a shortened version of it (48 verses), out of these 16 verses are by Nezim Berati, while the rest belong to another unidentified author. As for the other seven poems published by Hahn under the name of Nezim Berati, they are part of the urban song collection of Elbasan. (See: AQSH, fondi Lef Nosi, dosja *Dokumente të grumbulluara*). For the inaccuracies of the Hahn's publication see also E. Rossi, "Notizia su un manoscritto del canzoniere di Nezim (secolo XVII-XVIII) in caratteri arabi e lingua albanese", *Rivista degli Studi Orientali*, volume XXI, fasc. II-III-IV 1946, p. 220; O. Myderrizi, "Nezim Frakulla", *Buletin për Shkencat Shoqërore*, 1954, no. 4, p. 56 and 58.

¹⁹ D. Camarda, *Appendice al saggio di grammatologia comparata*, Prato: Tipografia F. Alberghetti 1866, p. 46.

²⁰ D. Camarda, *Saggio di grammatologia comparata sulla lingua albanese e appendice, [parte 2] ... p. XV.*

heritage of Albanians, and together with Hysen Dobraqi, he considered them part of the Albanian pride. Related to the love poems of Nezim Berati and Hysen Dobraqi, he offers another detail: their poems are sung during celebrations or important events because Nezim Berati "colors his poems with full enthusiasm, so very quickly they become songs."²¹ Even, Zef Jubani feels the need to also give this explanation: "there is nothing vulgar about his free and concise style [of Nezim Berati]; he was erudite enough to give the right metrics to his rhymes."²²

Regarding the poet Sali Pata, Zef Jubani introduces him as the author of satirical poems "adorned with subtle jokes and satire" and considers him as "strong critic and at the same time humorous; in his satires he did not even spare powerful personalities, who nevertheless approached him cordially, as they felt nothing but pleasure."²³ Zef Jubani informs the readers that from the abundant literary work of Sali Pata he only selected a few verses "simple to show his talent and sharp humor".²⁴ Zef Jubani resembles the poet Sali Pata with the Italian satirical poet of the 17th century Giovanni Battista Casti, best known for his political satire poems. Comparing Nezim Berat and Hysen Dobraqi with Anacreon, and Sali Pata with Giovanni Battista Casti, Zef Jubani seeks to make these poets more understandable to the European reader, but also to show them the way of how to read and perceive them. In turn, this paves the way for the explanation of Albanian literature in accordance with the models of European literature, seeking for the cultural integration of Albanians into the literary circumference of European culture.

Zef Jubani arranged his anthology lining up the poets one after the other. The first poet is Hysen Dobraqi with two love poems (*Anacreontic* poems as Jubani calls them); the first poem is provided with explanatory title *Kanga e Molla Yssen Dobraqit, bejtaxhi*

²¹ *Raccolta...*, p. 116 [... e le colorisce con tutto l'entusiasmo di cui trovavasi rapito nel cantarle].

²² *Raccolta...*, p. 116 [Nulla ha di volgare lo stile suo libero e conciso; gli era molto erudito per dare il giusto metro alle sue rime].

²³ *Raccolta...* p. 22 [... poesie adorne di motti arguti e satirici. Critico inflessibile, e lepido nello stesso tempo, non risparmiava i piu possenti personaggi nelle sue satire, i quali pur l'avvicinavano con affezione, perche ne provavano godimento].

²⁴ *Raccolta...*, p. 116.

Shkodran [The song of Molla Hysen Dobraçi, Shkodra's versifier] (48 verses), and the second *Edhe një kang tjetër e Molla Yssenit* [Another song of Molla Hysen Dobraçi] (28 verses). The following is Nezim Berati with the poem entitled *Kang ashikriet, prej Neçim begut, bamun bejt* [Love song of Nezim Berati, transformed to rhymed verses] (32 verses). The last ranked is Sali Pata with the *Bejta gazit e Molla Sali Pats, Bejtaxhi Shkodran* [Satirical verses of Molla Sali Pata, Shkodra's versifier] (38 verses).²⁵

In addition to the two poems of Molla Hysen (Dobraçi), this poet is also mentioned as the author of the folk poem *Kur Mahmud Pasha ka shkue mi Kurd Pashën e Beratit, në mot 1795* [When Mahmud Pasha fought against Kurd Pasha of Berat, in 1795].²⁶ Although the title does not mention the author, the text of the poem clearly notices that it was created by Molla Hysen (Dobraçi), in the position of the chronicler of Mahmud Pasha; he not only recorded the events, but he also wrote panegyric poems praising the ruler for his deeds. During the edition of this poem, Zef Jubani has simply described the poet as Molla Hyseni, without giving the surname Dobraçi and in the notes at the end of the book he explains: "the famous Albanian poet of Shkodra."²⁷ Even the Hecquard thinks that Molla Hysen (Dobraçi) is the author of this historical poem.²⁸ The French consul translates it into French, together with two love poems written by the same author. The writer of this poem is probably the same, Molla Hysen Dobraçi.

It should be noted that except for Molla Hysen Dobraçi, two other poets are mentioned in the literature, named Hysen, who lived in the city of Shkodra, at around the same time (18th century): Hysen Shkodrani and Hysen Efendi Shkodra. Hysen Shkodrani is mentioned by the famous Turkish bibliophile Ali Emiri in a biographical anthology on the poets of Shkodra during the Ottoman period. According to Ali Emiri, the poet known as Molla Hyseni, due to his

²⁵ These verses are republished in the *Dielli* newspaper of Boston, on September 10th 1909. See: Dh. S. Shuteriqi, *Tekstet shqipe dhe shkrimi i shqipes në vitet 879-1800*, Akademia e Shkencave e Shqipërisë, Tiranë, 2005, p. 351.

²⁶ The sixth song (40 verses), p. 72.

²⁷ *Raccolta...*, p. 114.

²⁸ H. Hecquard, *Histoire et description de la haute Albanie...*, p. 490, 496, 511-512.

main engagement as a teacher, died on Hijri 1150 (1737-38).²⁹ We find poems of this poet registered even in a manuscript in the possession of Namik Ressuli, made public by Ettore Rossi. In this manuscript along with the poems written by Nezim Berati, in the margin are noted even some love poems of Hysen Shkodrani, but unfortunately Ettore Rossi has not transcribed them.³⁰ While Hysen Efendi Shkodra, is the author of two Albanian religious poems (*ilahi*) registered in the manuscript of *Ervehe* (National Library, Tirana), made public by Osman Myderrizi.³¹ The Albanian scholar Myderrizi thinks that the section of the manuscript, where Hysen Efendi Shkodra's poems are registered, are copied in 1830 from the first degree cousin of Muhamet Çami, Sulejman Ymer Kyçyku. In this situation, further archival researches are needed as a necessity to shed light on the final identification of the above-mentioned poets, to recognize their literary contribution, to understand the literary developments in Shkodra and finally, to identify the position of this city in the progress of the Albanian literature of the 18th century.

On terms *bejte* (rhymed verses) and *bejtexhi* (versifier)

Zef Jubani introduces the poets Hysen Dobraçi and Sali Pata with the term *bejtaxhi shkodran* (Shkodra's versifier). He does not use this term for Nezim Berati; meanwhile in the explanatory title of the poems he notices *poezi e bamun bejt* (poems transformed to rhymed verses). Besides, he points out that Nezim Berati is a well-known poet and he is read in a wider geography, in Middle Albania. Such a classification of poets according to the type of the literature they wrote and to the geographical area of reading, sheds light on the literary processes of the time, especially on the *bejtexhi* (versifiers) literature. The term *bejtexhi* is also faced in the form *bejtar* and *bejtareshë* in books and dictionaries

²⁹H. T. Karateke, *İşkodra Şairleri ve Ali Emiri'nin Diğer Eserleri*, Enderun Kitabevi, Istanbul, 1995, p. 121.

³⁰E. Rossi, "Notizia su un manoscritto del canzoniere di Nezim (secolo XVII-XVIII) in caratteri arabi e lingua albanese", *Rivista degli Studi Orientali*, v. XXI, fasc. II-III-IV, 1946, p. 223, 245.

³¹O. Myderrizi, "Erveheja dhe Muhamet Çami," *Buletin i Institutit të Shkencave*, 1951, nr. 1, 74.

published in the second half of the 19th century.³² In spite of that, Zef Jubani for the first time associated it with the concrete names of poets who wrote rhymed verses. Besides, the explanatory notes the author prepared for his edition of poems and the Italian translation of the poems help us to understand what the terms *bejte* and *bejtexhi* meant in the middle of the 19th century, especially in the region of Shkodra.

In the poems edited by Jubani, *bejte* are easily rhyming verses; the poet Sali Pata says *bejta i qes me gisht/ posi kali pa pusate* [I write my verses as easily as when an unloaded horse runs freely],³³ or *na i thanë Molla Ysennit: ... do t na bajsh nji Bejt* [They told Molla Hysen write us a verse].³⁴ These easily written rhyming verses can be written on different topics: so there may be rhyming verses about love (*kang ashikrijet*); rhyming verses on a historical event, such as the conflict between Mahmud Pasha Bushatlli and Kurt Pasha of Berat, in 1795; but satirical verses can also be composed such as the *bejte* of Sali Pata. Meanwhile, the term *bejte* was translated into Italian as *canzone* (song) by Zef Jubani, and very rarely *poesia* (poem). This fact leads me to think that these rhyming verses are accompanied by melodies.

The difference that exists between *bejte* and poetry in its classical sense is demonstrated also in the expression *poezi e bamun bejt* (poems transformed by rhymed verses), used by Jubani in order to explain the edition of Nezim Berati's poem. *Bejte* here is directly related to a practice of writing poetry itself and to the stages of transformation of it during the circulation. In the beginning we have the poem written by the poet which is liked by the readers and in a second stage it becomes a song, i.e. it is transformed into *bejte*. This kind of artistic use is affirmed even by the explanatory note of Zef Jubani saying that Nezim Berati "colors the poems with full enthusiasm, from which they quickly become songs."³⁵ This reality is also confirmed by the fact that Nezim

³²G. Abazi-Egro, "Nga dorëshkrimet në botimet kritike: mbi procesin e njohjes së letërsisë së bejtexhinjve", SF, 2010/3-4, p. 182-3.

³³*Raccolta...*, p. 102.

³⁴*Raccolta...*, p. 72.

³⁵*Raccolta...*, p. 116.

Berati's poems have been passed into the fund of urban songs, sung even today in the city of Berat.³⁶

The connection between the *bejte* and urban songs is also clarified by Jubani himself, when he says: "there are folk songs written by well-educated poets, having an elegant concept; and they are adorned with ornaments, thanks to very rich fantasy of the poet; their declamation reaches ecstasy."³⁷ At this stage of Albanian language we face a semantic development of the word *bejte*, also confirmed by other sources, and it is not only limited to the city of Shkodra.³⁸ On the other hand, this linguistic development paved the way for the creation of the term *bejtexhi*,³⁹ i.e. the poet who composed rhyming verses.

The *bejtexhi* (versifier) in the 19th century has been a profession. This is confirmed by Sali Pata himself: "zanat tjetër un nuk di/ veç por bejta di me qitë [I don't know how to do any other job. I only know how write verses]." Meanwhile, Hysen Dobraçi also appears in the position of a chronicler at the court of Mahmud Pasha Bushatlli. Therefore, *bejtexhi* has denominated a category of poets finding themselves in between classical literary poets and folk poets. Zef Jubani has the merit of being the first that has published such a literature, which later has been facing the total exclusion from the history of literature.

³⁶ For the urban songs of Berat and their history see A. Mehqemeja, *Këngët e Beratit*, Berat, 2004.

³⁷ *Raccolta...*, p. 22 [I canti popolari composti da' poeti eruditi hanno il concetto piu forbito; e sono adorni di fioriture, delle quali è ricca la fantasia del poeta, che nella declamazione giunge all'estasi].

³⁸ A. Dozon, *Manuel de la langue chkiye ou albanaise*, Ernest Leroux, Paris, 1879, p. 85, 93 and 95; *Fjaluar i voghel scyp e ltnisct*, mledhun prej P. Jak Junkut, Sckoder, 1895, p. 7; K. Kamsi, *Fjalor arbërisht-shqip*, Universiteti i Shkodrës "Luigj Gurakuqi", Shkodër, 2000, p. 29.

³⁹ This term is created in Albanian language, by the unity of two forms borrowed by the Turkish language: the noun *bejte* (< Turk. Beyt) and the suffix *-xhi* (< Turk. -ci). The word *bejtexhi* (versifier) does not exist in Turkish, it is only part of the Albanian language. In Turkish the poet that composes his poem on the bases of *beyt* (in Turkish means distich/couplet) is called *divan şairi* (poet of Divan); while the poet that simply has the ability to improvise verses, mostly satirical ones, simply for the rime effect, is called *manzumeci* (versifier). The closest corresponding word in Albanian for *bejtexhi* is *rimues* (rhymers).

Bibliography

A Dora D'Istria gli Albanesi, Canti pubblicati per cura di D. C. [Demetrio Camarda], G. Fabbreschi e Co., Livorno, 1870.

Abazi-Egro, G., “Nga dorëshkrimet në botimet kritike: mbi procesin e njohjes së Letërsisë së Bejtexhinjve”, SF, 2010/3-4, p. 169-184.

Camarda, D., *Saggio di grammatologia comparata sulla lingua albanese e appendice, [parte 2] Appendice al saggio di grammatologia comparata*, Tipografia F. Alberghetti, Prato, 1866.

Dozon, A., *Manuel de la langue chkipe ou albanaise*, Ernest Leroux, Paris, 1879.

Fjaluur i voghel sccyp e ltnisct, mledhun prej P. Jak Junkut, Sckoder, 1895.

Hahn, G. von, *Albanesische Studien* 2, Fr. Mauke, Jena, 1853.

Hecquard, H., *Histoire et description de la haute Albanie ou Guégarie*, Paris, A. Bertrand [1858].

Jubani, Z. (Ndokë Illia), *Vepra të zgjedhuna*, mbledhë dhe paraqitë nën kujdesin e Jup Kastratit, Shtëpia Botonjëse “Naim Frashëri,” Tiranë, 1966.

Kamsi, K., *Fjalor arbërisht-shqip*, Universiteti i Shkodrës “Luigj Gurakuqi”, Shkodër, 2000.

Karateke, H. T., *İşkodra Şairleri ve Ali Emirî'nin Diğer Eserleri*, Enderun Kitabevi, Istanbul, 1995.

Kastrati, J., *Zef Jubani*, Shtëpia botuese “8 Nëntori,” Tiranë, 1987.

Kondo, A., *Dora d'Istria përçështjen kombëtare shqiptare (Në letërkëmbimin e saj me Jeronim De Radën)*, Shtëpia botuese “8 Nëntori,” Tiranë, 1977.

Mehqemeja, A., *Këngët e Beratit*, Berat, 2004.

Myderrizi, O., “Erveheja dhe Muhamet Çami”, *Buletin i Institutit të Shkencave*, 1951, nr. 1, p. 72-81.

Myderrizi, O., “Nezim Frakulla”, *Buletini për Shkencat Shoqërore*, 1954, nr. 4, p. 56-75.

Osmani, T., *Udha e shkronjave shqipe: historia e alfabetit*, Akademia e Shkencave, Tiranë, 2008.

Qosja, R., *Historia e Letërsisë Shqipe: Romantizmi I*, Botimet Toena, Tiranë, 2000.

Raccolta di canti popolari e rapsodie di poemi albanesi tradotti nell'idioma italiano da Giuseppe Jubany albanese, Tipografia del Lloyd Austriaco, Trieste, 1871.

Rapsodie d'un poema albanese raccolte nelle colonie del napoletano, tradotte Da Girolamo De Rada e per cura di Lui e di N.J. De Coronei ordinate e messe in Luce, Firenze: Tipografia di Federigo Bencini 1866.

Rossi, E., "Notizia su un manoscritto del canzoniere di Nezim (secolo XVII-XVIII) in caratteri arabi e lingua albanese", *Rivista degli Studi Orientali*, volume XXI, fasc. II-III-IV, 1946, 219-246.

Sauku-Bruci, M., *Elena Ghika a Girolamo de Rada: lettere di una principessa*, Edizioni Bargjini, Tiranë, 2004.

Shuteriqi, Dh., *Tekstet shqipe dhe shkrimi i shqipes në vitet 879-1800*, Akademia e Shkencave e Shqipërisë, Tiranë, 2005.

Shaban SINANI

**NAIM AND RUMI, IN THE CONTEXT OF THE PERSIAN-
IRANIAN CULTURE PRESENCE ON THE ALBANIAN
TRADITION**

I. Naim Frashëri in two literatures and in their two literary histories

Although during the XX century and after that, the history of the Albanian literature has been written and re-written many times, from national and foreign scholars, from individuals and institutions, but the evaluation for Naim Frashëri remains unchanged. He has been described as the *national poet*, *Dichter missionary*, the *prophet-poet*, with a Messianic role on establishing the identity foundation of the Albanian language. *There are no others like Naim*, has written Andon Zako Çajupi, this distinguished contemporary poet of Naim on the day of his death, and this opinion has remained unchanged. *101 poets for Naim* is the title of one of the anthologies in chosen poems dedicated to him along a century. On his name the scholars connect the first feature of the Prometheus' phenomenon in the national literature history. (Qosja 1988: 396). He has been considered a *classic* and *master* (Geraci 2014: 40; Agolli: 1980), also a grandfather of the Albanian *language* and *literature*. He has strongly united the thinkers that have sacrificed the life of their idea with the Western myth (Maloki 1937) and those that on the contrary, have trusted on the famous phrase of the European humanism: *Ex Orientae lux* - Light that comes for the East. Mihal Grameno, warrior and the last poet of the Albanian Renaissance, called Naim the heart of Albania, while Frashër, Naim's birthplace, compared to *Mecca and Bethlehem*: *Si ty, o Vithlehem e Mek' e Arabisë / Ku janë lindur Muhamet e Krishti i Krishterisë / Për mua është Frashëri, vënd i Perëndisë / Tek është lindur Naim Beu zemr' e*

*Shqipërisë*¹. Meanwhile Father Gjergj Fishta, poet and thinker, the most important figure of the Catholic clergy in the first half of the XX century, the last of the Albanian romanticism writers, in his masterpiece *Lahuta e Malcís* (*The highland lute*) has written: *Bini toskë, ju n'pikë të vrapit / Mos t'u ndalin mal as zall / Naim Frashëri i rà Qitapit / Mos m'e lshue Shqypnin per t'gjall*² (Fishta 1937: 468-473).

Although descendant of known versifiers and Bektashi religious as Dalip and Shahin Frashëri: the first author of the suited poem from *Hadika* of Fuzuli, that he entitled in Albanian *Kopshti i të mirëve* (*the garden of the goods*), dedicated to the epopee of Karbala; while the second author of the second heroic poem *Mühtarname* (*Mühtar's glory poem*), its kinship relations with them almost was never been mentioned. Moreover, nevertheless that Naim himself wrote a poem for Karbala, following the previous Frashër's path, the histories of the Albanian literature insistently have created an ideological and literary opposition among them.

In 1971, when nearly after a century, was published in Albanian the book of fantasies (*libri i fantazive*) of Naim, by original title *Tehajjulat*, written and published in Persian in 1885, on a re-creative adaptation and with a rare elegance from the Iran and Orientalist scholar, Vexhi Buharaja, entitled *Ëndërrime* (*Dreaming*), for the first time, the estimation of an old-time affirmation was re-established: *He is not the European who walks this world - in the Orient - as an outsider and for whom this has the magic of exotic country. He is kindred with this world; he lives in it, it's hers* (Çabej: 1944). Even because written in another language and published in Albanian as translations, the *Masnavi* of *Ëndërrime* volume was considered from the Albanian scholars the *sleeping beauty*. In the Iranian literature history, Naim Frashëri has appeared later. The first who mentioned his work in Persian was the native scholar Abdül-Karim Gölshani, who in 1975, published in a magazine in Shiraz the article *Rreth letërsisë perse shkruar në hapësirat turke dhe poezisë perse të autorit shqiptar të shekullit XIX*

¹ Si ti, o Betlehem, o Mekë e Arabisë
Ku janë lindur Muhamet' e Krisht i krishterisë
Për mua është Frashëri - vend i Perëndisë
Tek është lindur Naim beu, zemër e Shqipërisë.

² Bini toskë, ju n'pikë të vrapit,
Mos t'ju ndalë as mal, as zall,
Naim Frashëri shkroi në qitap,
Mos me e lëshue Shqipninë për t'gjallë.

Naim Frashëri (On the Persian literature in the Turkish areas and the Persian poems of the XIX century Albanian Naim Frashëri).- *Farhang-i Iran dar qalamraw-i Turkan: ash'ar-i Farsi-i Na'im Farashari, sha'ir va nivisandah-i qarn-i nuzdahum Albani* (Gölshani 1975). Up two decades ago, his fantasies in Persian, his forehanded book *Tehajjülat*, on the Iranian literature history was bespoken only in a paragraph, on which is presented as a Bektashi poet of Albanian origin, that wrote in *masnavi*, on *Moulana style* (Golshani: 2004). The merit of revealing the Naim's place in the Persian literary history belongs to the scholars Ali Akbar Zija and Reza Kharami, that for some years chaired the Cultural Foundation *Saadi Shirazi* in Tirana and made direct searches not only for Naim's versification on Iranian language, but also for the inter-texting of many philosophic poems of the national poet of Albanians with the Pir-Rumi work (Zijai 1997; Kharami 2008). On the monograph book known in Iran as "*Vendi i shqiponjave (The country of eagles)*" (Zijai 2003), the researches were finalized in a comparative synthesis, that paved the way to consider Naim Frashëri a poet with contribution on both literatures and two literature histories. These researches encouraged the Albanian savants and scholars of Albanian literature and language, to find worthy explanations scientifically provable on the intertwinement of the poetic codes of Eastern and Western versification in Naim's work, in which are peacefully and easily melted the Eastern mysticism with the Western enlightenment (Bulo, 1999). These studies have appropriately clarified that the Naim Frashëri's poems have been conditioned by the Rumi poems on: i) the versification models; ii) the types of typology; iii) poetic codes; iv) the pantheist world-outlook and in the life's philosophy; v) theosophy and mysticism; and vi) thematic plane and on the motives one.

Naim Frashëri, not only in *Ëndërrime*, but even when he writes in Albanian, especially in philosophic lyric, in didactic lyric, on nature and love's lyric, prefers *masnavi* and often re-creates according the poetic and metric specimen of Pir that follows, Moulana; sometimes the Khayyam's *Katrena* (*four syllable verses*) and not rarely on Hafez jokes.

II. The return of other Naim

We have chosen to use the term *return* to proclaim the part of Naim silent work, of the *other Naim*, the *eastern Naim*, firstly Persian, because putting the data on an affirmed chronology, results that the phenomenon has been known since the first half of the XX century. Hafiz Ali Korça, a well-known poet and erudite of the Persian culture, who dissatisfied from the freedoms that Fan Noli has granted to himself, published an alternative translation of the Omar Khayyam *katrenas*', and was the first who wrote even for the concordances on fables, in motive and in spirit between Naim's *Fyell* (*flute*) and *Ney-name* of Rir Rumi. Hafez made known at that time that Naim wrote in Persian also another lyric-epic religious poem, that besides *Karbala*, entitled the *Vajtimet e Imam Hüssein* (*The laments of Imam Hüssein*), that remains undiscovered until today. Circumlocutioning the title of the Naim's poem, he himself wrote *Vajtimet e atdheut* (*Motherland's laments*). However, the study of this phenomenon was then stopped because of: **i)** the continuous critical stand towards the Albanian literature heritage with oriental alphabets (Persian, Old Turkish and Arabian language), known as *the literature of the versifiers*; **ii)** the historic and cultural demonization of the former Ottoman empire and generally of the characteristics that might have connections with it; **iii)** the state atheism that existed in Albania until 1990. This has been the reason why the existence of a Persian grammar in Naim Frashëri's manuscript and of dramas that his brother Sami has written, based on Firdausi's' *Shah-Name* motives, *Gjahve e Suhrab*, has been known in the last three decades. One of them is still unpublished.

To these general causes should be added even a special reason. Musine Kokalari who, made the first research and discoveries about the connection of Naim's poetry with the Moulana poetic work and thinking from 1930 to 1940, was condemned as political opponent in 1946 and her study was prevented from publishing. Her theses, the first dedicated to Naim's poetry is still unpublished and is preserved as manuscript at the National State Archive and at the National Library, and the literary archive of *La Sapienza* University of Rome.

It was exactly Musine Kokalari who e century earlier, while was concluding the graduate studies in literature in Rome, chooses the work

of Naim and observed in details the similarity between Naim's poetry and Pir-Rumi poetry. Expert of *masnavi* (*mesnevitë*) of the master of the Persian classical literature through the Italian translation (Pizzi 1894: 269-278), in her diploma theses dedicated to Naim Frashëri when she graduated in Rome on 1943, she would write: My greatest surprise was when I noticed that many verses of Naim result identical with those of the Persian poet Jalaluddin Rumi (Jalal ad-Din Muhammad Rumi). In the book *Storia della poesia persiana* of Italo Pizzi, she had the possibility to read overall 11 poems of Moulana: five from *Spiritual Cobla* (*La Cobla spirituale*) and six from the *Singing* (*Il Canzoniere*). To Musine Kokalari immediately attracted her attention the known poem *Nej*: - *Ascolta flauto che parla e piange* (Pizzi 1894: 269) and - *Il mercante e il pappagallo, ovvero della necessità di liberarsi dal carcere della vita* (Pizzi 1894: 271-273).

For Musine Kokalari was enough the Italian translation of a selection poems collection of *Pir* from the classic Persian literature to come to the conclusion that:

1. The two known Naim poems, *Fyelli* (from the volume *Lulet e verës*) and *Turtullesha* (from the *Paradise cycle*), are parallels, if not re-creations from Rumi's poem *Nej*, published in Italian under the title *La Cobla spirituale*. The first poem has been compared with the introducing part of *Cobla spirituale*. On the same poem, Musine Kokalari finds another reference, observing similarities with some of the verses from the fable *Tregtari dhe papagalli apo nevoja për të çliruar veten nga burgu i jetës* (*The merchant and the parrot or the need to free oneself from the prison of life*). On the second poem, *Turtullesha*, M. Kokalari approaches it with another Rumi's *masnavi*, entitled *Tri këshillat e zogut* (*The bird's three advices*) - *I tre consigli dell'augellino* (Pizzi 1894: 273).

2. Deepening the comparisons with the Persian classical literature, the graduated scholar Musine Kokalari, nonetheless the inter-text theory would show nearly half a century later, proves through the parallel reading that the poem *Ujë e bekuar* (*the holy water*) of Naim is a re-creation from *katrena* by the same title of Omar Khayyam, a *Ruba'iyat* (*rubā'iyāt*) dedicated to the spiritual inebriation with deep thought. As on the Khayyam *katrena*, Naim's poetry is written on quadrisyllabic verses, with AAAB rime: *Shkel-e-shko zëmëra ime /*

Mos bjerë në hidhërimë / E në breng'e në mejtime / Mos të gënjenjë kjo jetë (Ujët e bekuarë, vv. 45-48).

On the book *La mia vita universitaria*, memories and diary preserved in the Italian archives and published two years ago in Rome (Ceglie-Geraci, 2016), has many data about the personal recognition of Musine Kokalari with representatives of the latest generation of the Albanian Renaissance. *I am a pupil of Sami Frashëri*, she writes in her diary. The publication in Albanian and in Iranian languages of her book about Naim Frashëri and his poetic, aesthetic, world-outlook, mystical and philosophic connections with Moulana, that can be realized under the attention and benevolence of *Saadi Shirazi Cultural Foundation* and its director Prof. Hussein Alast, would enrich our libraries with this earlier work dedicated to this problem.

III. Naim, Moulana and other Persian lyrical poets

On the last three decades, after the undo of some prohibitive ideological and religious limits, the meeting points between Naim's literature with that of Rumi, the scholars found clear parallels between the two poets not only on the thematic plane and the text degree, but also on prosody, in the lyric's typology, on versification models, on poetic code, on the mystical inspiration and in the philosophic mentality (Zijai: 1998; Bulo: 1999). Already through the critic content method, the hypothetical thought of Musine Kokalari that the *Nej* poem of Rumi and the *Fyelli* poem of Naim come from a common source; also the poem *Zogu dhe djali (the bird and the boy)* and *I tre consigli di augellino*, are tested by authentic literary means (Bulo 1999). The recognition of the text poetic connection of Naim's poem *Fyelli* with the *Nejname* of Rumi encouraged other authentic studies on the field of Iranian studies on the *masnavi* history (Hamiti-Agagjyshi 2014: 61-81).

In spirit and inspiration, Naim's poetry as that of Rumi, is percolated from *fana* (pers. فنا, death), a thought category that in the classical Iranian literature marked the sublimation of self-sacrifice (from Greek: *evlogia*, *εὐλογία*, (blessing), the consecration of *philosophic assimilation on behalf of the spiritual exaltation* (Zijai 1998: 69-77) or of the noble kindness (Ressuli 1955), to detach from the temporary terrestrial through the invigoration of the idea for coming closer the

Creator (Pagliano-Bausani: 1968; Zijai: 1999). In the today western point-of-view, this way of understanding the world is sometimes determined as Messianism, other as Prometheanism, and as phenomenon is identified even on the religious epos on Karbala (Guidetti 2015: 83-104).

The natural subdue of the Persian classical mysticism with European enlightenment on Naim Franshëri's poetry, that is seen through self-sacrifice to come closer the divine form from one side and from the other to enlighten the progress of the people, as Danko in the novel *Plaka Izegril* (*Смартуха Изегриль*) of Maxim Gorky, the other scholars found it even through the comparison of the *Fjalëve të qiririt* (*candle words*) with the jokes of Hafez (Hafizi: 2004). These are two difficult approachable characteristics: first, with sublime character and the second, critical towards the sacred ideas, on Naim these are joined in a very original way. As Nej is similar to the man, also the candle is the poet's soul metonymy, that from one side expresses the mission of enlightening the progress of the human society, as was at the *le siècle de lumière philosophy*; while at the other side expresses the understanding of life as a divine gift that should have as goal the extol towards the eternal light.

The widen knowledge of reading made known that many of the didactic poems with fable features of Naim as *Pesha*, *Korbi dhe dhelpra*, *Gomari dhe kafshëtë e egra*, *Dragoj plak dhe dhelpra*, *Pëllumbat dhe laraska*, *Gomari i egër dhe i buti* and *Guguçeja*, on the text point-of-view and narration, and of the moral and educative messages, are re-creation or at least as origin form the *masnavi* of Moulana. (Bulo 1998; Rexhepi 2015).

One of the latest comparative studies about the poetry of Naim and the classical Persian literature is related to the theosophy, by understanding oneself and the world, with the uniqueness of the Creator and with the melting of God's image in everything that exists. In a way or another in these cases we have to do with the secular views that take example from the Koran wisdom in art and literature. The poem *Perëndija* (*God*) has been compared with one Rumi's *masnavi* (Shehabi : 2014). It's not an exclusive phenomenon that Rumi's poems start at such a way, *bez bismille i temhidom*, without *bis'mil'alh* and *pray*, without *Ves-selam* and *glorification of God*,

without the imperative permission from Him that stays in the sky (Čamdžić 2015), also including *Nejname*. Indeed, Naim's poem *Perëndija* follows in words and spirit the masnavi of the Master *Burri dhe thesari* (*The man and the treasure*). Although, looking more in depth, nonetheless the lack of the canonic prayer call, it can be proved that both are direct inspiration from a common source, from the Holy Scripture (*Kur'an*: 17-79).

The today scholars are inclined that all the world literature history is made on re-creative character and the code of her code are the Scriptures (Frye 1982). Rumi preceded the human thinking with the idea of human being nobility by hallowing the world, proclaiming *Saint Earth*. Naim with his Bektashi pantheism, reasserted that romantic light of principles, especially in conformity with nature's cult.

Naim's poem *Bagëti e Bujqësia* (*Livestock and farming*), that for many times with dismay has been compared with the Virgil's *Georgics* and the Hesiod's *Works and Days*, in nowadays has similarities with the Noah's Ark surah in the Koran, and with the Hebrew Kabala, on which the savants are instructed: *Vend i mirë për të medituar është një livadh jashtë qytetit* (*A good place to think is a paddock out of the city*). Naim's poem *Një lule e vyshkur apo një vajzë e vdekur* (*A faded flower or a dead girl*), the same as in the *Zemra* (*heart*), *Fyelli* (*flute*), *Perëndija* (*God*) and *Bilbili* (*nightingale*) poems, are traversed from the essential ideas of the Persian classical theosophy, according that the heart is God's see and the human soul has transformed into light. It's exactly this metamorphosis that hallows the light, but totally different understood from the traditional reading of this so present sign in Naim's poetry, that is enounced by the same philosophical principles: *Zemër e njeriut në jetë / Është vend i Perëndisë / Është atje Zot i vërtetë / Zot i math i gjithësisë*. This imagination of Naim is the same as in Koran, where the heart is considered a panegyric station and Creator's glorification. (*Kur'an* 17 : 19). The light, the heart and the Creator make up a trinity even in the Moulana's masnavi.

Among the lyrics who joined Naim and Rumi 's poetry, and time after time the Hafez ad Khayyam' poetry as well is related not only to his spiritual pursuit since childhood, when he was a pupil in the Tekkes of Frashër and of elder versifiers; with the world wide authority that the classical Persian poetry enjoyed, about which during the Rinascimento

centuries was said that was the first turning of attention to the antique literature of the Greek and Roman civilizations; not only on the status of the Persian language herself from the former Ottoman empire as *lingua franca* compared with its official language, who had the rank of a people's language; but also to his personal destiny as a man and writer; with aesthetic tastes and with the specimen of thinking.

All these invisible threads, always more and more decoded, who interconnect Naim's poetry with that of Pir-Rumi, bring us towards the question: If ideologically, because of the emergency that Albania had to detach herself from a ruling empire on her territories, from an empire belonging to the East, in his poem *Për se (what for)*, he wrote as an Enlightened thinker: *Jak'o dit'e uruar / Që lind nga perëndon*; in his outlook and philosophy on himself and the world, the man and the Creator so, for his personal convictions, was he closer to the Eastern mystical and theosophical understanding? Naim Frashëri, nevertheless his orientation, in accordance with his mission as a nationalist poet, he followed the model and preserved his identity, dictated by his origin. (Gylsheni 2000: 11). As it seems, this will be one of the most complicated questions of the future that the scholars would pose on his work. Eqrem Çabej was fully right when he wrote about Naim that, *He is kindred with this world; he lives in it, it's hers*. The Swedish reformer thinker of the XVIII century Emmanuel Swedenborg, in searching new possibilities of Christianity's moral renewal, hoping in a second coming of Messiah, in his treaty *The Heavenly Doctrine*, wrote: *The angels have turned their look towards Orient*.

Bibliography:

Abül Karim Gölshani, *Farhang-i Iran dar qalamraw-i Turkan: ash'ar-i Farsi-i Na'im Farashari, sha'ir va nivisandah-i qarn-i nuzdahum Albani - Rreth letërsisë perse shkruar në hapësirat turke dhe poezisë perse të autorit shqiptar të shekullit XIX Naim Frashëri*, Shiraz 1975.

Abdel Gylshani, *Naim Frashëri - poeti shqiptar që shkruan në gjuhën persiane: në 100-vjetorin e vdekjes së Naim Frashërit*, në *Flaka*, Shkup, 29 maj 2000.

Abdel K. Golshani, *Kultura iraniane në territoret e pushtuara nga Turqia - poezitë në gjuhën persiane të Naim Frashërit, poet dhe shkrimtar shqiptar i shekullit XIX*, përkthim shqip, ruhet në Arkivin e Institutit të Gjuhësisë dhe Letërsisë, Tiranë.

Abdel K. Golshani, *History of persian literature*, Tehran 2004.

A. Pagliano, A. Bausani, *La letteratura persiane*, Firenze 1968.

Abdulla Rexhepi, *Naim Frashëri dhe kodi letrar persian: Gjurmë të Mevlana Rumiut në poezinë e Naim Frashërit*, në aktet e Seminarit XXXIII Ndërkombëtar për Gjuhën, Letërsinë dhe Kulturën Shqiptare, nr. 33/2, Prishtinë 2015.

Abdullah Hamiti dhe Urata Agagjyshi, *Interpretimi i këngës “Neji” të Mevlana Xhelaluddin Rumi-ut*, në revistën *Hikmet*, nr. 5, Prishtinë 2014.

Ahmed Tamimdari, *Historia e letërsisë perse*, Tiranë 2011.

Ali Akbar Zijai, *Studim krahasues i mendimeve të Naim Frashërit dhe filozofëve të Lindjes të “Takhajolat”*, në *Perla*, nr. 2, 1996.

Ali Akbar Zijai, “*Dhimbja e fyellit*” e *Xhelaledin Rumiut*, në revistën *Perla*, nr. 4, Tiranë 1997.

Ali Akbar Zijai, *Gjuha e zemrës ose njohja e universit (një vështrim i shpejtë mbi librin “Ëndërrime” të N. Frashërit)*, në *Perla*, nr. 4, Tiranë 1998.

Ali Akbar Zijai, *Të kuptuarit e tretjes dhe njohjes të Naim Frashërit*, në revistën *Perla*, nr. 1-2, Tiranë 1998.

Ali Akbar Zijai, “*Vendi i shqiponjave*”, i njohur në Iran, Tehran 2003.

Arian Leka (ed. alt.), *Naimit*, bot. *Naim Frashëri*, Tiranë 2000.

Dritëro Agolli, *Punove mirë, usta*, në *Arti dhe koha*, bot. *Naim Frashëri*, Tiranë 1980.

Emmanuel Swedenborg, *Heaven and its wonders and Hell from things heard and seen*, USA 2001.

Eqrem Çabej, *Shqiptarët midis Perëndimit dhe Lindjes*, bot. *MçM*, Tiranë 1994.

Gjergj Fishta (Àt), *Lahuta e Malcìs*, bot. *Shtypshkroja Franceskane*, Shkodër 1937.

Italo Pizzi, *Storia della poesia persiana*, volume I, Roma 1894.

Jorgo Bullo, *Magjia dhe magjistarët e fjalës*, Tiranë 1998.

Jorgo Bulo, *Tipologjia e lirikës së Naim Frashërit*, bot. i Akademisë së Shkencave, Tiranë 1999.

Jorgo Bulo, *Ëndërrimet poetike të Naim Frashërit*, në *Ëndërrime (Tehajjulat)*, Tiranë 2005.

Krist Maloki, *Oriental apo Okcidental*, në *Hylli i Dritës*, nr. 1, Shkodër 1937.

Mauro Geraci, *Prometeo in Albania: passaggi letterari e politici di un paese balcanico*, Roma 2014.

Meral Shehabi-Veseli, *Marrëdhëniet intertekstuale sipas Zherar Zhenetit në poezitë e Naim Frashërit*, në ANAS, nr. 5- 6, Shkup 2014.

Moulana Xhelaledin Rumi, *Mas'navi Manavi*, përktheu Dhori Qiriaz, Tiranë 2007.

Murat Isaku, *Zjarri prometeik në poezinë e Naimit*, në *Jehona*, nr. 1, Shkup 1991.

Musine Kokalari, *Naim Frashëri (1846-1900)*, dorëshkrim, tesi di laurea in letteratura albanese (anno accademico 1940-1941), ruhet në Bibliotekën Kombëtare, Tiranë.

Musine Kokalari, *La mia vita universitaria: memorie di una scrittrice albanese nella Roma fascista (1937-1941)*, a cura di Simonette Ceglie e Mauro Geraci, ediz. Viella, Roma 2016.

Naim Frashëri, *Vepra*, I-VI, bot. Toena, Tiranë 2007.

Namik Ressuli, *Naim Frashëri - poet i mirësisë*, në *Shpirti shqiptar*, nr. 1-2, Torino 1955.

Nihad Čamdžić, *Živa baština*, na *Časopis za filozofiju i gnozu*, br. 1, izdat. *Baština duhovnosti*, Mostar decembar 2015.

Northrop Frye, *The Great Code: The Bible and Literature*, edit. Penguin Books, 1982.

Rexhep Qosja, *Prometeizmi në poezinë shqipe*, në librin *Kontinuitete*, bot. Rilindja, Prishtinë 1972.

Rexhep Qosja, *Panteoni i rralluar*, bot. Naim Frashëri, Tiranë 1988.

Reza Karami, *Roli i vëllezërve Frashëri në përhapjen e gjuhës dhe kulturës perse*, në *Perla*, nr. 4, Tiranë 2006.

Reza Karami, *"Masnavitë" - odet e Lindjes*, në *Perla*, nr. 3, Tiranë 2007.

Shaban Sinani, *Dorëshkrime të veprave të Saadiut në Shqipëri*, në *Perla*, nr. 1, Tiranë 2007.

Shaban Sinani, *Motive paralele në eposin e kreshnikëve dhe në "Shah-Name"*, në *Perla*, nr. 3, Tiranë 2005.

Shaban Sinani, *Si mbërriti "Divani" i Hafiz Shirazit në botën shqiptare*, në *Perla*, nr. 1, Tiranë 2006.

Shaban Sinani, *Personaliteti i Rumiut në romanin "Arka e djallit" të Dritëro Agollit*, në *Perla*, nr. 4, Tiranë 2007.

Shaban Sinani, *Prurje kulturore orientale*, bot. Albas, Tiranë 2007.

Shaban Sinani, *Berat, Beratinus, Buhara*, bot. Naimi, Tiranë 2015.

Vittoria Luisa Guidetti, *Angeli piangenti al cospetto di Dio*, në *Studia Albanica*, nr. 1, Tiranë 2015.

Floresha DADO

FRANZ NOPCSA, FROM ALBANIAN APPROACHES TO POETIC CREATION

An interesting surprise: in the personality of the distinguished Albanologist we could distinguish two gifts, which at first sight seem far from each other, but in the spiritual structure have an insight and specific relation. The first gift reminds us about the Austro-Hungarian eminent personalities in the realm of Albanology such as *Hahn, Meyer, Jokl, Bopp, Miklosich, Šufflay, Lambertz*, etc. (they were not just Austrians), the Hungarian Franz Nopcsa, who wrote in German, has its own physiognomy about his Albanian activity. A number of his books on Albanian issues, were written from 1907 to 1932.

It has been written and spoken about the passionate palaeontologist, geologist and anthropologist, researcher and traveller about the knowledge of the traditions and highlands of Albania. (Special contributions in determining his research merit belong to the researcher R. Elsie, but also to others). In the structure of thought of this scientist exists a complexity of fields, where material, spiritual and culture matters of Albanians are met, where the most visible is the cognitive-informative character, but also some attempts on phenomenon's typology. The metropolitan scientist established a special relationship with Albania's "cultural islands," which we can say that in general is the contact on a closed world.

The studies of the foreign Albanologist have been generally characterized by two types of approaches: *glorifier*, with nostalgic marks towards a lonely reality of its kind, and the *critical* approach more conditioned by the recognition level and a little extreme objectivity. Nopcsa belongs to that category of scholars who run into the Albanian highland ground with admiration and the passion for facing the dangers of travel and insecurity with the unknown or with the hostility of various circles. In this passionate meeting, the most

difficult aspect was keeping the balance between the reality and the personal experience, the most realistic interpretation of an unknown and complex Albanian world.

But how **real is this balance**? The recognition of another gift explains precisely this relation. From the many approaches of the *Albanian* character is presented another Franz, the one of the *artistic imagination*, of the deep empathy, of romantic evocations as much as dramatic. And if, in the beginning I have posed the question that how these two gifts, that seem far from each other, come together in the internal structure of thought and soul, it's a necessity to understand **how much** and **how** the scientist's survey is reflected on his imagination and artistic vision.

A cycle of poems in the form of manuscript were discovered for the first time by Prof. A. Kostallari in the Section of the Manuscripts at Vienna National Library on 1964. The volume with poems, in German is entitled, "Poetry" of Kolec Marku ("GEDICHTE" 1895-1932.) Kostallari gives some explanations on this nickname and finds arguments to prove that the author is the Albanologist Franz Nopcsa himself. Referred to some manuscripts that are found at National Library, except the historic facts, and some specifics on the poetry lexicon, Kostallari affirms that: "Nopcsa has taken as literary nickname the name of his highlander friend who calls him 'valiant person', 'a mountain eagle'." The author of this discovery gives a brief information on the six parts of the "GEDICHTE" poetry volume, with a total of 167 verses and 105 typing pages, (the first part is entitled *Lirika*; the second part *Në Karpate* ; the third part *Philosophie*; the fourth part *Tregime të shkurtra*; the fifth part *Nga Shqipëria* and the sixth part *Tregime të gjata*.) and it speaks for a certain interpretation on the recognition and circumstances of the highland reality by Nopcsa.

It remains opened and not evaluated the recognition of this poetic world, the definition of its **relations with the scholar's experience** as observer and careful researcher, but also romantic that runs towards freedom. The volume can be seen even in another approach: the cycle with poems dedicated to Albania (22 poems) and the general cycle (145 poems), where the moral-philosophical problems prevail. The common of both cycles is the dissatisfied poet with time reality, eager for a free world and in search for spiritual tranquillity. If we follow the

meaningful structure, both cycles have an intrinsic relation: the poems dedicated to Albania seem that give answers to all the troubles of the second cycle, to indirectly affirm that exactly on the northern Albania mountains can be found the spiritual tranquillity on issues that belong to the general cycle. This intrinsic relation has of course the proper meaning: from one side is the scientific activity of Nopcsa, the admiration for highlander's virtues and bravery are a consequence of the research on the ground.

In this case we have the scholar. From the other side to the reflection of the poetic vision of the poems dedicated to Albania, comes as an instinctive influence from the *scientist* to the *poet*. Are not simply the same themes that belong to the ethno-culture of some areas of the highlands and Nopcsa treats them in his many Albanian studies, but for that common warming feeling that floats as in his studies, also directly in his poems. The poetry is bound with the panthelologist, the geologist, the archaeologist's image in a poetic vision, that's make the object moving... *“Nga errësira e parahistorisë / Ku çdo gur-libër shkëlqen / Me shkëndija stoliplote.Eja e shih kuçedra të vjetra,/ Eja e shih botën e vjetër!/ Se si sende të çuditshme, të tmerrshme /Lëvizin, të shëmtuara prej vdekjes.* (the translations of the poems are of A. Kostallari).

If we follow the intrinsic structure of the cycle dedicated to Albania, we can individualize four main themes:

1. **The departure** on the highland areas, to find a new reality, a reason that sounds like those of the romantic poets (*Udh'e mbarë, o botë, udh'e mbarë, o lavdi/Udh'e mbarë ju figura të gënjeshtërtë/ udh'e mbarë, ju dijetarë të rregjuar,./ udh'e mbarë, ju forca të parasë.... Ju nuk më mbani dot më këtu.....Nuk ma ndaloni dot lumturinë e jetës sime “Udh'e mbarë, o botë!/Farewell, world”*).

2. **The discovery**, the enthusiasm on facing another world, as rude but also as free. (*Kështu, pra, nuk u gënjeva,/ Kështu, pra, bëra mirë,/Nuk gënjyen yjet,/ Në udhën e tyre të lartë.* And again: *Po vezullojnë gurët e bardhë/ Kaq të heshtur, kaq të largët, kaq të zhveshur./Unë e ndjej vehten kaq të qetë/ Vetëm në vendin që kam zgjedhur vetë.* “Atdheu im/My homeland”).

3. **The identification** of the poet with highlanders' images admired by him. This inclination is seen in his nickname as author of the poetic volume, but also in other moments.

4. **The farewell**, the presage of moving away that would occur with the tragic end chosen by him (*Hijet po bien më të gjata / Dielli po merr një ngjyrë të kuqe / Po afrohet perëndimi / Po afrohet errësira, vdekja*. "Kënga e Kalorësit/The knight song").

What kind of poet do we know in the Nopcsa volume?

Of course of a **romantic** type, dissatisfied from the reality of time, with the desire to move in a second "homeland", where he could find spiritual tranquillity, also accepting another bohemian at the bay of nature. (*Ngjyra ledhatare, tinguj të mahnitshëm, / Stolisin humnerat, ngjiten të bukura / Përpjetë shkëmbit dhe malit / Në meës gjith'atyre luleve plot njomësi*. "Malli për Jugun/Longing for the South").

A poet of **freedom** that erupts: "Bota për mua është e vogël / the world is small to me "Shpirti im fluturon drejt diellit/ my soul flies to the sun".

Poet of **landscape**: many verses bring the impressionist poetry colours, create the vision of picture, re-building images of that world that his troubled soul was searching...

Poet of an extraordinary **lyricism** on both poems dedicated to *Këngës/the Song*, where the poet feels that "*Kënga e vajtimit e poetit lirik / kur ngrihet lart/ atëhere është zë bubullime.../ Ajo është britma e zemrës së njeriut; / një përbindësh e dëgjon dhe dridhet prej saj*."

Poet of **philosophical thought**, that overpasses the reality's colours to express his relation with the world, conveying images and experiences that have a space, a wide undertaking of the human world. In this cycle is almost difficult to build a hierarchy of values; the feeling is deeply intertwined with the philosophic meditation.

These characteristics prove that the passionate poet, the voyager of rude mountains kept within a deep feeling, capability to melt his pains and joys with more universal dimensions.

What about the **relation with reality**? Not a friendly one. The contrast stands at the founding of these relationship. The poetry is not raised over the fact, but over the distinction. The disappointment for a world when "the asset of freedom is vanishing", where lie and the lust for money rules. The poet himself runs, but wants the world to run also.

Hope the future generations would understand his choice: “*Unë e ndjej veten kaq të qetë / Vetëm në vendin që kam zgjedhur vetë.*” (Vendi i arritjes/The destination). “*Unë po nisem për në Shqipëri / Te populli heroik me ndjenja lirie ! / Atje vlen burri, atje vlen trimëria / Atje akoma vlen fjala për besë e mirësi.*” (Kënga e shtegtarit/The song of the pilgrim).

The relation with the Albanian: “Ju përshëndes, tek ju janë akoma / Miqësitë më të forta se jeta dhe vdekja.” I think that the poetry, “Vendi im përrallo/My fairy tale country” compounds the most poetic image and experience of Nopcsa as a poet, and I think that we have a pearl of thought and admiration for another reality, that percolates the whole cycle dedicated to Albania, whom he calls “my country.”

The relation with oneself? Its known the tragic end of F. Nopcsa. There can be different conjectures in explaining this fact, but I think that the poetry has better expressed the complicated relationship that this distinguished scholar had with oneself. It becomes interesting the verse when he affirms that “*Fjala që më del me vrull nga zemra / Është vetëm dhimbja ime, që mbetet e pashuar/The world that comes from my heart/Its only my pain, that remains insatiable.*” Especially the poems of the general cycle, that I call mainly philosophical problems, discover an inner spiritual disturbance, a clash of feelings, conscious but also instinctive.

What he has openly expressed on verses has inner source, unaware, has a spiritual misbalance of the sexual instincts, has something that he himself couldn't explain, but the psychoanalyze opens the path of interpretation. The identification of oneself with the highlands figures, the imagination that gives the desire that after death he would meet them etc., the real fact of the sexual relationship with the Albanian, whom he killed before taking his own life etc., are complicated relations that willy-nilly his poetry provokes for interpretation.

If we refer to psychoanalyzes, we could say the word, the figure, the poetic feeling of Nopcsa, express the unconscious, the inner instinct. This aspect can give an explanation to the tragic end, chosen by him. The metaphor (“Kënga e kalorësit”/ “Knights song”) it's a harbinger that “*rruga është e gjatë, por ajo nuk shpie në shtëpi/the way is long, but it does not bring you home.*” Or: “*Dielli po merr një ngjyrë të kuqe? Po afrohet perëndimi / Po afrohet errësira, vdekja.*” Or the

verses: “*Figura të errta nga vendi i vdekjes / Mbi botë po përhapen*” “*dëgjova me ëndje zërin e kukuvajkës*” [...] What was being prepared in his inner world? Seems calm the tragic end, but the poetry affirms that his inner disturbance was in him, that gradually seem to calm, to calmly bring the poet towards the tragic acts.

The interpretation of this poetic volume is surprising: *first*, because F. Nopcsa is known as a distinguished Albanologist and suddenly we are in contact with his poems. *Secondly*, it is not a common poem, but a reflection of sensitive spiritual world and the powerful poetic image. If his Albanian studies prove a brilliant mind, research and generalized capability, the poetry surprises us with a suffering, but a free soul. These two fields of creativity have such relations where the first influences the second, the second gives more human colours to the first. The scientist and the poet establish a synergy that makes Franz Nopcsa a very complex character, beyond the genuine Albanian approaches.

Hamit KABA

RAPPROCHEMENT EFFORTS: ALBANIA'S RELATIONS WITH THE USA AND ENGLAND DURING THE '70-80

Albania: away from Europe and America, but close to China

Albania's foreign policy during the years 1961 - 1978 was fully oriented towards China, because of the close ideological affinity. During those years, Albania displayed a hostile attitude towards the USSR and the USA, and, to some extent, remained isolated from the rest of the world as well. The country bore no relation with either of the two major Eastern and Western Blocs, steered clear of multilateral European and global 'entanglements', and showed no interest in cooperating with other Balkan countries or partaking in the Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe [CSCE].

The efforts in 1945-1946 to re-establish Albania's diplomatic relations with the USA and Great Britain failed for commonly understood reasons. It was not until the 1991 that these relations were finally re-established, following the collapse of the communist regime and after overcoming the inherited obstacles. During the first 20 years after the war ended, Albanian governments continued to demonstrate the willingness and interest in establishing diplomatic relations with the United States. However, in the second half of the 1960s and thereafter, this willingness was only on the part of the United States.

The improvement of the Albanian-English relations could not be achieved without first resolving the problems brought about by the Corfu Channel Incident, indemnifying England pursuant to The Hague Tribunal's decision and returning the monetary gold belonging to Albania, the restitution of which was blocked by the Tripartite Commission.

The establishment of diplomatic relations with the Federal Republic of Germany, as well as for other former communist countries

in Europe, was posed as a problem to be solved in the early 1970s, after that the “Hallstein” doctrine was replaced with the “Ostpolitik” initiated by the German Chancellor Willy Brandt* and the steps that were taken to improve East-West relations. Albania remained far from European and world developments due to the policy pursued by the communist government. It was the last country in Europe to establish diplomatic relations with the Federal Republic of Germany.

After a long period of rebuffs and hesitations, the US government in the late 60s and early 70s took the initiative to re-establish the diplomatic relations with Albania. This change was not due to the softening of the communist regime in the country, but was part of a new US political vision initiated by President Nixon. The essence of this policy, known as “Realpolitik,” was the acceptance of certain realities in US relations with the communist countries in Central and Eastern Europe,¹ regardless of their political and ideological nature. The tendency for US policy change in its virtual form had emerged before Nixon's arrival at the White House in 1969. Since 1964 ideas has been put forward to “build bridges” in relations with communist Eastern European countries and not only with USSR, in order to facilitate and support constructive change in these countries and move towards the reunification of Central and Eastern Europe with the West. Reunification did not mean a political entity, a military alliance or a third force, but rather closer bilateral ties, arms control and multilateral relations.² The need for profound changes in US foreign policy had been underlined by Nixon since 1967, in an article published in “Foreign Affairs Magazine.”

* Willy Brandt was the leader of the German Social-Democratic Party (1964 -1987) and chancellor of the German Federal Republic of Germany in 1969-1974. He ended the “Hallstein Doctrine”, according to which Western Germany wouldn't establish diplomatic relations or break of relations with countries that would recognize the existence of DDR, replacing it with the “Ostpolitik.” With the latter he paved the way to the process of reconciliation between Western Germany with the countries of Eastern Europe and the recognition of the DDR.

¹ Hamit Kaba, “Politika e SHBA ndaj Shqipërisë në vitet 70 dhe reflektimi i saj në NATO”, in *Studime historike*, nr. 3-4, Tiranë: 2008, p. 1.

² *The National Archives and Record Administration* (hereinafter: NARA), RG 59, “Building bridges with the Eastern Europe”, prepared by the Council of Policy Planning, July 31, 1964, p. 2.

In July 1967, the first to directly pose the beginning of negotiations to the Albanian mission in New York and to resolve other problems were the US diplomats, but the Albanian government did not reply to the American initiative.³

The idea to restore diplomatic relations with Albania was discussed again in Washington on the eve of President Nixon's visit to Romania in 1969.⁴ The US government's proposals became particularly clear after Albania's exit from the Warsaw Treaty in August 1968, and after the establishment of US-Chinese contacts to normalize their relations, and also after the crack of the Albanian-Chinese relations. US Secretary of State Rogers also mentioned the need to improve relations with Albania in January 1970, during an interview with the editor-in-chief of *Le Monde* newspaper.⁵

Among the steps that the Albanian government undertook in the early 1970s was the establishment of the diplomatic relations with the Benelux countries such as Belgium, Netherlands and Luxembourg, but also with Switzerland and Austria, as well as with the Nordic countries: Sweden, Norway and Denmark. Though Albania continued to keep the door closed to any improvement in the relations with US. In the summer of 1971, Tirana had established diplomatic relations with most European countries, with the exception of Great Britain and West Germany.⁶ Basically, the Albanian government, would not exclude the option of establishing diplomatic relations with Great Britain and the Federal Republic of Germany, but she has put as condition the solution of the inherited problems from the past such as monetary gold problems with England and the payback of reparations of the Second World War by the Federal Republic of Germany.

³ Paskal Milo, "Shqipëria në vitet e tronditjeve të mëdha të sistemit (1960-1990)", in *Historia e Popullit Shqiptar*, vëll. IV, Akademia e Shkencave e Shqipërisë, Instituti i Historisë, Tiranë: Toena, 2009, p. 314.

⁴ *Arkivi i Ministrisë së Punëve të Jashtme* (hereinafter: *AMPJ*), Year (hereinafter: V.) 1969, File (hereinafter: D.) 304, p. 6, Telegram of Sokrat Plaka from New York, to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, on 10.09.1969.

⁵ *Ibid*, V. 1970, D. 48, p. 49.

⁶ NARA, RG 59, "Albania: Changes in the foreign policy," prepared by Stephen Peters, January 4, 1972, p. 6. In November 1971 Albania had diplomatic relations on ambassadors rank with over 50 countries (compared with 35 in 1966), nonetheless the actual exchange of ambassadors wouldn't pass tens of them.

In a report dated in 1971 about the US Foreign Policy, the Secretary of State Rogers, expressed the readiness of the American government to intensify the process of normalizing the relations with Albania. The new position of the State Department towards Albania was made known to the American embassies around the world, but a key role would play the American embassies in Rome, Belgrade and Athens. These embassies received the duty to refer the message of the American government that she really wanted to re-establish diplomatic relations with Albania assuring [the latter], that “the stand of the USA towards Albania was not hostile, and we can't wait for the day when the Albanian leaders would take seriously into consideration the improvement of the relations with the USA.”⁷ The time chosen to offer to the Albanian government the possibility of establishing the diplomatic relations was favorable, because Albania has officially withdrawn from the Warsaw Treaty and existed the fear of a possible attack from the part of the Soviet Union and his allies. It was also thought that, the Sino-American rapprochement would influence in “breaking the ice” between Albania and USA. Apparently after the exit from the Warsaw Treaty, the security problems in Albania had priority in front of other problems, including the ideological ones. The military aid from China, nonetheless the intensive exchange of the military delegations between the two countries and the strong statements of the high Chinese leadership in defense of Albania, were not a guarantee for its defense. China was far away from Albania, and the efficacy of her help was debatable, except the Mao Zedong's rhetoric. The readiness of the Chinese leadership to support Albania from any possible attack was uncertain. The Chinese Communist Party declined in 1963 the Albanian offer to reach a military agreement between the two countries, even because Deng Xiaoping during the negotiations had said “*to be on the agenda...in the future*”.⁸

On April 11, 1971, the State Department instructed the American Mission in NATO, to discuss on the security problems Albania was

⁷ NARA, RG 59, Telegram of the Secretary of State Rogers for the American embassies in Rome and Belgrade, on May 24, 1971.

⁸ *Arkivi Qendror Shtetëror i Republikës së Shqipërisë* (më tej: *AQSH*), Fondi (hereinafter: F.) 14/AP, V. 1963, D. 7, Meeting between Beqir Balluku and Deng Xiaoping in Beijing, on September 24, 1963, p. 81.

facing from a possible attack of the Warsaw Treaty countries.⁹ The American interest for Albania became more concrete when the Secretary of State Rogers met the Greek deputy minister of Foreign Affairs Palamas in June 1971.¹⁰ Rogers asked the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Greece to instruct the ambassador in Tirana to inform the Albanian government about the American readiness to establish communication channels between the two countries, which could facilitate the process of establishing diplomatic relations. He stressed that "the attitude of USA towards Albania it's not at all hostile and we can't wait for the day when the Albanian leaders would take into consideration the improvement of relations with the USA."¹¹ The Albanian government did not respond directly to the Americans, but in an editorial article published in "Zëri i Popullit" newspaper, on November 26, 1972, called it simply a "balloon test." The lack of the Albanians reaction to this proposal, was later explained by Rogers with the stage of the Sino-American relations, that according to him were on the process of evolution. The American Secretary of State was optimist for the future of the Albanian-American relations and was not sharing the same opinion with the French diplomats, who thought that the principles of the Albania's foreign policy excluded the possibility of normalizing its relations with the USA.

In January 1972, the chairman of the American table-tennis team, Ranford Harrison presented its demand for visa to the Albania Mission in New York.¹² He wanted to visit Albania in July, after visiting first Yugoslavia His visit was thought to bring a clear political message, as was brought in China a year ago during his visit there. It's well-known the sport gesture of the American table-tennis team during the game against the China's team in Japan on April 1971, who helped to break the ice and improving the frozen situation of relations that existed since many years between the two countries. His request was left in silence.

⁹ NARA, RG 59, US Mission to NATO, "Pressure of the Warsaw Treaty on Albania", April 11, 1971.

¹⁰ NARA, RG 59, Department of State, POL ALB, Albania 2891, June 7, 1971.

¹¹ NARA, RG 59, Department of State, POL ALB, Albania 2891, June 7, 1971.

¹² *AMPJ*, V. 1972, D. 431, p. 1-2, Telegram of the Albanian Mission in New York for the Ministry of Foreign Affairs nr. 23, on 14.01.1972; *ibid*, V. 1973, D. 512, p. 10, "Some US steps on normalizing the relations with the People's Republic of Albania", New York, May 1, 1973.

For the Albanian communist leadership was unacceptable the American's "ping-pong" policy as was specified by Enver Hoxha.

Another invitation for establishing the diplomatic relations with Albania was made from the Assistant Secretary of State Kenneth Rush, on April 4, 1973, in a speech kept at the Naval Academy in Annapolis. At the paragraph dedicated to Albania, Rush stressed that "only there has not been e visible progress with Albania . At the light of the enlargement of relations with all the countries of Eastern Europe, it seems anachronistic that Albania still talks about us in the rhetoric of objections of the past times. If she wants and where she wants, she will find us prepared."¹³ The American proposal for the establishment of the diplomatic relations with Albania, was not just a formal act, a poll or a throb to see the reaction of the Albanian government. The further steps of the American government, show about her seriousness and insistence to normalize the relations with Albania. To achieve this objective, the American government used the diplomatic and non-diplomatic channels, including even some offers for scientific, economic, sportive, cultural, press and private visits offers of persons with high reputation etc. The American government was especially informed about the decline of her proposal from the diplomatic missions in Italy, Yugoslavia, France, Greece, Turkey, Austria and Switzerland in Tirana and beyond.

The American scientist of Albanian origin, Sejfi Protopapa, in a letter sent to the National Security Adviser, Henry Kissinger on April 11, 1973, optioned for the idea to be used the personal channels of communication, as a mean to improve the process of relations with Albania.¹⁴ At the function of this idea, he proposed to the State Department to temporarily appoint him at the structure of the American diplomatic mission in Belgrade. In the answer that came from the State Department, was made clear to him by the assistant Secretary of the State Department Dean Rush that the initiative should came from the Albanian government.¹⁵

¹³ *Ibid*, V. 1973, D. 512, pp. 13-14, The Albanian Mission at the United Nations in New York to MPJ, 1 May 1973; NARA, RG 59, "Albania: The position of the United States on the recognition of Tirana government", prepared by Stephen Peters, December 28, 1973, p. 18.

¹⁴ NARA, RG 59, Letter of Sejfi Protopapa for Henry Kissinger, April 11, 1973.

¹⁵ NARA, RG 59, Letter of Richard G. Johnson for Sejfi Protopapa, May 17, 1973.

At the State Department were taking place discussions also on problems that would be presented before the reach of the final goal - re-establishing the diplomatic relations with Albania. At the beginning of the '70ies, seemed that the bilateral Albanian-American relations, that were in force until 1939 and compound an obstacle for their re-establishment in 1945-1946, had lost their importance. They have faded with time, or were not actual anymore. For the first time, we see the American discussions about economic claims on Albania, which should be fulfilled from the Albanian government, after the establishment of the diplomatic relations between the two countries. First, the Albanian government should pay back to the American government about 2 million dollars, as compensation for the harms that were caused to the proprieties of the American citizens in Albania during the Second World War and secondly, another 10 million dollars to compensate the value of their properties in Albania that were nationalized from the communist regime in the first years after the war. To open the path of re-establishing the diplomatic relations, at the State Department were thinking that this demand, would find solution only after the relations were established¹⁶. Indeed, this demand was not made known to the Albanian government, because she refused the American proposal since the first steps. About the first request, it should be mentioned that, the American government had tried to solve it in 1958-1962, when she has approved a special law for the compensation of the American citizens on Balkan origin, properties of which were destroyed during the Italian and German occupation. From the partial papers that we know about this problem, comes out that, for the compensation of the damages caused from the Italian and German occupation, the American government had used the wealth these countries had in the USA. The American claim, including the financial one, would find solution after the approval of a special project-agreement achieved between both governments on August 1, 1994.

The Greek diplomacy tried to benefit from the American's government proposal to re-establish diplomatic relations with Albania. On 1973, the Secretary of State Rogers, declined some rumors spread from the Greek diplomat Cavalieratos, allegedly on the role that Greece

¹⁶ NARA, RG 59, Memorandum of the State Department, "The perspective of normalizing relations with Albania", March 8, 1972.

might play as a bridge builder in the relations between USA and Albania on the request of the American government. Rogers made it clear that, Greece through these methods, wanted to be better informed on this issue and to exploit it for its national interests.¹⁷ The high Greek diplomat, aiming to add his personal credit and of the political force he represented, said that the re-establishment of the diplomatic relations between Albania and USA cannot be fulfilled because was on force according to him the resolution on "Northern Epirus-Vorio Epir" approved in July 1946 from the American Senate. The claim of Cavalieratos was turned down from the State Department.

Some renowned newspapers in USA as "New York Times", but also the press of the American Albanians through their newspapers as "Dielli (The Sun)" and "Liria (The Freedom)", published special articles on American-Albanian relations, supporting the idea of the re-establishment of the diplomatic relations. The renowned American journalist Sulzberger, who has visited Albania at the end of the '50s, presented to the Albanian embassy in Beijing in 1973, the request for visa, request that was rebuffed.

The American government made efforts to directly communicate with the Albanian Mission in the UN, New York. Though, the members of this mission showed themselves rigid and often not ethical in the conduct with the American diplomats. They precisely fulfilled the orders of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the ideological criteria on judging the Albanian-Americans relations, that tried to approach the two countries. Some distinguished intellectuals of the Albanian community in the USA as Nicholas Costa, Nicholas Pano and Peter Prifti were rebuffed the visas or were treated behindhand. The historian Nicholas Costa, on September 1972, visited the See of the Albanian Mission in New York and tried to play the role of the negotiator. He forwarded the message of the State Department, the essence of which was to send in Albania an emissary of the American government [as was done in the case of China], to discuss on the possibility of normalizing relations between the two countries.¹⁸ He made known that, was not about making polls, but for an official message of the

¹⁷ NARA, RG 59, POL ALB – US, 57812, March 28, 1973, "Albanian-American relations: questions from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Greece", pp. 1-2.

¹⁸ *AMPJ*, V. 1973, D. 512, p. 23.

American government. However, the delicate mission of professor Kosta, ended without success. He faced the sharp refusal and the non-ethical behavior[ridiculed] of the Albanian diplomats in New York. Other Albanian-Americans after the historian Kosta, as Bill Gunari, Dhimitër Trebicka etc., tried to convince the members of the Albanian mission to normalize the relations between Albania and USA, but without success. The State Department also tasked for this mission distinguished American scientists, but nothing changed in the attitude of the Albanian government. To make more credible the official proposal, the American government followed the proposal in undertaking some concrete steps that aimed to improve the reciprocal environment to ease the started process. One of these steps is the discrete attitude of the political emigration in America, as the cut of the financial aid for the “Shqipëria e Lirë (Free Albania)” Committee, the softening of the anticommunist rhetoric towards the Albanian government etc.

The community of the American Albanians acclaimed with enthusiasm and optimism the American proposal for the normalization of the diplomatic relations. In their inner circles they were saying that the Albanian government had “accepted” the proposal of the American government and has appointed as its ambassador in Washington the experienced diplomat Javier Malo. The American proposal was published in some articles of the principal American newspapers, where was justified that the development of relations between USA and China, would put the Albanian government under pressure, and would be forced to change its opinion towards the USA. On 30 May 1973, “Dielli” newspaper published an article of the Albanian-American Hari Stoj who, on behalf of the American Albanians, thanked the assistant Secretary of State Kenneth Rush and the State Department that were making efforts to normalize the relations with Albania.

In all the cases, the replies of the Albanian government were negative and not directly. Enver Hoxha, commenting these proposals wrote in his diary: *“I think that we do not have to accelerate to establish relations with Japan. With the USA, absolutely not, nor with Bonn, and not with England. This last should give us back the gold that has taken from us, Bonn should pay us the war's reparations. With the USA, as they declined to have relations with us for 30 years, we don't*

want for 100 years.”¹⁹ A response towards the American proposal for the re-establishment of the diplomatic relations with Albania, Enver Hoxha gave on October 3, 1974, in a speech in front of his electors of the electoral zone 208, in Tirana.²⁰ He refused the American proposal, boasting himself in not at all diplomatic posture.

The rebuff attitude of the Albanian leadership according to the diplomat and scholar Stephen Peters*, should be searched on the bases of Albania's foreign policy, such as: the unchanged preservation of the political power, on the Stalinist ideological principles, but also on the efforts to secure the national survival and the total integrity of the Albanian territory.²¹

In the following years the American government would not lose the interest for Albania. It would leave the door open to re-establish with Albania diplomatic relations. On May 1974, during a NATO meeting in Brussels, was also discussed on the situation of Albania and her strategic position in the Mediterranean, appreciating her neutral position between the two Military Blocks, and this position favored NATO. In the summit was given the idea that should not be created irritations with Albania, but should improve relations with it. The United States and England should further continue their efforts to succeed on establishing diplomatic relations with Albania.

The hope of the American government that the Chinese politics would influence in the re-establishment of the Albanian-American relations, was not justified. The communist leadership of Albania disliked the Sino-American approach and wouldn't agree with the Chinese policy on opening to the world. Tirana continued its propaganda against the two superpowers and kept its doors closed, except the many kind efforts of the USA to build communication

¹⁹ Enver Hoxha, *Ditar për çështjet ndërkombëtare (1970-1971)*, vol. VI, Instituti i Studimeve Marksiste-Leniniste, Tiranë: 1983, p. 454.

²⁰ Enver Hoxha, “Imperializmi amerikan dhe imperializmi rus po e çojnë botën në një luftë tjetër botërore më të tmerrshme nga të gjitha të tjerat”, in *Zëri i Popullit*, nr. 238 (8156), October 4, 1974.

* Stephen Peters was American citizen of Albanian origin who had finished the college studies in Harvard. After the Second World War he worked at the State Department on Balkans and Albania's issues.

²¹ NARA, RG 59, R/RSES-2 Department of State, “Albania: Changes in the foreign policy,” prepared by Stephen Peters, January 4, 1972.

bridges with Albania. On the '70ies the trade between the two countries remained in very low levels, simply in a few exchanges in value and choice. On 1974, the politics and financial circles in USA, proposed to be given to Albania a loan of 100 million dollars, for 20 years with interest 7.5%, proposal that remained unanswered. The Albanian mission in New York had some invitations and information from high American institutions to participate in some important events, but they were silently refused. After many years, on March 1977, the American government removed the restrictions established for the movement of the Albanian Mission in New York.

Proposals in address of the Albanian government to establish diplomatic relations at that time were made even from the governments of the Great Britain, Federal Republic of Germany and Japan.

Albania was on the group of those countries which Great Britain had not diplomatic representative, nor normal relations. After the break of the relations with the Soviet Union and the Communist Block, the British government followed a more specified policy on Albania. In January 1962, Foreign Office (FO) rectified something in its policy. In a confidential communiqué, about the policies to be followed by the FO towards Albania, DDR, the Democratic Republic of Korea and the Vietnam, was made a distinction for Albania and the Saudi Arabia. Now the FO proclaimed that would not obstruct his diplomatic representatives to directly or through mediators to communicate with the diplomatic representaives of these two countries. Though, the British Foreign Ministry would forbidden its representatives to directly answer and decide for various issues without knowing before the judgment of the British government²².

In 1965, with the encouragement of the British-Albanian Association, William Bland and some members of the parliament suggested the establishment diplomatic relations with Albania, arguing this step in favor of the British side.²³ Though, the Albanian government insisted that, the establishment of the diplomatic relations was to be decided by both countries and not by persons or friendship

²² *The National Archives, London* (hereinafter: TNA), "Communications with governments, the relations of which with Her Majesty Government in the Great Britain are not in normal conditions", circular nr. 053 Foreign Office, June 18, 1962.

²³ AQSH, F. 14/AP, V. 1966, D. 201, pp. 1-2.

associations. If the British government had concrete proposal, it had to present them through diplomatic channels. In 1967, BBC interrupted after 27 years the broadcast in Albanian, on the pretext of lack of financial sources and of the little interest that Albania had. The efforts the lord Nicholas Bethel made in 1972 to re-establish the BBC service broadcast in Albanian was considered by FO an action without interest.²⁴

The British government also followed the trend of the American-Albanian developments, who we can say would not affect at all in the British behavior towards Albania. The British Foreign Ministry was attentively following the new developments and the established situation after the Albania's exit from the Warsaw Treaty on August 1968, considering this step as positive in favor of the Western countries. The British diplomacy considered that, until Albania would continue to stand between the East and West, the existing balances would be preserved, and there was not any major reason or motive who would force her to change its attitude towards Albania and to see with precedence the problem of relations with that country. Nonetheless, the Great Britain continued to have small trade exchanges and to promote its companies, and to encourage them to be present in Albania. The trade exchanges were some hundred thousand pounds, while Albania was visited by a small number of British tourists.

In 1969, a year after the official exit of Albania from the Warsaw Treaty, and after the establishment of diplomatic relations with Sweden and some other Western countries, within the British diplomatic circles was given the idea of exploring the possibilities of establishing the diplomatic relations with Albania. Though, the British government in a special memorandum, concluded that "in the present situation the government would not take the initiative to establish the diplomatic relations with Albania"; that "she can reconsider the situation only if Albanians would give a true signal for the potential touristic development of their country, or if was seen a radical change in Albania's military and political stand."²⁵ To achieve the establishment of the diplomatic relations with Albania, the latter should have properly

²⁴ TNA, *Foreign and Commonwealth Office* (hereinafter: FCO) 26/1200, Year 1972.

²⁵ TNA, FCO 28/613, 1968-1969, "Albania", Confidential, top secret, J. W. Hutson for Mr. T. Brimelow, August 26, 1969.

solved the British compensation on the Corfu Channel incident. For the first time was heralded the idea that at the same time with the solution of the problem about compensating Britain, was to be given back the blocked gold. The British government considered that still was not the time to undertake such an initiative.

The efforts of the British government to re-establish diplomatic relations with the Albanian government, increased especially in 1972-1973, following the proposals of the American government for an approach with Albania due to the improvement situation of relations between China and USA and with the Western Europe. The first signal was given from the British deputy Foreign Secretary on April 24, 1972, who declared in the House of Commons that "I would be happy if we will find the way to overcome the difficulties which has obstructed the re-establishment of the diplomatic relations with Albania."²⁶ In 1973, the British government made continuous efforts to re-establish the diplomatic relations with Albania. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Italy after being contacted, accepted to negotiate between the parts, to help this process. The British were thinking that, if they found Albania ready for negotiations, they would proceed with negotiations in Rome or in New York.²⁷ The British Secretary for Foreign Affairs, Julian Emery [former officer of SOE in Albania during the Second World War] personally was involved for the progress of the starting process. To make known the British proposal, except the Italian ambassador in Tirana, were involved the Turkish and the Chinese diplomats.²⁸ The Albanian government didn't rebuff the British proposal, as has done with the American proposal, but refused to start the negotiations, without being firstly solved the problem of the Albanian gold. In an electorate speech on 3 October 1974, Enver Hoxha made it clear that, was not possible to established diplomatic relations with the Great Britain, without giving back to Albania the whole "stolen" gold together with the interests.

²⁶ *AMPJ*, V. 1973, D. 253, Information from Ksenofon Nushi, deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs, on February 5, 1973.

²⁷ *AMPJ*, V. 1973, D. 253, Information of Ksenofon Nushi, on February 3, 1973.

²⁸ *Ibid*, pp.12-13, Information of the Minister of Internal Affairs Kadri Hazbiu, nr. 4315, on 31.08.1973.

In 1977, the British government was attentively following the negative trend of the Albanian-Chinese relations and the perspective of their change.²⁹ Except the enlargement of the diplomatic and economic relations of Albania with some neighboring and western countries, Enver Hoxha was considered “a fanatic prisoner of the proper ideology, as a paranoid, determined to guarantee his personal rule.” He was not seen as a leader that was unable to follow the evolution of the Mao Zedong's foreign policy, but a leader that was competing with the Chinese for the Marxist-Leninist leadership in the world. The Foreign and Commonwealth Office* [FCO] was thinking that the crack of the Albanian-Chinese relations was an expected phenomenon, accompanied with changes in the Albania's foreign policy. The future of Albania was the path of self-isolation and reliance on its own forces. The return of Albania within the orbit of the Soviet Union or seeking of a “new protector” was seen as a phenomenon that was not possible to happen. The following of the self-isolation path, would exhaust Albania's reserves and sooner or later, it would be forced to slowly move towards Western Europe and world trade.³⁰

Having into consideration the inheritance and the legal ideological barriers of the Albanian state, was predicted that the movement of Albania towards the West would walk on three principal paths, which include the foreign trade, the enforcement of relations with the neighboring countries and Italy, and the participation of Albania at the Conference for Security and Cooperation in Europe.* If the supposed changes would occur, the British government would give a strong

²⁹ TNA, FCO 21/560, Year 1977, “Hope for changes in the Albania's foreign policy”, August 5, 1977.

* *Foreign and Commonwealth Office* (FCO) is one of the ministries of the United Kingdom, who was founded on 1968 from the union of the Foreign Office (FO) and Commonwealth Office. This ministry is responsible for the protection and the promotion of the British interests in the world. FCO is chaired from the Secretary for Foreign Affairs of the Commonwealth, in short is called - Secretary of State. The post of the Secretary of State is esteemed as one of the four most prestigious appointments of the British cabinet.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Foreign_and_Commonwealth_Office (seen on October 15, 2016)

³⁰ TNA, FCO 21/560, Year 1977, “Hope for changes in the Albania's foreign policy”, August 5, 1977.

* Note: Indeed, the first two predictions were proved, while the participation of Albania in CSCE remained “a forbidden apple” until May 1990, when Albania was admitted on the observer's status and a year later, as full member.

signal to Albania wishing for normalizing the bilateral relations. As a first step, would serve sending in Albania a mission, which would come to know the inclinations of the Albanian politics together with the mutual development of trade. The actual possibilities of the Great Britain to re-establish diplomatic relations with Albania seemed few, but anyway, there was hope that Enver Hoxha in other circumstances, would be forced to become more flexible about the problem of the Albanian gold. If the Albanian government would show signs of flexibility to solve the gold problem, the British government should have to reply swiftly, to solve this problem through negotiations. At the FCO, were taking into consideration that the importance of Albania for the Great Britain and the West was small, until the moment she was totally independent and would stay out of the Soviet orbit. On the contrary, the Soviet presence in Albania, would be followed by unpleasant measures of the West and the undo of the existing balance, while the strategic advantage would pass on the side of the USSR. The reduction of the Chinese interest for Albania, or their withdrawal, would increase the pressure over the internal and foreign policy of the Albanian government and would bring changes in its governance. Gradually, Albania would open towards the West.

The Albanian government at the beginning of the '70s also was informed about the polls and the request of the Federal Republic of Germany to establish diplomatic relations. It seemed that the new political developments that the European continent was living as "Détente", the improvement of the East-West relations, the project of the Conference of Security and Co-operation in Europe and the establishment of the diplomatic relations between China and Germany, would lead Albania towards the improvement of relations with this country. In 1972, the Albanian embassies in Vienna and Beijing delivered a message of the Western German diplomats to the Albanian Foreign Ministry for establishing diplomatic relations with Albania.³¹ The German initiative wouldn't get finalized, because the Albanian government put as prior condition the solution of the reparations problem of the War and after would proceed with the establishment of the diplomatic relations. The western Germany's government came to

³¹ *AMPJ*, V. 1972, D. 300.

know about the Albanian claims on the reparations [who was over 2 billion US\$ of the 1938], on September 28, 1973, during the 28th session of the UN's General Assembly.³² After this step, the Albanian government tasked some ministries to prepare a study on the history of this problem and for the amount of the reparations that would be asked to Western Germany, adding to the above-mentioning number even the harms caused to various persons [killed, wounded, deported, and the gratis job done from the latter]. Nonetheless the difficulties arisen from the lack of diplomatic relations between the two countries, the Albanian government expressed the readiness to directly negotiate [without the help of a mediator] with the German side.³³ The process remained frozen for a while, because the Western German government considered incompatible the Albanian demand on the London agreement of 1953, which conditioned the solution of reparations with the signed Peace Treaty with Germany.³⁴ Regardless the refusal of the Albanian government because the decisions of Treaty of London were not compulsory for Albania because she had not signed it, the German government did not withdraw from its position, declaring that the Treaty of London was compulsory for Germany. The amount asked from the Albanian government was exaggerated and unrealistic. On June 28, 1975, it asked to the German side reparations of 4,5 billion US\$.³⁵ The Albanian diplomacy considered as harmful for the DDR the Bonn-Moscow treaties of the 1971 and the agreement reached between the two German states,³⁶ which opened the way towards the recognition of the DDR borders, its international recognition, and also the easing East-West tensions. Enver Hoxha also criticized the Helsinki Conference, because according to him, it “harmed” the DDR's interests

³² AQSH, F. 14/AP, p. 1, “Information on the reparations from Germany”, Mehmet Shehu to Enver Hoxha, on February 7, 1974.

³³ *Ibid.*, pp. 5-6.

³⁴ Matthias Dornfeldt, Enrico Weewald, “Rivendosja e marrëdhënieve diplomatike mes Republikës Federale Gjermane dhe Republikës Popullore të Shqipërisë”, in *Shqipëria në Marrëdhëniet Ndërkombëtare*, Tiranë: AIS, 2013, pp. 272-273.

³⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 272; Hamit Kaba, “Dëshmshpërbliet gjermane të Luftës së Dytë Botërore për Shqipërinë (1945-1990)”, in *Studime historike*, nr. 3-4, Tiranë: 2001.

³⁶ TNA, FCO 21/560, Year 1977, “Hope for changes in the Albania's foreign policy”, August 5, 1977.

³⁶ AMPJ, V. 1971, D. 670, pp. 167-121, Report of the Albanian ambassador from Belgrade, Dhimitër Lamani for MPJ, nr. 27/9, 21.09.1971.

and would not solve the German problem. Indeed, one of the articles of the Helsinki Charter, accepted the peaceful union and the change of borders without violence between the countries, charter that also opened the path for the reunion of Germany. This article was approved with the special insistence of the German Federal Republic representatives in Helsinki, but also of other Western countries including the USA and France.

The political development of Albania after the break up with China in the summer of 1978, proved the above-mentioned hypotheses of the FO about Albania. The interruption of the economic and military aids of 1978, left Albania without a big international support and without enough substantial and existential sources. For the first time since the end of the Second World War, Albania would have to survive in the following years without the support of a big ally country. The policy followed by the Albanian government, further isolated the country, even why she tried to harshly control every inner source, applying the principle "relying on our forces," calling on Albanian conscience and pride, and pretending that Albania was the purest Marxist-Leninist country in the world.

Independence and self-isolation (1979 -1990)

The break of Albanian-Chinese relations in July 1978 and the situation established in Albania was awaited with concern in the West. The State Department increased the interest on Albania and her political and economic future. The American press that in a certain way followed the official opinions of the American policy, was making prognoses about the future developments in Albania. In the beginning that were hopes that Albania might get closer to the West and USA, but the Stalinist leadership of Albania choose the path of refusing having relations with USA and the Soviet Union. Doubts and concern for the American policy was the fact that Albania might come back to the Soviet Union and Warsaw Treaty. Such an alternative would threaten the independence of Albania and would put USA in a unfavorable situation, because would crack all the balances established in Europe and would harm the southeastern flank of NATO, making more fragile

the Italy's and Greece's defense.³⁷ In the present circumstances, the USA add the efforts to better know the situation within Albania, together with its economic and political inclination,³⁸ about the degree of the Soviet influence, with its capability and military determination, to face a possible aggression from the Soviet Union, or face to face with Yugoslavia.³⁹

At the service of this policy were taken some official actions to re-establish the diplomatic relations; were encouraged the western countries to approach with Albania [especially the Federal Republic of Germany and the Great Britain]; were made efforts to offer Albania economic, financial and technological aid; was put on alert the Northern Treaty Organization to analyze the hypothetical situation that might be created in case of any possible attack from the part of the Soviet Union and of the Warsaw Treaty against Albania etc. On February 1981, in the American television the program on Albanian language begun to be broadcasted, and a year later, some Albanian-American Albanologist, chaired by Nikolla Pano founded the Albanian Center Studies.⁴⁰ Sami Repishti, Nikolla Pano, Peter Prifti etc., members of this Center, published critical articles towards the pretentions of the Greek lobby in America, about the “especially bad” and “discriminated” treatment the Greek minority was facing in Albania and on the exaggerated increased number of the Greeks in Albania etc. Some of the unfair pretentions of the Greek lobby took place even in the official reports of the State Department.

The Albanian community in the USA, strongly embraced the idea of re-establishment of the diplomatic relations with Albania. The articles that echoed this idea were published in “Dielli” and “Liria.” The USA [according the American press] supported the Albanians demonstrations and their principal request for a “Republic of Kosova.”

³⁷ *AMPJ*, V. 1979, D. 730, p. 6, Report of Abdi Baleta from New York for MPJ, August 2, 1979.

³⁸ *Ibid*, V. 1979, D. 742, Telegram of Nesip from Bucarest for MPJ, nr. 1718, on December 6, 1979.

³⁹ Paskal Milo, “Politika e Jashtme e Shqipërisë në vitet 1980-1990”, in *Historia e Popullit Shqiptar*, vëll. IV, Tiranë: Toena, 2009, p. 331.

⁴⁰ *AMPJ*, V. 1982, D. 1212, p. 4, Telegram of Abdi Baleta from New York for MPJ and Ramiz Alia. The Association of Albanian Studies according to Nikolla Pano had 54 Albanian Albanologist, among them even Elez Biberaj.

In the USA and in the West was circulating the idea of establishing a “diplomatic defense corridor” for Albania. In April 1980, assistant secretary of the State Department Robert Barry, willingness of the State Department to establish diplomatic relations with Albania.⁴¹ Some senators, congressmen and high American officials made efforts to visit Albania, for “paving the way” for the improvement of the relations between the two countries. A special will on this issue was seen from the senator Claiborne Pell [member of the Senate Committee for Foreign Relations], who from 1977 onwards, contacted once and again with the Albanian Mission in the United Nations in New York and some other missions in Europe. At the letter he personally addressed to Enver Hoxha on 1978, the American senator stressed the need for the beginning of bilateral negotiations, that would take on the re-establishment of the diplomatic relations. He expressed the desire to make a “private visit” in Albania. Though, the letter and the efforts of the American senator remained unanswered. The American senator not only wouldn't obtained an Albanian visa, but had to face also the insulting and not at all diplomatic behavior of some important representatives of the Albanian diplomacy in the world⁴².

On March 1982, the under-secretary of the State Department, Scalan, turned again on the idea of establishing contacts with Albania. While the former president Nixon on July 1982, asked the mediation of Ceausescu to visit Albania, aiming to normalize the relations between the two countries.⁴³ The Ministry of Foreign Affairs, taking advantage from these offers, sent some circulars to the Albanian diplomatic representatives in January-August 1982, notifying that recently the USA “have intensified their efforts to enter in contact with our country, official American representatives have made direct efforts to visit

⁴¹ *AMPJ*, V. 1980, D. 744, p. 15, Telegram of the Albanian Mission in Budapest for MPJ, on June 19, 1980.

⁴² *Ibid*, V. 1980, D. 746, pp. 7-10, Telegram of Abdi Baleta from New York to the MPJ, nr. 42, on January 11, 1979. At the letter that Claiborne Pell sent to Abdi Baleta, on January 1, 1979 it is emphasized an interesting fact: Pell pretended, that in 1946 he was appointed from the State Department as the third secretary of the US embassy to be established in Tirana. But, nonetheless the embassy was not opened, Pell was appointed in Prague.

⁴³ *AMPJ*, V. 1982, D. 830, p. 67, Telegram of Reiz Malile to all the Albanian missions, on July 2, 1982.

Albania.”⁴⁴ It was advised to study in details “every US step towards Albania and the West reactions” and to specify the known stand, as stated by Enver Hoxha, “emphasizing that nothing has changed and will ever change in our attitude towards them.”⁴⁵

Some American newspapers wrote about the interests expressed and the offers made from some American companies and banks to grant loans to Albania in technology and exploit of oil fields and minerals. An American company offered technological equipment to still mills of Elbasan that was under construction by the time.⁴⁶ Facing the refusal of the Albanian government and knowing Albania's enormous needs for economic and trade partnership, the American government urged the western countries to co-operate with Albania.

In 1980, the American government [through different diplomatic channels], made public its financial claims towards Albania. They had to deal on after war unpaid expropriations from the Albanian government to the American properties. In 1984, these requests were included in the “7 points proposal,” presented from the French ambassador in Tirana⁴⁷ [who was the mediator] also in the Albanian-British negotiations of 1985-1987. The Albanian government for many years wouldn't recognize these claims and refused to negotiate them with Britain in 1985-1987.

Lacking a better alternative, but without renouncing the demand for rapprochement with Albania, the US considered the current political line of the Albanian leadership in the mid - eighties to for the defense of the independence of the country, and for refusing to come back at the communist countries “family” acceptable. [Marc Palmer, deputy secretary of the State Department] declared on November 1984 that: “The afresh USSR comeback in Albania would threat her independence, so it's in the Albania's interest to protect and defend her independent status, for not becoming a base of the military Soviet aggression in that part of the world.”⁴⁸

⁴⁴ P. Milo, “Politika e Jashtme e Shqipërisë ...”, p. 331-332.

⁴⁵ *Ibid*, p. 332.

⁴⁶ *AMPJ*, V. 1980, D. 746, p. 17.

⁴⁷ Ksensofon Krisafi, *Në kërkim të Arit*, Tiranë: Dita 2000, 2000, pp. 178-179.

⁴⁸ *AMPJ*, V. 1985, D. 872, p. 108, Information of Justin Papajorgji from New York for MPJ, on June 29, 1985.

The USA would continue to be interested about Albania even after the death of Enver Hoxha and the coming into power of Ramiz Alia. The American government followed attentively the developments in Albania, doubting about her future policy towards the USSR and his allies. The concern that the Americans had was bound again with the comeback possibility of Albania within the Moscow's orbit and the disbalance in the region. Under these circumstances, the American government continued to send messages of rapprochement with Albania. Only a day after the death of Enver Hoxha, the State Department declared that: "if Albania wants to establish diplomatic relations, we are ready."⁴⁹

Ramiz Alia was described from the Americans as "a more moderate person, with whom was possible to negotiate and by time the relations would be soften".⁵⁰ Also, it was hoped that Albania would gradually move towards the West and have closer relationship especially with the neighboring countries, Britain and West Germany. However, Ramiz Alia closed in August 1985 the door to the Americans, when he declared that there are not and will not be no kind of relations with the USA. He also wouldn't bring his country within the communist camp, nonetheless the invitations were not lacking from the new leader of the Soviet Union, Gorbachev. The USA and the West appreciated the discrepant stand of Tirana towards the Soviet Union and the countries of the communist block after the death of Enver Hoxha.

In 1985, the American press published articles even for the covert Anglo-American operations to bring down the communist regime in Albania during 1949-1953 and about the negative effects these operations had in both countries. The Albanian government took political and economic advantage of this fact, speaking on the costs that Albania has occurred from the Anglo-American operations and contradistinguished it to the American financial and economic claims. Except lowering the tensions, the State Department continued to keep a critical stand towards the violations of the human rights and the rights of the Greek minority in Albania. Though the unjustified increase of

⁴⁹ *Ibid*, p. 109.

⁵⁰ *Ibid*, p. 62, Telegram of Justin Papajorgji from New York for MPJ, on April 15, 1985.

the number of the Greeks in Albania, concerted by the Greek lobby in America faced against the criticism of the American-Albanians. Albania continued to face harsh critics for the lack of freedom and human rights, for the lack of the religious belief and religious institutions, forbidden since 1967. There were voices on 1987 that was seen a softening policy in the anti-religious campaign. Though, the religious activities continued to be forbidden. In the leading political circles of Albania, were welcomed the resolutions presented by the senators Joseph Dioguardi and Bob Doll on the repression of the Albanians in Yugoslavia.⁵¹

The beginning of the negotiations between the Albanian government with the governments of the Great Britain and of the Federal Republic of Germany in the second half of the '80, showed that the communist regime was making some shy and forced steps towards the West. On 1987, Albania established diplomatic relations with FRG and Canada.⁵² Tirana gave some small signs for a change in the relations with USA. Albanian diplomats as professor Paskal Milo mentions, gave up from the not at all diplomatic behavior and refusal to shake hands or turning the back of their American peers.⁵³ During 1989, the Albanian government left in silence the requests of some important American persons to visit Albania, among them even the congressman of Arbëresh origin Joseph Dioguardi, Joe Kennedy⁵⁴ [son of Robert Kennedy] etc.

The makeup changes made by Ramiz Alia came to end by the events happened in the Eastern and Central Europe and especially from the bloody end of Ceausescu in Romania. On the plenum of April 1989 of the Central Committee of the PLA, Ramiz Alia expressed his readiness to establish diplomatic relations with the USA and the USSR.⁵⁵ Two weeks after, the State Department would declare that "our door is open for the re-establishment of the diplomatic relations, and we are ready to have talks to achieve this goal."⁵⁶ The first

⁵¹ *AMPJ*, V. 1986, D. 689, Report of Reiz Malile for the Central Committee of PLA, on October 2, 1986.

⁵² M. Dornfeldt, E. Weewald, "Rivendosja e marrëdhënieve diplomatike...".

⁵³ P. Milo, "Politika e Jashtme e Shqipërisë ...", p. 332.

⁵⁴ *AMPJ*, V. 1989, D. 793, pp. 2-3, 11.

⁵⁵ *Ibid*, V. 1989, D. 145, p. 21.

⁵⁶ P. Milo, "Politika e Jashtme e Shqipërisë ...", p. 332.

Albanian-American contacts were held in New York and Washington [May and August 1990] and wouldn't give the awaited outcome from the Albanian government, nonetheless Albania gained the observer status at the CSCE and re-established the right of religious belief in the country. The events of the embassies in July 1990 "had frozen" the relations with the Western countries. The USA would ask to the Albanian government to grant pluralism and democracy in the country. Only after the fulfillment of this condition, on 15 March 1991, the American government signed in Washington "The Understanding Memorandum" with the Albanian government for the establishment of the diplomatic relations.

The policy of the Great Britain towards Albania after the collapse of Sino-Albanian relations would walk in the paths of the proper interests, and of the Western allies. It aimed to normalize the relations with Albania and to keep her away from the Soviet influence. The achievement of this goal, differently from USA [that has shut the door] seemed feasible. Though, its achievement made necessary a certain correction of the British formula for solving the past disagreements. The new circumstances established after the Albanian-Chinese relations break off, influenced on some British intellectuals, benevolent to Albania as Martin Moir,⁵⁷ but also to some deputies of these country, to offer Albania a chance and a more acceptable path for overcoming the old disagreements and to establish diplomatic relations. In the House of Commons there were voices that blamed Yugoslavia for the incident of the Corfu Channel, and admitted that the Anglo-American secret services have organized on 1949-1953 covert operations to undermine the Albanian government etc. Nonetheless the British government denied the existence of these operations, continued to take some approach steps towards Albania. The Minister of State, Peter Blaker, on February 25, 1980 expressed the readiness of his government, to re-establish diplomatic relations with Albania, being aware about the obstacles that were on the way. Peter Blaker emphasized that, the Albanian government continued to rebuff the verdict of the Court of Hague to compensate England, and also stressed that, the return of the Albanian gold was not only an issue concerning Great Britain, but also

⁵⁷ *AMPJ*, V. 1980, D. 1158/2, p. 28.

USA and France, as members of the Tripartite Commission. The British minister, for the first time since 1949, came out with a new proposal and different from the previous one. He had the idea of dividing the financial questions, as condition for the re-establishment of the diplomatic relations. On May 19, 1980, Peter Blaker would declare that, "we recently offered to the Albanian government to establish diplomatic relations, without waiting for the solution of the financial problems..., unfortunately Albanians disagree with this."⁵⁸

The new British formula was rejected by the Albanian government. She continued to ask the British government to first return the Albanian gold and then establish diplomatic relations. The efforts of Martin Moir to mediate between the two parts failed. The Albanian government called it a parallel diplomacy and unachievable.

Except the increased economic and political interest of both governments, the trade relations between Albania and Great Britain remained very low. The British exports in Albania for the year 1979 were approximately 700 000 £, while the imports approximately 62 000 £. The British products in Albania were: industrial machineries and equipment's, telecommunication, electrical and manufactured goods, while the Albanian goods were mostly fruits and vegetables.

Regardless, the serious economic, political and social difficulties that Albania was undergoing, the Albanian government was careful and very cautious to open towards Britain and the West. Lacking the possibility of fulfilling direct contacts with Albania, the British and the American governments urged France to take the role of mediator. In April 1984, the French ambassador in Tirana, presented to the Albania's Ministry of Foreign Affairs, "the 7 points proposal", that in essence had the conditions to solve the problem of the Albanian gold. Its solution was conditioned by giving a compensation of 2 million US\$ for both western governments. The Albanian government welcomed the proposal, but disagreed on some points. She asked that the gold should be turned back along with its interests.

With the initiative of the British government was proposed to hold direct negotiations in Paris. The Great Britain took on to made known to the Albanian government even the American financial claims. Nevertheless, the flexibility of the British delegation and the good will

⁵⁸ *Ibid*, V. 1980, D. 1158/2, p. 178, John Briggs for Martin Moir, May 20, 1980.

of the Albanian delegation, the negotiations of the 1985 (March-July) ended with no result. The Albanian delegation as Prof. Ksenofon Krisafi, one of the members recalls, "successfully failed."⁵⁹ The Albanian delegation rebuffed the American demands for compensation and conditioned the establishment of the diplomatic relations with the Great Britain only if the gold was returned together with the interests.

The Albanian-British negotiations would continue in New York in 1987 and 1988. The British proposal in this round of negotiations had a new element to overcome the disagreements: the solution of the Anglo-American pretensions at the same time with the return of the Albanian gold. Though, the Albanian representatives, instructed from the leadership of the country, asked again not to include in the negotiations the American claims. They asked that the British government must first return the gold, to pay the interests, to compensate the country for the covert operations against Albania in 1949-1953 and then to establish diplomatic relations. This attitude turned back the relations between the two countries at the starting point.

The Albanian-British negotiations held in Rome and Geneva in 1990 paved the way to the re-establishment of the diplomatic relations on May 29, 1991 because the principal disagreements were resolved. The problem of the Albanian gold and of the British and American financial claims would ask further negotiations in the future. Both parts claims would finally find solution in 1996-1998, when the gold was returned to Albania.

⁵⁹ K. Krisafi, *Në kërkim të arit ...*, p. 254.

Arian LEKA

SOCIALIST REALISM FACING OTHER SCHOOLS BASED ON REALISM

From a literary and cultural point of view, *realism* is manifested as extremely generalized term, which got along a profusion of colors and refractions as political, also *poetic*, *aesthetic* and *ethic*, and it is outlined as a movement that could easily be established within the historical framework. This means that realism in the artistic and cultural framework can be clearly defined within time-space coordinates, as are clearly defined also under the circumstances that made possible its birth and cultivation.

Perceived as *speech forms*, realism has always been present in literature since the latter has been unraveled as such. Only in the most expressive form, in the aesthetic and poetic outlines, *realism* is accepted since the second half of the XIX century, firstly responding to a specific context of circumstances and historic and social developments.

To systemize the thought in an events' order, it is necessary a theoretical view in a world of ideas, which would offer not only philosophic and scientific support on which realism would rely in art. This panorama wouldn't manifest only the mental energies that were moving in the cells of that society that founded realism, but also in the fact that the framework offers some of the most specific characteristics of realism itself, of social or critic realism and mainly the *descriptive realism*.¹

¹ The term *descriptive realism* does not refer only to the term itself, which is based on the reality and interacts with it, often qualified as "critic realism" and is not connected with the socialist realism, but with the artistic movement of the social realism. The term does not coincides with realism, but with the philosophic concept that explains the relations between "the world as it is" and the definition of that form of the world that does not exist- elsewhere except in the ideas of the perceiver, opposing the *descriptive reality* against the prescriptive reality, dictating in applying a norm, rule or a single method. This

In parallel with the French revolution, that is aligned against the despotic system, influence of which had wide extensions, the Europe of the second half of the XIX century and its aftermath was characterized by a vigorous revolution in the field of economy and production. This development came accompanied also with many other complex developments that directly influenced, and in sensitive way the whole life's spheres of the human activity, including art, culture and literature.

The dynamics of these many social and technological changes influenced the *outlook*, the *ethics* and the *politics* and *society*. So, the society started to have more real relations with its component parts. Meantime the most dynamics, most often and more mutual communication between the cultures made that the *suppositional*, the *whim*, the *fantastic*, the *transcendental*, the *unreal* to make way to the *real*, as the dominant dimension and part of the world's report from there and ongoing.

The society is found in the period of the bourgeois triumph, time when the mentality of the Old Continent starts vigorously run after the idea that, through force, manners and profiting through reason, already offered the possibilities to put under control the entire complicated reality's geography.

There were also from them who openly proclaimed that was a duty of these social strata to rule all the areas of this new reality through industrial endeavors, spirit of exploitation and tools that had started to be offered by sciences and technology, thanks to respective development and carryings. Everything in that time and in those conditions was inclined to be *non-fiction*, but as much as accurate, also including here reality's perception, which since the Aristotle's perception, expressed in Poetics had a special relation in the mimetic arts.

The hearsay stands find their expression on the outline of a new anthropocentric "religion", on the *scientific positivism* movement and spirit, that ruled the whole mentality, culture and the intellectual environment of Europe in that period.

form of realism that takes the image of "the realism in the eyes of the state," finds support among others also in the article, *What's the Matter with Realism*, author Justin Rosenberg: Review of International Studies, "Cambridge University Press", Vol. 16, No. 4, Oct., 1990, p. 285-303.

Abandoning from one side the “romantic” inclinations and aspirations related to the transcendental conditions that should fulfill *sine qua non* every endeavor that aims to achieve the absolute recognition of the reality, as not little devaluating the *willpower's* role and priority, the spirit of the scientific positivism moved the attention in new fields, such as sociology, psychology and political economy, mostly concentrating on *physiological*, *socio-biological* and *evolutionist* forms that the substance and the material world presented, which stand open towards the instantaneous human's empiric experience. All these would establish the causation, the explanation and a layer for reality's flow on *everything* that exists and realism, as theory on the existing one.

The birth and the fast spread of scientific positivism paved the way to the belief without conditions in the power of reason, seen not simply as a time tool, but also as a tool that could free the man and the time mentality as materialist and also epistemological, political, world outlook, ethic and from cultural limitations and restrictions.

The extension and the dimension of this belief were successful in that point that along those years was sometimes hold forth openly and sometimes camouflaged the necessity to detach once and for all from the past, what turned into a *device* for the industrial revolution and, as was later noticed, in every revolutionary form, where we may also include the socialist society, and the literature of the Socialist Realism, which had the task to reflect this society in its process of changing not through the slow, evolution, natural development, but the development through revolution, upheaval of also the reality itself, nevertheless its realism.

The earlier form of world's presentation was mortified in front of the social mentality based on reason's power and not on the “subject's” creative power, as one of the essential tropes of the whole speeches forms of the western romanticism.

Two of the most essential expressions of the romantic *sensibility*, “the fantasy,” or “the vision” of “the creative-artist's subject” were seen from the scientific positivism as part of a limited epistemology, as recognition of an abstract “selfishness,” excessive *individualist* expression and procreation.

Along with them was also considered over-passed and limited that

realism that was found within the spirit as the inspiration of sentimentalism and romanticism.

Instead of a genuine epistemology and *objective*, of a scientific knowledge based on reason, the procreations of this kind were seen as myopic expression inasmuch as couldn't see "in the eye" the reality that flows beyond "the subject's" sphere or experience. Except that, these individual experiences of the "creative subject" were seen as distortions of the real, inasmuch as skip of the human's true relations within reality that lives in.

From this point-of-view, John Ruskin writes that the romantic sensitivity is totally incompetent to narrow us "the change between the usual views, sincere and true on which the things are exposed to us, and unusual or untrue views which they are manifested to us during the time we find ourselves under the pressure of emotions, imagination or fantasy influence."²

Except these, it outlines as *typologies*, also the topology within which it moves the whole literary mentality we are speaking about, confronting us with novelties and innovations, with forerunners and researchers. Thus, for example, before being transformed into essential part of the "realist" mentality, we notice the transcendental entities abandonment, the filling of the narrative scene with heroic events and the "escape from the real and reality", as in the earlier novels of Jane Austen.

Not heroes and heroism anymore, but ordinary and daily scenes, not triumphant characters, with great characteristics, or great spirits, not any more despair and melodramatic people, but people, calculated ones. These are what are offered by the literary times towards the end of the XIX century.

Although this daily characteristic was still ruled also by the creative "subject," mainly in the morality realism *Fichte form* plan, its presence in the narrative scene was no doubt a novelty. Already "lost aureoles", just to cite a Baudelaire's *poème en prose*, the writer dared to set foot even in the unwanted "infamous areas and localities" for the romantics.

The "creative subject" doesn't sing anymore, he just wrote. He had no more inspiration, he just reasoned, leaving behind all that calmness

² J. Ruskin, *Modern Painter*, third edition, "Dent Editions", London, 1970, v. 3, p. 151.

and existence's harmony that "the fantasy" offered him, a poetic topos *par excellence*, to be immersed from this on the chaos, troubles, nightmares and problems that lived in the human's daily settings.

It's exactly this aspect of Jane Austen's novels that succeeded in drawing Walter Scott's attention, which in turn of the 1815 dedicates an essay to her creativity. In this text, Walter Scott tries to put in evidence that with Jane Austen's narration, the novel written in English had started to enter a new phase, in a phase where all the melodramatic extravagances of the gothic novel and of the romantic narrations were being replaced from a writing style that was heralded more vivid and more attractive thanks of trying "*new paths of the ordinary life, the life we live and face every day.*"

While strongly appreciates the inclusion in the narrative scene of the low strata life of the society and of farmers, Scott stands into another aspect of the Austen's creativity, while writes: "The narration that we observe in her novels is formed by so ordinary events that to anyone, include them that are not able to read, could have caught the eye; *dramatis personae* that we meet in the pages of that novels acting in bases of a variety of motives and principles that for the reader it's easy to understand and see as very close with the motives and principles that also lead the behavior and the stand that this presents in his daily life."³

Nonetheless the term "realism" is not used in any part of Scott's essay, the emphasizing on "imitation" / imitation by nature, imitation after an effigy", or on the importance that the artistic narration should dedicate to the "credibility" poetics (of being credible), as the direction to embrace in the narrative scene *events from the daily life*, preliminarily confront us with the principals *tropes* from which the writers and the realism's aesthetics were led in the second half of XIX century France.

* * *

Going back to the *European typology*, the thought goes on Émile Zola, the theoretical outliner and the main promoter of "naturalism," one of the most remarkable events of realism placed in chronology. In effort to theoretically outline his promotions in the field of literature,

³ W. Scott, *The Art of Copying From Nature – Review of Jane Austen's Emma*, in: Sir Walter Scott: *On Novelists and Fiction*, "Routledge", London 1968, p. 230.

Zola affirms that his “naturalist” novels *should be seen* as “experimental” essays.

In Zola's pen, the “experimental” predicate is fluctuated in a double meaning: *first*: as literary essay based on the direct and instant experience and *secondly*: in the meaning that the *literary method* (naturalist),⁴ that he was trying to outline, should be concentrated in a plurality of typical characters of a special social environment and *well-documented*, to see from there what can happen after. This method, according to Zola, “is all the truth that can be opposed to romanticism dreams.”⁵ From this framework, the naturalist novel requires to enter in the narration scene, not simply only to tell, not simply by offering a spectacle and to please the curiosity and society's *voyeurism*, but also to change it and the world this society was living in.

From this comes the inclination to be based in the historical present, in the present of the time which the writer lives and in the end is nothing more but “the whole truth can oppose romanticism dreams.”

Such an inclination which is difficult to find on romanticism literary carryings, is what pushed Karl Marx to place himself in defense of French realism.⁶ This approach confronts another approach, respectively the putting on guillotine of the “creative subject”, of that dimension that is presented as individual and together with it also are put in guillotine the creative capabilities of the narrative-subject.

Differently from romanticism, realism does not tries only to reduce the role of the “creative subject”, of “mind” or creative “conscience”, but also to annihilate it. The realism has gone as far as to affirm that the true “novelist” is not “the author”, the name of whom stands out in the front cover of the book, but the society. So, we find it expressed in the *Foreword*, that he wrote for the *Human Comedy* Balzac himself, the writer that more than anyone aimed to prepare the way of aesthetic outline of the realist novel, basing quite well on the principles and on the “scientific” approach that positivism searched to cultivate in

⁴ See É. Zola, *Méthode de travail et style*, Lettre du 27 juin 1890 à Jules Héricourt, un ami écrivain.

⁵ É. Zola, *Documents littéraires: Œuvres complètes*, “Bernouard”, Paris, 1988, vol. 45, p. 151.

⁶ Compare Geörgy Lukács, paper on Balzac and French realism, *Theories of Authorship*. John Caughie, “Routledge”, London & New York, 1984, p. 8-15.

relation with the social sphere and with its presentation in *objective* way.

This would definitively bring the creative “subject's” displacement from the epicenter on which the romanticism has place it, towards the less important centers, or the entire periphery of the works, as affirm some realistic novel formations, where the character is almost never a “me” - “subject” - “author”, but almost always a “he”, or as its almost presented in the poems of Socialist Realism, where the author's “I” is replaced with “We” and “You”, through which the author's voice is lost among the mob's voices, until is changed in spokesman, masses agitator. The putting of realities in important centers or this forced displacement from the peripheries in the Socialist Realism with essential characteristic: there is no more a periphery, the periphery disappears, and the non-urban centers are epicenter of the social attention.

Such realism's inclination of those years was seen as unavoidable, as long as in a form or another, the sciences achieved not less influencing the intellectual environment of the time and its approach towards the reality. From this point-of-view, except the radical changes of the daily life not only of the bourgeois strata, but of the entire human society, all this vigorous development brought from time to time also the birth and crystallization of an *entirely* new reality, which started to respond – for didactic reasons rather than nature's ones – a new mentality, a new cultural, ethic and aesthetic world outlook spirit. What does this means: within the context we are explaining, the changes we are talking about do not source from the nature of the art itself as such.

Also, they were not presented as a simple consequence of the fact that in the conditions in which the artist was forced to already work were radically changed, as were also changed in the same dimensions the tastes and the interests of the readers' communities. To the entirely new reality of this realist art would lack the orderer, the patronage, an element this that after the consumer's discovery, would know a comeback with the Socialist Realism, where the orderer / patronage would become the state.

Mostly, all these changes came as part of the development and spread of plurality of unknown technological novelties, unknown and unimaginable before, as of the effects and potentials that these novelties

were putting in motion, among which would be enough to mention the development that the *photography* was having, which was spread and extended with velocity in all the settlements of the Old Continent.

The photography, photographing, concreteness, pictures multiplication, of peoples and subjects, and especially of the art's works, as their imprint in time-space unmovable and unchanged, spontaneously brought a radical change of the way of *life's perception* from the individual.

Always more and more he filled his world and experience with the photographic presentations of the surrounding reality. These presentations, in the final analyses manifest a high degree of *objectivity*, or, said in the literature's terminology theory, a high degree of *realism*, that does not despises the imagination and the creation, but avoids fantasy.

* * *

As it's already known, romanticism was one of the "sons" of idealism outlined by Immanuel Kant. In essence of this idealism stood the pure *epistemological* definition after which "the world that surrounds us and the things that live or exist within are objectively unreachable from men's mind and reason." The *objective* recognition of reality is impossible, as long as the relation we have with this reality is not direct, but indirect, interceded from "the views" that "the mind" creates in relations with it.

All the knowledge about this reality is nothing more, but some possible procreation from these "views" that is projected within man's "mind" or "awareness." They are just outer expressions of an inner process, *subjective*.

In opposite movement towards this world outlook and epistemological behavior, *realism first moved away romanticism abstraction and metaphysic spirit*. Instead of idealism's *epistemological pessimism*, hold forth that the *objective presentation* of the reality is totally possible. A way of applying this method was first moving away the approached *subjectivism*, something that coincides in essence with the total devaluation of the definitive role on which was the individual clad by idealism's spirit and world outlook.

In this point the explanation can go even further, towards “author's institution” terms⁷ or towards “author's death.”⁸ From this direction, realism understood that the true epistemological problem didn't stood on *reality's complicated form*, but on the individual's *recognized weight and importance*. After this stand, the reality could be *objectively* presented only when the *creative mind* can turn to zero.

The definitive role of the presentation of the *creative mind*, from which sources also the *depersonalized* spirit, could also be seen as extreme expression of the “creative subject,”⁹ meaning that at the end “death of the creative subject” and exposure of the narration scene from every kind of personal sentimentalism. However, was also a sort of creative model of the Socialist Realism by applying the hackneyed technology reality, reproduced and reproducing *happy end* and *ready-made*?

In the presentation made to reality, the realist author (or subsequent that of the Socialist Realism) should have been the same in role with the photograph: more than abstracting, he should offered a framework of the objects, phenomenon and persons existence, from which comes the distinction what realism manifests towards romanticism in the poetic plan.

Meanwhile, in the romantic prose we have the triumph of the *introspection*, of the inner meditation, while in the case of the realist prose we have the triumph of *descriptive narration*¹⁰ and of the direct experience, because totally different from romanticism, which was heavily running after the evoking, realism perceived by mostly being grasped at the present events and not so rarely to the future, dedicating a lot of attention to the society, rather than individual endeavors.

⁷ Explained term in the work *Theories of Authorship*, John Caughie, “Routledge”, London, 1984.

⁸ For more see also R. Barthes, *The Death of the Author*, “Aspen”, nr. 5-6, 1967 and also M. Foucault, *What is an author?*, Paris, 1967, “Basil Blackwell”, Oxford 1977.

⁹ About the opinions on *author's dilemma* (Foucault), *author, authority, institution and author's identity as social outcome* (Barthes), except the philosophers and the scholars have said their word also writers as S. Mallarmé or M. Proust, which were included in the author's de-canonization, as romantic concept, that has survived in new versions (Creator, Demiurge, Genius). See also J. Derrida: *The Law of Genre*. “Universite de Strasbourg”, 4 - 8 juillet 1979, p. 203-233.

¹⁰ G. Lukács, *Telling or Describing? – On the Discussion about Naturalism and Formalism*, “Merlin Press”, Manchester, 1971, p. 130-142.

Such an inclination changed the art from an artistic creation in a *sociologic* approach, and except that, from a limited elite consume production, in a wide and pan social consume, that also created a new dimension that was lacking till then – the mass of the readers in socialism and the massive reader of nowadays.

From here on, the literature starts to be seen as communication possibility with the masses. All the presented potential of the literature was densely exploited in the case of the literatures that had as target the masses, even on those that “will come after” or “future statesmen”. All that had been a *genuine art*, the Socialist Realism turned it into a propaganda tool and an efficient weapon to change the social classes’ conscience.

Thanks to this inclination, realism was seen even in the stylistic plan. First place here has the narration linear structure, the dense use of epithets, exclamatory register, the majestic modus and especially, in a very expressive way, the names as a not simple category and only grammatical ones, but firstly and all as conceptual category, paving the way to one of the most cultivated tropes of this literary speech, as an example of synecdoche, *plurality singular*, the melting of subjectivism through displacing the subject from individualism identity, in the *universality* anonymity (figures, or typical characters of a society, which Zola speaks as above-mentioned, thing that in the literature of the Socialist Realism method are found as figures of the positive hero and of the negative one.

II. Realism: a speech form vs. forms speeches

However, every period, every trend or critic school, also every mentality and way of thinking, follows the proper forms and way to approach a specific reality. Mostly this serves in those cases when this “reality” responds a plurality of cultural, aesthetic and literary developments, which are expression and direct outcome of this mentality, of this way of thinking and approaching.

Seen in itself, the phenomenon of *reality’s approach*, which incarnates the whole developments or the entire “creative evolution” of the human spirit, if we would say it in Henry Bergson’s quasi Darwinian “biological” dictionary, confronts us with a wide picture of

“similarities” and “changes”, “appurtenances” and “confrontations”, “conformities” and “deviations”, “acceptances” and “exclusions” between ages, trends, schools, mentalities, thought forms and different acceptances towards the reality, from those which put in motion the Dialectical essence, to already express with a classical Hegel’s term.

Such a phenomenon – *the phenomenon of approaching to reality* – seems that is symptomatically circumscribed also to the theme’s object, expressively to realism in general, to descriptive realism and then to Socialist Realism as creative method, inclined towards the objective reflection of reality and of humans’ life.

As consequence of forces pressure and of “evolutionist” logic that live within the epoch’s horizon and of modernist and postmodernist mentality, realism seems to have experienced a season of truly febrile paradoxes. Meantime, the Socialist Realism is heralded as exceptional and exaggerated form, or as a “bifurcation” of that mentality and culture movement started since the second half of the XIX century: of romantic pathos expression, or of “reality’s romantic expression”, which the author feels with a total objective analyzes, as Timofeyev wrote in the paper “Socialist Realism” that is published in the journal *Literatura Jonë/Our Literature* of 1947, offered to the Albanian writers as the only supreme form of reality reflection.

From one side, except the disagreements, reserves and dissatisfactions, nourishing towards the realism in literature, Bertolt Brecht – one of the most representatives and distinguished followers of the realist school – raises his voice to the need for the right attention to this art inclination, seen in its all amplitude and plans in which was presented. “Realism is not a thematic that is simply circumscribed and only in literature, on the contrary, is one of the greatest and sharpest themes of the political realm, of philosophy and daily life, and exactly for this reason deserves to be searched and explained in all the composite essence, nature and its inclinations, what would not little enrich the curiosity, and the general interests of man.”¹¹

From the other side, badly oppressed, also from the romanticism freshness and aesthetic code, also from the modernism and postmodernism novelties, descriptive realism – the same as his sisters,

¹¹ B. Brecht, *Against Georg Lukács*, published in: *Aesthetics and Politics*, p. 72.

naturalism and realism – continuous appeal the interest and the curiosity of literary critique. Except the approaches as exotic curiosities, statistical or “stigmatizing”, this thematic until today is considered as an outdated study object or of second hand.

To understand this disregardfulness, of avoiding from examination or oblivion, enough to remember the fact that even today, in the literary speech and discourse that is developed about this theme in Albania, the mentioning of terms as “socialist realism”, “soc-realism”, or “realsoc” is almost accompanied with unavoidable pejorative description.

This description, in the way how is prescribed and not for terminological unification with the European or eastern critique schools, does not simply plays the predicate's ordinary role, but of the ontological indicator, that defines the *status essendi* of a meaningful literary reality.

In the most of the cases the today judges have insisted and pretend to keep a disdainful distance from the Socialist Realism thematic and especially from that kind of creative method realism, which the researcher Rachel Bowlby qualifies as “The tired out old realism. It is outdated and of second hand. Dismembered between the romanticism freshness and modernism innovation, is truly the tasteless food of the literary and cultural sandwich.”¹²

This stand, and at the same time intellectual curiosity, finds argumentation on the paradoxes that presents the Socialist Realism in itself, starting from his show only for a part of a literary world, so only for the communist East and in some close or farther circles.

Although it was framed within the creative method, without achieving to present itself as school or literary movement, the Socialist Realism remained a phenomenon in its knowledge, but not in the recognition and application in Western Europe, of hers critique system and of the relation with the reader. This because the literature of Socialist realism was presented, exposed and was more interested only towards the local reader, the novels of this method that describe the reality in its revolutionary development, were little translated in the

¹² R. Bowlby, *Adventures in Realism. Introduction: Reclaiming Realism*. “Blackwell”, 2001, p. 8.

West, were not distributed and timely read, but only when the method together with the system supporting it, fell.¹³

However the modernist and postmodernist judgment on perceiving the reality, the real and realism, nevertheless the disagreements that come from the method's researchers, as the case of Bertolt Brecht regardless from the silences, bypasses or coolness of the wish of today critique to take into examination the corpse of Socialist Realism, is worth the affirmation that *realism itself has been and remains a condition and permanent presence on arts and especially in literature*.

The within literary developments and the passing in modernism showed that the relation with realism is totally re-concept, this realism is radically touched, taking into examination not only the reflection of reality, but of the entire *realist project*. Nonetheless were asked changes, re-conceptions and re-nominations of realism, never was went that far to fully interrupt the relation and the dialogue with it.

In her work entitled, "*Interrupted Dialogues of Realism and Modernism: The fact of new forms of life, already born and active*", the researcher Esther Leslie, about this issue, writes that in some important contexts, modernism and realism are put in dialogue, even because later, specific forces, especially those that in the name of understanding with the audiences, aligned against the experimental art, of favorable political realism, interrupt, deny or oppress that conversion.¹⁴

From here, the definition of realism as a situation and permanent presence could be attached to the conclusion that realism, nonetheless the abstraction, *except a relation with the reality, is almost an unavoidable constant*. This affirmation does not undermine the qualification of realism as some acceptable form of art at all, and less the giving of precedence in relation with the contemporaneous social reality reflection.¹⁵

¹³ About the argument see B. Taylor, *Adventures in Realism*. "Blackwell Publishing", 2007: Socialist Realism: "*To depict reality in its revolutionary development*", Chapter 8, p. 142-157.

¹⁴ E. Leslie, *Adventures in Realism. Interrupted Dialogues of Realism and Modernism: "The fact of new forms of life, already born and active."* Chapter 7, p. 125-141.

¹⁵ On the qualified terms see Chapter 11 of the publishing *Adventures in Realism*. Michael Löwy. *The Current of Critical Irrrealism: "A moonlit enchanted night"*, p. 193-205.

Realism presents as an open and modified project, without taboos, which is presented as an epistemological category adapted and organized in aesthetic terms, as mot-à-mot says the critic Fredrik Jameson. This reality that is concept and re-concept and reworded in productive way, paves the way to always new perceptions, that are not conditioned from the reflection of any special form, exceptional and exclusive of a specific reality.

The multifarious presence of the real and of realism in literature has left its trace on what we perceive as realism and realist reflection, who has modeled our concept on reflection theories and in the final analyses has played a role, for not saying that has paved the way to all the realism forms, including here the *Socialist Realism*.

At this point becomes necessary to be observed a more persistent terminological clarification between the *Socialist Realism* – as creative method, mainly applied in the countries of Eastern Europe and in those countries in the West, where existed communist parties and *social realism*, as artistic movements mainly expressed through visual arts and other forms of realistic art. Also should be made the distinction even between them and real-socialism in ideology and politics.

This approach, this presence, this relation and especially this constant of realism has attracted the attention of left ideologues that founded the model framework and established the bases of that aesthetics that would be at the foundations of the so-called *art of Socialist Realism* and intellectual freedoms, the creative freedom and the artistic conscience were seen connected with the political conscience –in our case revolutionary – searching a realist ideology nourished from the characters narrative stereotypes, circumstances and typical scenes.

Through them, the theorists of the Socialist Realism creative method established the displacement, for not saying one of the greatest upheavals, that have ever happened in the history of the letters – that of bureaucracy superiority over the artist, of art's orientation and his placement in function of serving at the benefit of proletarian culture, the division of writers not according to the aesthetic relevance, the spiritual submission of the intellectual in the totalitarian countries, their obedience towards the ideology and putting their creativity at its service. All these displacement brought consequences in the creativity

of the official logocracy what exactly Leon Trotsky would see as a “sort of concentration camp of the artistic literature.”

Although it is mostly *presented as symbolic rather than metaphoric*, it's interesting to follow the evolution of the theory started by Marx's proposal at the press of the time, during 1843, so five years before the publishing of the Communist Manifesto.

Expressing himself against the censorship, Karl Marx also offers his concept towards the culture, artistic expression and intellectual freedom. The promise for a wide specter or specter's enlargement and multicolored presentation of the reality is concluded with the *grey presentation* theses, as the true color of freedom and in the recommendations that after the reflection of the whole spectrum of colors which are reflected, the peoples and objects reflected on these multicolored reflections “should” produce only “official colors”, because “every drop of dew on which the sun shines, shines in an inexhaustible game of colors, but the spiritual sun, nevertheless how many are them what kind of objects are, on which the dew has been reflected, should produce only official colors!”¹⁶

III. The ontological essence of reality and the realism in the Albanian literature until the end of the '40s

Under the aforementioned chronology becomes understandable why the relations between previous movements and schools with romanticism, realism and after with socialist realism, would be push-pull, lived within the big literary framework, but also within substrata of the Albanian realist art.

An explanation about the process derives from the fact that preference didn't happened only between two models realism / romanticism, but between socialist realism and that special form of conditioned romanticism as “revolutionary romanticism”, expressed as demand also for the Albanian literature after 1945.

Formulated like this, it's seen also in the advisory / commanding

¹⁶ J. Ph. Kain, *Marx and modern political theory*, Chapter III, Capitalism and Diversity, p. 264.

paper of Lame Kodra.¹⁷ However this article wouldn't be the first and not the last among the cases to express the need of returning to a new side literature, to join the literary instant trends. Approaches of the above-mentioned ideas moved along from many times and were even published in the Albanian press nearly ten years earlier than Lame Kodra's proclaimed new arts orientation.

Nonda Bulka could be considered as one of his predecessors. Through the published article in *Minerva* on 1932, he had articulated the necessity for Albanian literature to have a remodeling under the encouragement of the foreign factor.

Such an encouragement should be conceived not only as a spirit or foreign trends import, not just imitation of models values subjects and characters, but at the same time also as internal movement of the Albanian literature itself and of the transforming Albanian reality.

The article entitled "Horizonte të reja/New horizons" openly expresses the demand of a "new art" and together with it the wish to see the Albanian authors as "promoters of a "new world". Nonetheless is early for the Albanian literary trends and critics to express contemporaneity for what is happening, at least in part of a literary world, is seen that the terms also the reflections of the "promoting writer" and of the "new world" respond to an immediate reality, actual and direct with what was happening in the communist East and in the western countries, that at least had a communist party.

Also in the examples that are offered in the paper mainly coincide with the list of the authors aligned in favor of the left ideas, among which Nonda Bulka refers "...a Roland in France, a Ada Negri in Italy, Mann in Germany, Shaw and Wells in England, Gorky in Russia, Dreiser and Sinclair in America, Unamuno in Spain, Tagore in East...."¹⁸

More than a wish, the author of the paper expresses the necessity for a change in arts, because "...our homeland would need vivid works, more modern, more suitable, that the people in parallel with the art, should also exercise the logic", nonetheless the term "modern" is used in an open meaning, to undermine not the modernity at its helm, but the

¹⁷ See the paper entitled, "Roli i kulturës në Shqipërinë e sotme", *Bota e Re*, No. 1, Tiranë, 1945.

¹⁸ See N. Bulka, *Vepra të zgjedhura*, "Rilindja", Prishtinë, 1969.

works with a new content.

However, in parallel of the demand to approach the Albanian literature towards the not only European trends, are also seen rebukes to what was been written in Albanian, especially towards the situation of the literature in general.

The general panorama around the author of the time, presents the writer “*hiding after the romantic literature, where you can find every shame and immorality*”, as P. Jakob Marlekaj wrote in “Hylli i Dritës”¹⁹.

Filip E. Ndocaj supports the idea for a change in arts, and in the paper “Literatura ç’asht, si asht’ e si duhet të jetë/What is the literature, how it is, and how it should be”, published in “Fryma”,²⁰ writes that “our desire is to open new literary horizons.” Insisting to come closer to the European trends, the author emphasizes that “the new literature, poor in style and perhaps not polished” should raise its claims towards the “art’s” sublimity and the aesthetic beauty in essence and form.

Is noticed that between 1932 and 1944 the compass arrow of the literary orientation has not yet been positioned, because from one side is asked promotion towards the new art on Gorky and R. Roland based on realism and from the other side, is insisted the immediate division from the romantic spirit and is advised the aesthetic beauty in essence and form.

It becomes understandable, why the demand for daily realism would become insisting, as could be imagined also the reason why realism came late in the Albanian literature scene. From one side are faced rebukes towards the Albanian authors, especially lyrics, mentality of which “is full for feelings and little real in general.”²¹ From the other side the breathing of something new that was being approached in the literary horizon, as it's seen in the dense uses of the terms realism, real and reality, as in the cases when Luigj Gurakuqi’s creativity is defined under the “bitter reality’s weight”, that offers “tragic fate...to all the Albanian idealists.”

The term *realism* itself seems that has not still taken place in the

¹⁹ J. Marlekaj, *Shkrimtarët e sotëm*, “Hylli i Dritës”, No. 12, 1933, p. 564.

²⁰ F. E. Ndocaj, *Literatura ç’asht, si asht’ e si duhet të jetë*, “Fryma”, No. 1, Shkodër, Kallnuer (January) 1944, p. 13.

²¹ See I. Bebeziqi in *Revista Letrare*, No. 12, Tiranë, 1944.

critics articulation, because even in those cases when are collected some scarce trends of realism (as those that notices Kolë Ashta, on the prose “Shpija e jeme/My home” of Kolë Thaçi, where the author “with real expressions, describes the home” and is inclined from the “same real spirit” also in the other prose “Pusatari”), term used in the photographic reflection context of reality and not as a part of some literary movement based on realism, as for example the social realism.

Likewise, also the use of the term “modern” refers to the local definition, as in Koliqi’s prose case of Koliqi’s proses where is distinguished the “modern precision”, as Ashta says, compared with what is considered “new art” for the Albanian letters compared with “Mjeda’s classic plasticity”.

Already are observed the delays phenomena disparities of literary vectors of what was considered “new art for the Albanian letters and what this art represented in front of new movements, that have occurred in the European literature, such as futurism, dadaism or surrealism which were codified and through manifests had taken canonical shape, but during the years we are referring, they still has not taken place in the Albanian letters.

Such observations continue until Migjeni shows up. For Migjeni’s prose at that time is written that “are full of shuddering realism, where are breathing scenes of our world in all the cruelty of misery and suffering”²² or that “...the atmosphere in which are brought his persons is a real atmosphere taken from the dense negative life view, with echoes and voices of its world.”²³

The term realism for this author seems that is used as definitive and distinctive instrument, as a phenomenon that had arrived and happened to have concluded its cycle without being properly defined in time what was representing that part of school, trend, literary movement which he could become. Exactly within this literary framework and the demand for a “different art” and “new art”, realism, as artistic, aesthetic and ethic stand trend, begets and is developed in Albania.

In the framework of the Albanian literature “a new style” was noticed that was coming from Migjeni’s creativity, but was especially

²² See the column *Recensime*, published in “Fryma”, No. 5, Tiranë, 1944.

²³ Q. Draçini, *Vepra poetike e Migjenit*, “Fryma”, No. 3, Shkodër, 1944.

emphasized “The new Spirit” that was bringing in the Albanian letters Lasgush Poradeci. Among affirmations and curses, the author’s name was included in the literary polemics of the distinguished voices of the time that, without taking into consideration what was happening in the ‘30s in the European literature, but referring only to the event within the local sphere, they proclaimed modern Lasgush Poradeci.

From the other side, K. Maloki, without denying that Lasgush Poradeci poetry has “also some not at all modern glitters”, said that this “sweet new sweet style (*dolce stil nuovo!*)... we “are taking as an understanding tool and do not forget the centennial and worthy distance between Palestrina, Bach, Frano Asisi, Dante, Petrarca, Boccaccio from one side and Lasgush in the other.”²⁴

Seemed at that time, the most understanding term on realism was reality's photography, as cannot be put out of the attention that during the years we are speaking about, within the Albanian literature, the photography exercised powerful influence and along with it, was praised the faithful description of reality. The effects of this reflection form (photography) were not just seen through the multiplicity reality process, but through the content is offered – of the “objective” presentation of that reality.

This *content*, meaningless and totally banal in first view, as existed in two identical forms, as reality and as “art”, is manifested in definitive truth not only for the fate, but also for the further developments of the whole movements that were outlined under the *realism* emblem, also including what would happened in the Albanian literature after 1945.

It’s already been accepted that the relation between the reality and realism in the Albanian literature has often known reflections and misunderstandings, mostly requiring the photograph rather than realism. Have been not few the cases and these were not only connected with socialist realism and not only in the period after 1945, when the writer has been rebuked that “the examples... taken from the

²⁴ See K. Maloki, *A asht poet Lasgush Poradeci*, “Përpyjekja shqiptare”, No. 25, Tiranë, 1939.

reality, which with the whole rare mastery used by the author, perhaps has not fully pictured all to us as our eyes see it.”²⁵

From this point-of-view, except a logic continuation of what has been required by the literary art, is noticed that from the photography carryings in the time's mentality and culture connected with that who can possibly qualified as epistemological approach to reality, which made it even more distinguishable the belief on realism, derived the opinion that the realism itself could represent a more developed phase in arts.

The nature itself or the realism being was being changed in ontological core and that was perceived from this approach, from realism's mentality and spirit, is manifested as multi-plan confrontation towards romanticism's mentality and spirit, which opposed realism's nature. This expresses the general circumstance that realism was firstly born and developed as a world outlook approach and after as a request for a different aesthetics. The Albanian literature has not escaped from this rule.

Beyond that, this world outlook approach was manifested as world outlook opposition against that world outlook that has outlined romanticism spirit: *the moving away from the real and realism more than moving away from the reality itself*. As such, in the relation with the reality that brings to life realism (as a world outlook approach and as opposition towards it) has been presented by Migjeni's creativity in the press of the time, in which that creativity is praised for "life's hasty presentations" [expressionism?].

Every form of creativity presentation is inclined "to leave its place to reality, gloomy and dark." [social realism?] "Exactly in the scenes of this reality, the poet sees the most sensitive and the most painful inspirations for him"²⁶ [revolutionary romanticism?], as Qemal Draçini wrote on "Fryma", in both issues of 1944, in which the new poet is classified who "enters in the rude reality of life", without expressing if exists other forms of relations between art and reality.

The opening towards the banality and not to the sublime in content, offered again a plurality of problems in the world outlook plan and,

²⁵ O. Plumbi, *Vajza shqiptare dhe problemi i saj*, "Përpjekja Shqiptare", Nr. 25-27, p. 77-78, Tiranë, 1939.

²⁶ Q. Draçini, *Vepra poetike e Migjenit*, "Fryma", No. 3, No.4, Shkodër, 1944.

above all in the epistemological plan, that was happening within the Albanian literature. First, is about for a series of questions that rightfully, can be qualified as ancient as *Homo sapiens* and that were mainly connected with the question of the recognition and of the ontological essence of reality. Such issues, especially connected with those that touch the realism's nature, the influence by the successful European schools, naturalization and the photograph, seems that has not passed without being applied by the authors and either without attention from the literary critique.

Writing about Koliqi's prose, Vangjel Koça notices: "In Koliqi's novel – "Hija e Maleve/the shadow of the mountains" and "Tregtar Flëmujsh/Flags trader" – is evident Maupassant's influence and that of Proust, influence that drained and was melted in Koliqi's artistic personality ... From Maupassant he has taken the naturalist method, not the photographic part – because the art is not a photography –, but mastery to form in few lines faces and circles with natural style that time after time arrives till the classical simplicity, with a sharp objection, which arrives in the Proustian psychological depth. From Proust has learned to enter deep in the fine life and death drama, to make a deep psychological analyzes without using psychology terms."²⁷ This approach towards the reality is also seen in some narrations of Kuteli as, *Qetësi përpara fërtyme*, on which is written that not the reality's views, but "the phraseology is quasi photographic", thing that sounds not only as reproduced reality, but also as linguistic reality reproduction. That reality, that once is seen as "bitter", as on Gurakuqi's creativity and next as "frowned", as on Migjeni, didn't seem enough, because "it's not a critic that condemns and ruins, but a desire for a better reality, it's a denial for a future affirmation, as Qemal Draçini determines it in his article published on "Fryma."²⁸ From here becomes expected that the relations between the reality - realism - and its reflection, to be seen as displayed as confrontation and resemble to a battle that did not happen before: the struggle for realism – not for the plural forms, but for his formalized shape.

²⁷ V. Koça, "Kuvendime të kohës...", *Tomori i vogël*, Nr. 5, Tiranë, 1942.

²⁸ Q. Draçini, *op. cit.*, No. 3, p. 108.

IV. The departure from the real and realism, as form of departure from the reality in the new Albanian literature

Also in this vortex in Albania, the relations that the new art would establish, “the revolutionary art”, “the progressive realism”, “the alive realism, the acting one”, “the new literature”, “the most progressive and the most popular”²⁹ or the Socialist Realism as “faithful reflection of the socialist life that we are building in all its aspects, of colossal material transformations and with revolutionary tempo that our country, our society, our people are living...”³⁰, with the theory, traditions, with the previous realism forms, and especially with the so-called “critic realism” and especially with romanticism, became one of the main troubles of the Albanian writers that took on the job to have the role of warrantors, theoreticians, guarantors, anesthetists, critics, translators and writers role for a new “literary direction.”

About this situation, Sejfulla Malëshova among others said: [We need] “a living realism, acting, revolutionary...” “Not moonlight romanticisms, but romanticism as tendency for a better life is the positive element that enters and becomes integral part in realism.”³¹ Enough to be taken into examination the above mentioned text of Sejfulla Malëshova (at that time member of the Politbureau, Minister of Education and Culture and at the same time Chairman of the League of Writers), entitled “The role of culture in the today Albania”, to understand the change of the semantic register about the art in general and the literary art in particular.

Already published almost six months after the liberation of the country and after the communists seize of power, the written article with the claims of literary program or manifesto, nevertheless the spirit that oscillates between the positive and the preservation of the inner balances and that is put in defense of the Albanian literary tradition of those coryphaeus authors qualified as “national” and “progressive”, it didn’t achieved to be nor neither program, nor manifesto, but remains within the limits and style of a pamphlet.

²⁹ See “Bota e Re”, nr. I, 1945.

³⁰ See *Historia e letërsisë shqiptare të realizmit socialist*, Publishing of the Academy of Sciences and of the Institute of Linguistics and Literature, Tiranë, 1983, p. 15.

³¹ S. Malëshova, *Bota e Re*, monthly cultural journal, Nr. 1, July 1945, p. 14.

From that time the demand towards the Albanian literary art was an argument under modeled discussion as towards an *art in duty*, the art that has obligations and as principal duty to put at the people's service and of the new state interests, thing that was seen as "one of the duties of the intellectual and of the cultural front."³² Through the art could be delivered the directives "On some culture's characteristics about our cultural policy"³³ on the creative method and model and of the superiority not only on "reactionary writers", a term this that lived even after the '90ies³⁴, but remained on the "progressive writers of the '30s"³⁵ which, even why were recognized as revolutionary and "socialist" predecessors, had their limitations, because such weren't in the "political meaning, nevertheless the revolt or the raised fist that sometimes showed."³⁶

Nevertheless, barely after 25 years of the Bolshevik art existence and of Socialist Realism in Russia, it can be said that the Soviet model art was openly recommended to the Albanian writers. "The progressive realism", as expressively recommended, comes undermined through the critic that is made to the "Art for art", clearly expressed in the subchapter "Realism and romanticism"³⁷ or in the following subchapter "Traditions' problem."³⁸

About the issue on realism critical and theoretical examination, also including here the so-called *Socialist Realism*, in a collection of historic documents dedicated to the realism in literature, the researcher George J. Becker affirms that "the thematic on realism do not befit our time literary critic", because already exists another literary critic form, appealed by the impetus, inclinations and other interests, which nonetheless do not oppose realism in the ideological plan, "were bored with it, and reached the conclusion that such a thematic, always simplifier and too lackadaisical, does not deserves anymore the

³² *Op. cit.*, p. 6.

³³ *Ibid*, p. 7.

³⁴ I. Kadare, *Ardhja e Migjenit në letërsinë shqipe*, 8 Nëntori, Tiranë 1991, p. 39.

³⁵ A. Xhiku, *Nga Romantizmi rrjedhave të realizmit*, "Shtëpia Botuese e Librit Universitar", Tiranë 1989, subchapter "Nga romantizmi rrjedhave të realizmit", p. 186.

³⁶ R. Elsie, *Historia e Letërsisë Shqiptare*, "Dukagjini", Tiranë & Pejë, 1997, p. 213.

³⁷ S. Malëshova, *Realizma dhe romantizma*, "Bota e Re" journal, nr. 1. 1945, p. 14.

³⁸ *Ibid*.

attention and the interest of the sharp and penetrating mind of a literary reviewer.”³⁹

V. The Socialist Realism *Ante Portas*

Remains interesting the other fact that the previous realism forms of the XIX and in the beginning of the XX century, realism as a way of thinking and as creative method, are not attacked and ignored only from the modernist and postmodernism.

Paradoxically, realism in itself is attacked also by the theses that connect it with the engaged art, recognizing it as an *insufficient predecessor*. The insufficiency argument of the previous realism and of the entire previous literature, we can meet argued in the text of the scholar Ali Xhiku, almost published in eve of decline of the socialist epoch, where among others the author says: “Realism was the first direction that started to elaborate its aesthetic platform, which confronted the romantic and sentimentalized creativity ...[...] Through it, realism thoroughly investigated the democratic tradition of romanticism and sentimentalism and achieved some results in the artistic reflection of the social phenomena and their moving causes”⁴⁰, thanks to the positioning of “people’s intellectuals”, “progressive romantics”, “realistic authors” and writers with “revolutionary romantic spirit”, inclined by “the bright communist future” and of “the new man”, of “the positive hero”, which romanticism was not only for what is desired, but it is underway of its fulfillment and what is awaited to come”.⁴¹

So it put in evidence that this “simple realism”, without being at the same time socialist, was insufficient for the new reality. From the other side wouldn’t be without interest that, in parallel of tracking realism as “unavoidable”, but also as “insufficient”, to be also investigated the relation that the ideological realism created with the previous literary schools and with some of the leading figures.

Except the direct qualification from a part of that time culture and art institutional leaders, which were qualified as “fascists” and

³⁹ *Ibid.*

⁴⁰ A. Xhiku, *op. cit.*

⁴¹ Compare I.S. Timofeev, *art. cit.*

“reactionary” the stands of some renown writers between the ‘30s and ‘40s, is noticed the defense of the creativity and personality of Faik Konica, Gjergj Fishta and Fan Noli. Especially for these three authors, Sejfulla Malëshova says that “are the greatest figures of Albania in the field of culture”, trying to make possible the involvement of their literary contribution, even partially by criticizing them (“patriarchal life’s idealism”, in the case of Fishta) as part of our literary tradition heritage⁴².

Also the postmodernism, with “the hyper-reality” theory” and “history’s end” has put its opinion to the extreme, not only towards realism and its expressive forms, but also towards modernism that was nothing but its avoidance, qualifying as derivative from the Enlightenment, Marxism, and Industrial Revolution and doomed along with them.

Michael Foucault, Claude Levi-Strauss, Roland Barthes, Jean-François Lyotard, Jacques Lacan, Jacques Derrida, were some of the voices who contributed in the optic enlargement towards realism, freedom, enslaving-dialectics, “political religion” factology, as form of ideological monotheism and of engaged art. In support of their theses are also aligned the researchers Richard Appignanesi and Chris Garratt, by saying: “...constructivism oppression, as a version of non-Marxist formalism [was realized by] heroic realism propaganda art, qualified as Socialist Realism, in the beginning of the ‘30s in the Soviet Union”.

Utopian modernism was rejected in the name of a understandable realism for the masses and easily reproducible for the other countries aspiring communism. Also in the Germany of the '30s, the modern art was proclaimed decadent and forbidden as non-Arian and subhuman. “*The historic realism, mixed with monumentality and a sort of flattering pornography of heroes stylization turned to dogma.*”⁴³ Observed from the optic, would be enough to recall the fact that the postmodernist horizon foundations are raised not only on realism nonchalance, but firstly on denying without conditions all what

⁴² S. Malëshova, *art. cit.*

⁴³ R. Appignanesi, Ch. Garratt, *Postmodernizmi*, “Zenit”, Tiranë 2006. Totalitarizmi Stalinist, p. 29.

compound the essence of the realist mentality, where realism is presented as “antitheses of the postmodern way of thinking”⁴⁴.

This would bring the denial without conditions of the realist experiences, of entities' entire and whole existence, of overall values (all inclusive, universal and eternal), of the greatness historic narrations, of the human existence stable foundations itself and of the possibility of recognizing reality's objectives.

This challenge and impossibility for total denial, incarnates in itself a form of *skepticism* that is powerfully raised on the denial of one of the most essential *empiricism* views, more concretely of *isomorphism* and the connections between the language and the reality. Like this, through a trajectory that starts with the Kantian idealism, to then pass on Nietzsche, Freud, Husserl, Heidegger, Jaspers, Gadamer, Bachtin, Barthes, Foucault, Bataille, Blanchot, Lévinas, Derrida, Habermas, Ricœur, Lyotard etc., from one side, the foundation on which is raised the entire postmodern horizon reflect its connections with the subjectivism that lives on Descartes “cogito, ergo sum”, which plowing compounds one of the most experienced directions of *romanticism*.

From the other side, they clearly show that such an apathetic stand that this horizon shows towards realism, is circumscribed to the essence of that mentality itself and way of thinking. From there, the postmodern thinking horizon manifests in not less directions a renewal of some of the most essential characteristics of romanticism. Among them we would individualize the romantic subjectivism in regard of reality.

A special interest compounds the stand towards the reality, idealized romanticism or the personalized romanticism of mostly those characteristics that are tied with the real's metaphysics dimension and with the subjectivism, on which the news gains subjective power and where the realities are changed in intuition artistic realities and of depth's experience, that are opposed to objectivity and rationality.

In this direction, not few modernism and postmodernism stands can be treated as a kind of revenge that the experienced idealism's part lived within of romanticism undertook against one of its blasphemous. Attached and supporting this, openly comes the opposing relations of

⁴⁴ N. Wheale, *The Postmodern Arts: An Introductory Reader*, “Routledge”, London 1995, p. 51.

decadentism towards naturalism, of his realist factology, that opposed in all sides to romanticism and realism.

However, if we look inside of this contradictions and exclusions framework, we observe that the XX century was not just a “return on I. Kant”, but also a return on his transcendental idealism. Above all the literary movements or directions of this century focus at their political and especially epistemological examinations, especially from those who source from the subjectivism raised in the rank of a principled behavior, as is presented to us for example the case of Edmund Husserli's “conscientious subject”.

What does that mean? Taken for granted, the postmodernist horizon is a denial of realistic experiences, has in essence a passionate Kantian spirit, also is a revival of transcendentalism in our times. The most distinguished representative of this comeback is the philosopher Jürgen Habermas. Enough to recall the fact that one of the realism's views that was targeted by the postmodernist critic was connected with the aesthetic inclinations of the latter, expressively with the “relation” or the “peaceful equation” that realism grasped to establish between reality and its (numenal and phenomenal) presentations, trying that through Socialist Realism to express the reality in the format of the symbolic-meaningful-representative of hyper-reality realism.

Realism's researchers and followers perceived to throw away that dividing diaphragm, or to be more precise, “that ontological alienation” that exists between “the reality” and “the presentations”, between “the object” and its words “expressions”, figures or concepts, from which derives its already well-known expression: “The limits of my language also define the limits of my world.”⁴⁵

At this point, the Socialist Realism itself surpasses “the romantic ideal” even when is presented in social and political forms, it surpasses the realistic school, in its pretension to “faithfully present the reality” and approaches with decadentism, which is the highest degree of reflecting the reality in the hyper-reality's reality. Even because during its existence attacked them, even why finds anterior on realism forms, the Socialist Realism establishes unarticulated connections with futurism, imagery, as schools descended from decadentism.

⁴⁵ *Philosophical Investigations*, “Blacwell”, Oxford 1953, p. 294.

Also, seen not in few directions, the stands that the postmodern mentality has manifested towards realism, are the same in the goals that Kant had expressed towards Anglo-Saxon mentality. There was no way it could have happened otherwise, for as long as between the Anglo-Saxon school represented by Hume, Locke and Berkeley and of realism's mentality lives the same spirit.

The reliance on *empirics*, with a single change, but more than essential: while the Anglo-Saxon school reaches on *gnoseological skepticism*, realism's trend reaches in positivist empiricism, of course thanks to the anthropocentric spirit that was fast bringing the rapid development extension that the map of scientific endeavors knew, technology and the use of it in the realism offered by the visual arts.

To be convinced about this parallelism stability, would be enough to recall the fact that, the same as in the case of Kant in front of Anglo-Saxon empiricism, also the postmodern mentality considers realism "as a lackadaisical approach and totally naïve towards the reality", for as long as such an approach skips the relations that live among the real world and the wordbook world.

On *word's cultivation* we recover again meeting-division between the Socialist Realism and decadentism, futurism or and hermetic, as also on the word's usage we see the deep division among them, exactly for the fact that on the first the pure word (the Kantian pure reason) was put at the function of art and its detachment from ideology, while on the second ones, the word was put at the service of transcendental ideology.⁴⁶

Coldly seen, such an approach between the real world and the words' world brings a plurality of not at all pleasant consequences as in the epistemological plan and also in the ethic and then in the political plan.

One of these consequences is the danger of real world absorption by the words' world, who translated in the political plan, explicitly means the absorption of the real world by the ruling ideologies world and their respective rhetoric, thing that in the final analyses made that the created literature under the Socialist Realism direction of method to

⁴⁶ M. Affron & M. Antliff (ed.) *The Myth of National Regeneration in Italy: From Modernist Avant-Garde to Fascism. Fascist Visions. Art and Ideology in France and Italy*. "Princeton University Press", Princeton, 1997, p. 25–45.

serve not to the numenal realities establishment, not those phenomenal, but of irrealist realities.

Exactly these realities become part of that “mechanism” or of that “superstructure”, in the words of Marx, aiming to preserve the *status quo* of a specific reality (or a specific net of social, political, economic etc. relations as Marx could have properly said) and that in the final analyses made possible the change of aesthetics and art as sociably useful.

In the Albanian literature, the existence and presence of realism forms as condition, and of a predecessor literary “realism”, if not made it possible, simplified a lot the breakthrough of that literary speech known as Socialist Realism.

This special form of realism influenced in changing the literature in a “weapon of masses emancipation”, and putting the literary activity at the service of ideology, in signing of the creative and intellectual freedom⁴⁷ and especially in realism *deformation*, its transformation in irrealism and of the socialist realities in *irrealisms*.

VI. From speech forms, towards a creative method of the Socialist Realism

By mentioning Zola, we also come back to the term “method” articulated by him, through which is denominated a creative process, a specific methodology connected with the personal record experiences, precisely on what the author has seen and heard, to continue with the investigation of the written documents, books on subject, friends' notes and also on the social determinism which, helped this author to produce the famous naturalist method in a novel writing.

Since here we notice that the denomination “method”, qualified as a way for a creative literary process, is not exclusively a qualification related only with the Socialist Realism. It has not been only articulated by its theoreticians, as we see in Timofeyev formulation, published in the pages of “Literatura Jonë” journal.⁴⁸

⁴⁷ C. Milosz, *Mendja e robëruar*, “Botimet Dritëro”, Tiranë 1998.

⁴⁸ See the published statement in the *Literatura Jonë* journal, Nr. 2, published on 1947, p. 14.

Prior to these years, precisely in the time period 1939-1944, many magazines have used the term “method” in different meanings about science fields and to deliver knowledge, but not related to the literary creativity.⁴⁹

This makes visible the fact that in the Albanian letters the use of the term in a certain codified and uniformity writing meaning, recognizes this period as arrival date. Meanwhile, the term itself “method”, that issues a special procedure that uses distinctive tools and ways from the others to approach to the object, finds predecessors on realism, as speech form or on naturalism in the end of the XX century and in the beginning of the XX century, as finds successors also on other names connected or not with Socialist Realism as creative method, which also possess the way and the creative process “method.”

If Zola presents in specific details the terms of the naturalist method since 1880, within the novel “Le roman expérimental”, other authors as Mayakovsky, Virginia Woolf, Ralf Fox or Bertolt Brecht accompany their ideas or theses on an essayistic approach method, treaties, guidelines or works with theoretical character.

In a letter of 1888 Fridrich Engels notices that Zola's naturalism method does not achieves to penetrate under the surface and the author does not has a deepen sense to observe, as Balzac (that, *nonetheless his clear political relevance, which were royalist, was capable to write against his subjective preferences, and thus was able to catch in his novels the developments of that developing class*), the great forces of history and through that “typical” characters understand and analyze the roles of these individuals about their social relevance and their ideological positions.

Some years before the Congress of the Soviet Writers, Mayakovsky has presented its Guideline to become a poet (1926), where puts forward the way and the method how “the verses are made” where, except protecting the idea that the poetry “is production”, and that “the poem is produced” that nothing sacred and mystic exists in the process of “the manufacturing of the verse”, from the position of a politicized movement as the Russian futurism and as theoretician and

⁴⁹ See “Hylli i Dritës”, Nr. 1, 3, 7, year 1939; “Kultura islame” Nr. 1, 15, 20, 21, 1939-1941; “Fryma”, Nr. 2, 1944; where the term is found even in the form “method”, “metodë”, “methud”, “methodë”.

activist of the *Left Front*, he breaks the myth of “versifier” and the “high cultural atmosphere that surrounds the art and the literature.”

In this practical guideline, that could have been useful for anyone that wanted to become a poet, he emphasizes on the materials and the methods (point 3); “resignation from [...] poetic knicknackery” [...] expression through the writing [...] only when there is no other way to say something, expect the verse [...] and creativity “when is felt the clear social command” (point 6); “To clearly understand the social command, the poet has to live in the middle of the events [...] to have knowledge in the economic theory, knowledge of the daily life reality, immersion in the history's scientific study [which] for the poet are [...] more important than the professors' scientific texts that worship the past” (point 7). These creative parallel methods with “production's method [...] mark the distinction among the poets” (point 10), which are “the only that don't want to surround the creative process in the worthless religious-artistic sanctuary atmosphere” (point 11).⁵⁰

On the insufficiency of the previous methods has said also his opinion the scholar Ralph Fox, which notices that for “the modern realists, Zola's and Maupassant heirs, have felt the insufficiently of their masters method. But the dialectical lack as philosophy that makes possible to them the true meaning in helping perceiving the world, led them towards the artificial symbolism and naturalism.”⁵¹

From a totally different aesthetic and philosophic position, from that of the modernist writer, is presented Virginia Woolf, which inclines to acquit “the method”, when adds quotations that are useful for every writer, nonetheless which trend, school or literary movement they belong: “Is the method obstructionist of the creative power? [...] Every method is right and expresses what we desire to express, if we are writers; which brings us closer the author's goal, if we are readers”⁵².

This inclination leads towards one of the most thrashing problems in the era of postmodernism: on “subject's” crises and of the tools and a

⁵⁰ V. Mayakovsky, *How Are Verses Made?* “Jonathan Cape”, London, 1970, p. 55-58.

⁵¹ R. Fox, *The Novel and the People*, “Lawrence & Wishart”, London, 1979, p. 104-106; 109-111.

⁵² V. Woolf, *Collected Essays*, Vol. 2. “The Hogarth Press”, London, 1966, p. 105-108.

single method insufficiency, from which was also mostly touched Socialist Realism.

Meanwhile, in the literary plan, this “method” crises, of “subject” and of “expressive tools” crises brought the birth of some other realism's forms as surrealism (the image reality, without the presence of the reasoning mind, but who accepted the dialectical materialism as the only revolutionary philosophy), the magic realism (the perceived realism from the irrational forces that move within the man, such as the nightmare, fear, loneliness etc.)

Nevertheless that does not change little in techniques, the poetry and the aesthetic inclination and above all the political ones, these forms of realism share something essential with the Socialist Realism. The forms in question are “realism” more than a grammatical function, which marks a categorical and ontological relevance. This clearly shows that the literary reality stands far from the *realism of the real*, of the true reality, for as long as is presented to us as directed and controlled realism.

The difference in this case is a matter of forces and vector movements from the marker to the marked reality, or vice versa, as we notice in the case of surrealism and of Socialist Realism. Being “directed and controlled”, both the art and the artistic research forms, turn into a prosody part, of the outer literary prosody reality.

In the case of the Socialist Realism, the art and the artistic research forms turn in function to ideology and from there also to the ruling prosody and its goals for the manipulation of wide masses, who perceive the literature as readers in the best case and as listeners in the other. From there we can say that the writer truly loses his poetic “halo” or “aureole”, as in the case of the poet on *Spleen de Paris* of Baudelaire, to be vested with another “aureole”, with the institution's aureole, of the authority and of the promoted ideology by him⁵³.

From this point-of-view, we believe that the so-called Socialist Realism should undergo a change in its marked structure.⁵⁴ On 1973

⁵³ Sh. Doda, *Metamorfoza e brerores*, “Mehr Licht”, No. 39, Tiranë, 2010.

⁵⁴ As a distinctive way of “the socialist realism” from the modern approach and not from the ideological, schematic or dogmatic one, Rexhep Qosja proposes the terms “liberated” realism and “integral” realism. See *Nocione të reja albanologjike*, “Instituti Albanologjik i Prishtinës”, Prishtinë, 1983, p. 104.

the scholar Rexhep Qosja has said that in his point-of-view “the socialist realism is not realism because is romanticism”. The Socialist Realism can be qualified also as “deliberate realism”, “realism that in presence and in its compounding elements subdue to a specific goal”, manifesting since the geneses a “directed realism”, out of “the subject's” will, as essential characteristic, realism that was directed to the masses, but also was an important state matter and a principal tool of his in the aesthetic education, in the moral one by passing step by step from the use of the literature as art in the use of the literature as weapon.

And this, not only in the communist East and of the people's democracies, as is guessed, but also in the democratic West,⁵⁵ or more precisely everywhere in the world where existed even a single communist party or inspiration from Marxism.

The orientation towards the “directed realism” and the “deliberate realism” brought the entire literature of the people's democracies in “moral realism”, “morality realism” or differently said in that kind of realism that has as final goal not the art, but the moral that comes from it at the end of the story.

As for contradiction, at the end of his not little tumultuous life (1936), Rudyard Kipling, of the “fortuitously journalistic realism”, according to Oscar Wilde and of the “exotic realism”, according to Edmund Gosse, wrote: “To a writer can be allowed to invent a story, but not its morality.”

Are also not rarely manifested the cases when the authorial intention and zeal in the realistic works, especially in those that “instantly” illustrated or responded to the ideological directive, killed every misused talent gleam. Such is for example Henri Barbusse's “Fire”, which zeal's exaggeration changed it from a novel against the war in a book that idealizes and “praises to sky the war.”⁵⁶

The feeling of morality and its glorification turned into a unifying and marking “culture” for the entire Socialist Realism literature of the

⁵⁵ R. Wright, *Black Boy*, Ellen Wright and Michael Fabre (ed.), *The Richard Wright Reader*, “Harper&Row”, New York, 1978, p. 17; R. Wright, *I tried to be a communist*, in *The God That Failed* (ed.) Richard Crossman “Harper and Brothers”, New York, 1949, p. 120.

⁵⁶ See J. L. Borges and E. Sabato, 1974, published in “Mehr Licht”, nr. 38.

“eastern bloc”. The standardized dictionary, together with the hyperbolic-adjectivized affixes and with the imperative forms, we found with defining value not simply spread in the texts of Socialist Realism works, but were raised to the “titles level.”

The same “moralizing culture” is also met in the literary works of the Albanian Socialist Realism, which were inspired from the directive and the sensation of being contemporary with the just proclaimed ideas from the ideology nourishing the method. For an expressive morality point-of views in the Albanian art and of opinions “that the art must have educative, political goals” is opposed by Selahyidin Toto, when on 1945 writes in the nr. 2 of the *Bota e Re* journal that after that we will have “morality, history, politics, but not a true art”, meanwhile in Nr. 9 of the *Literatura Jonë* journal of 1947 will be published Fadeyev’s opinion asking the combination of “the romantic progressive principle with realism”, thing that according to him “testifies that the artist has moral ideas.”

So present is this moralizing culture that we meet it not simply in the text, but also in titles and not only in the beginning of embracing the method of Socialist Realism, but during all the flow of its fulfillment. This makes us consider that the moralizing culture was an inclination and an associated presence which was exercised during the application of the method in the Albanian literature. Almost always we face with “stories” build on the morality and with moral that “must” start since the title.

To illustrate the frequency of this phenomenon enough to have a chronological look on the typology of the books titles in years, without stopping in special poetry titles which brought this kind of inclination to the limit: *Shtigje drite* (1946) *Ashtu, Myzeqe* (1947), *Me ty, Stalin* (1948), *Rruga e lumturis’* (1950), *Ata nuk ishin vetëm* (1952), *Afërdita përsëri në fshat* (1955), *Toka jonë* (1955), *Fillo këngën, çifteli* (1956), *Trimi i mirë me shokë shumë* (1958), *Ti je, Myzeqe?* (1970), or other works published among these as: *Ujët fle, hasmi s’fle, Isha unë Çobo Rrapushi, Ata nuk ishin vetëm, Sulm partizan, Ushtojnë malet, O, Ptoleme, Në tingujt e revolucionit*, etc. From the other side we notice what André Malraux says when refers to the painting: “every painting is done on the previous one”, also is worth for the art of writing, especially for that that was based on the method of Socialist Realism.

Basing on loan-words and on previous model bringing of the Socialist Realism, “the translation of theses and ideas”, “putting of the same characters in typical national environments”, “the borrowing of lexicon and symbolic” from one literature to another, emphasized the necessity to praise “the present”, “of the historic past”, integrating the details of “the ethnographic present” in the ideological structure of “imagination”, to create the image of a national and supranational literature, and at the same time with characteristics.⁵⁷

These would also add the (re)financed works on “palimpsest technique” – thing that disappeared or hid even those rare traces of aesthetic and model reactions against the Socialist Realism nucleus method, that was coming within national literatures, as for example, in the case of the Albanian literature, would be the refine of some works of Petro Marko, Dritëro Agolli, Ismail Kadare, Xhevahir Spahiu or of some other author, after the critics they received.

The Socialist Realism, as intuitive application, but who had exploited the meeting points between authoritarian ideologies and also the changes of the social reality, manifested aesthetic romantic and futurist inclinations, realistic and at the same time unrealistic-utopias.

In any case, except the dictate, the orientation towards the method wouldn't be possible to create so easily ground and to become dominant without the presence of the previous realism forms. At least wouldn't be possible for it to be applied so quickly and so easily without these social, cultural and ideological preconditions, which from one side interrupted the connections with the natural trends, that the Albanian literature followed towards the European one (on which the Albanian writers were familiar from the many journals that flourished between the '20-'40s). From the other side, all this changed the Socialist Realism's *creative method* from upper speech form, as was pretended to be, in a mono-culture and in a *standardized speech* and *totally formal one*.

⁵⁷ See Comaroff, Jean & John, *Ethnography and the Historical Imagination*, “Westview Press”, 1992.

VII. Socialist mimetic as the only definition of realism

To approach even more to the inner zone, the local, of the literature that was developed in Albania and from Albanian authors, it should be add that not only Marxism-Leninism was known, but also the term *Socialist Realism*, together with its knowledge and method that was searching to be known, also has started to be applied, nonetheless in throbs and not as a method.

In his discussion at the Third Conference of the League of Writers, Dhimitër Shuteriqi affirms that the term and the knowledge have their beginnings after the war and not with the establishment of such institutions as the League of writers or literary bodies as “Bota e re” and “Literatura jonë”.

In his text he writes: “On 1936 I closely collaborated at Korça's ‘Bota e re’,⁵⁸ to follow: “...at that time I was part of the progressive writers that *Bota e Re* assembled. In this journal, I have pointed out, nonetheless in a confuse way, thing that was understandable for the time, the question of realism. At that time in Albania, through French publishing, has begun to be also heard the term *Socialist Realism*. At those times, we couldn't properly understand Realism, but we had desire of it.”⁵⁹

Another danger on realism was standing at the standardization or on expression uniformity or in the way of expressing oneself. The formalization process and of formatting the semantic marking process under the light of some codifying laws concocted after the logic of standardization relation *slighter / sighted*, of the *expressive form* and of *the expressed reality*, coincides, after all, not simply and only with the normative, canonization and hackneyed-phase, but first of all with the logic on which is raised every dictatorship, every dictate form may it be aesthetic, that is led from the goal to extend the control on all views and real's spaces, including here not only the communication forms, but even the semantic mechanisms and operators (linguistic codes and the conveying meaning mechanisms) and the *semiotic* (symbolic-metonymic systems and the marking nomocracy), from those that form

⁵⁸ See Dh. Shuteriqi, *Konferenca e Tretë të Lidhjes së Shkrimtarëve*, Tiranë, 1950.

⁵⁹ *Ibid.*

the essence of the expressive codes and produce the linguistic meanings and messages.

The dictate form on Albanian letters for the period taken in consideration couldn't have been otherwise from the other proletariat dictatorship forms already turned to law, through which was unacceptable not only every "different" opinion, but also every different kind of expressing form, also including here the literary expression.

With the beginnings on 1945, at its peak on 1949, during and after the third Conference of the League of Writers and until the half of the '50ies we still find even some pallid throb of freedom expression of the "free thought", brought by a "small group" of writers, which critically expressed themselves towards the low levels of the literary product in the Albanian language.⁶⁰

In the political plan of the communist leadership were directed harsh critiques towards the use of the political power. Anyway the world-outlook orientation, and of the aesthetic plan themes was an expressive and opened form of the dictate. Everything that George Orwell had warned since 1949, through "a fictional language" and "newspeak" on his novel *1984*, through which he offered "arguments" on the lie culture, *doublethink* intellectual adaptation, propaganda's and censorship's role, the intellectual betrayal, the thought crime, the memory hole, human's manipulation strategy, Europe's walls under the totalitarian regime which Ismail Kadare achieved to express on *Nëpunësi i pallatit të ëndrrave/The palace of dreams* (1981).

Seen from this point-of-view, it could be said that, situated under the pressure and the dictate of the non-linguistic elements and "operators", of non-semantic codes, the semantic elements and "operators" (linguistic codes) occur a change/transformation and adaptation in the structure and in their marking function. They are captured by an expressive pathology, of an inclination or ideological spirit, changing in an "icon", "figure" or in non-literary tropism of poetic tropes, as Harold Bloom said⁶¹.

All this presentation becomes part of a concocted "iconostasis", as is displaced from its independent space and its harbinger function, in an

⁶⁰ See the published materials in "Literatura jonë" journal, Nr. 3, 1954.

⁶¹ H. Bloom, *Breaking of Form*, "Seabury", New York, 1979, p. 1-37.

alienated space and function, expressly in the space of a ruling ideology, within which is vested with a pure ideological and manipulative function.

“The icon” – as one of the pillars on which is raised the entire aesthetics and the realism's poetic – coincides in essence with the word's displacement from an expressive and harbinger space, in just and only “marking” space. This inclination towards the totally marking spaces and “mono-semantic”, brings a pathologic change in the formal structure of the language itself. Placed under the pressure of non-linguistic codes – as are the ideological codes – thanks to its harbinger function, more than a semantic marker, the language “stands there for something else”, to say as Charles Sanders Peirce did.⁶² So, it ceases to be a harbinger system, to thus change in a marking system, iconographic one. The picture brings towards against another danger that is presented in front of realism, already placed in a much more complicated plan - in the epistemological plan. The language's displacement from a semantic plan in only and simply semiotic, marking or iconographic/ photographic, confronts us with the question of the “presentation” epistemological status, with the endurance or truthfulness of the marked reality. Exactly in this direction has mostly concentrated its attacks against realism in the postmodern mentality.

From the other side, pretending to manifest an undressed “presentation” from any kind of subjective element, realism does not only appears as only epistemological unstable in its carryings, but risks to be seen devious towards what we have said and explained in concept as reality.

Through its carryings, realism risks to deceive (and has deceived), or to lie, but first of all itself. The reason is simple. Noticed in their independence, “the objects” do not express anything; also do not have an independent meaning. Their meaning directly depends by the subject. As consequence, such an inclination of realism, of pretending for a “realistic veracity, especially of “socialist” “realism” is firstly presented as simple impossibility. Turning at the point zero of the

⁶² S. Ch. Peirce, *On The Algebra of Logic: A Contribution to the Philosophy of Notation* “The American Journal of Mathematics”, New York 1885, p. 185; op. cit., after Richard Rorty, *Pragmatism, Categories and Language*, “Philosophical Review”, New York 1961, p. 201.

subjective element presence, coincides with the contemporaneous turning at the point zero of the world's objective secondary element. This means that to extract the *objectus* from his existential meaning, which after all brings the loss of every contact point with the true reality and as consequence, with every possible realism.

From the other side, except the deception and self-deception, realism risks to deceive or lie to also others, the community which he approaches, pushing this community to keep a “peaceful” and “well-accepting” reading stand in front of a vested view or text with the “natural” dimension and form, which is not true, nonetheless projected and promised as the following: “For as long as realism pretends to offer a representation of non-problematic [questions], it is indeed the highest form of representative deception...”⁶³

This situation of the real and of this exceptional realism, as form of the impossible realism, was visibly noticed during the period of Socialist Realism application period in the eastern Block, Albania included. The directed, oriented readings after some purely ideological principles and clichés, ethic more than aesthetic, unavoidably place us in front of one of the realism paradoxes, or at least in one of his manifesting forms: from one side realism that pretends to present reality as it is, or as it was and for this is strongly based on the conviction that such an endeavor is more than possible.

Meanwhile, in some of his most remarkable manifestations, this realism is manifested as conventions entities and inclinations that want to show to the people of a specific time or place that what has to be noticed as true, as real as the Socialist Realism projected to be.

Nevertheless on this paradox is often put at the center of postmodern mentality, because of the unpleasant consequences that such a goal brings in the social, ethical and above all political plan, as is the case of falling in dogmatism⁶⁴ in a speech kept in the University of Charles in Prague in the ceremony of awarding the title *Doctor Honoris Causa*, Aragon presents “the socialist realism” as a “dogmatism with Stalinist roots”, which was pretending to create a “dialectical” equipoise against the “other empire” culture's demagogy”,

⁶³ Compare, N. Wheale, *op. cit.*, p. 53.

⁶⁴ Compare: L. Aragon: *Realisme et dogmatisme – Le discours de Prague*, Les lettres françaises (Nr. 944), Paris, 20.09 1962.

mot-à-mot said to the demagogy of the capitalist world, what was qualified as a “barbaric” approach towards the socialist realism literature not only within, but even wider.

As we take advantage from this paradox, the postmodern mentality of our times has achieved till there where expect the interest and the little attention, has aimed not in few cases to skip realism even in its most cultivated aspect, expressively, in the literary one.

Nonetheless some scholars of literature have been trying to put in evidence the historic weight and meaning in the plan of a literary and artistic movement, again realism, as from the critic as from the human sciences scholars, has continued to be seen as a naïve and simplifier approach towards the “materialized reality” and towards the “artistic realism.” In this direction, the critical observation that Roland Barthes undertook about deciphering of “reality's effects”, or “effects of reality, pretends to deliver a literary text aiming that this should manifest us the events’ stability on which is raised (the credible, the possible, the similar, the real etc.). Also, Barthes’s efforts to see realism under the light of a new relationship, in the concrete case under the light of post-structuralism relations with semiotic theories, not only didn’t helped to grow the interest towards realism, but on the contrary, established a totally opposite effect: “were turned in a pretext to transform this realism in a study object and still farther attention for the literary critique.”⁶⁵

Also in this direction, realism had to face even itself with charges about his literary “nature” and “dimension”. Thus, for example, on Northrop Frye, one of the most remarkable cultivators of critic formalism, realism is manifested as *anti-literary*, in the most deep and essential meaning of the word. In the work *Anatomy of Criticism*, Northrop Frye says that “one of the most remarkable and important characteristics of literature is the lack of a controlling aim or encouragement about the correctors care of [*literary and artistic*] description.”⁶⁶ These theses rejects through a trope (innuendo), one of the pillars of literary realism poetic, exactly the inclination to picture the reality.

⁶⁵ R. Barthes, *Le bruissement de la langue*, “Éditions du Seuil”, Paris 1984, p. 148.

⁶⁶ N. Frye, *Anatomy of Criticism: Four Essays* “Penguin Books”, Harmondsworth 1990, p. 75.

Of the same spirit is also presented Jean-François Lyotard, which strikes realism to its foundations, even coming till there to qualify it as a superficial and banal mimes' conceptual show. "*The only definition of realism*", says Lyotard, "*is that pretends to skip the question of reality that lives in the art's sphere.*"⁶⁷ Since there, with the insistence of Jean-François Lyotard, about the superficial mimes of Northrop Frye-it, about the "literary dimension" of realism and on Roland Barthes, about "reality's effects" and "the effects' reality", the inclination to find "un-realism" in the plan of a literary and artistic movement within the method of the Socialist Realism, takes much more support.

Seen from this point-of-view, the realism seems that approaches with a "presentation form" which led by the inclination to linguistically describe the empirical reality and also as much as precisely as it could be, tries to achieve a complete concord between the two realities, nevertheless the change among the respective materials and other factors that participate in such an endeavor,⁶⁸ which with or without will are overlaid, often dramatically to the goals and mimetic inclinations (photographic) from which is led this trend poetry and aesthetics.

Nonetheless, it is worthy to say that the presented picture it is but the one side of the coin. In a time when the realism as a project or inclination seemed to have been placed in "the untouchable caste, the speech itself on realism continues even today as one of the most cultivated and treated spaces, at least in the philosophic thought. In this direction, the speech on realism remains one of the permanent literature motives and of other arts, motive which realism was as style or reality's presentation form was raised.

If we keep this in mind, is understandable that what is manifested as problematic for the postmodern mentality, it's nothing else but the aim to transform realism from the forms speech, or tropes, in a canonical speech form, or as the only speech form that presents the true reality, as this is presented by the concreteness, for example, which in

⁶⁷ Jean-F. Lyotard, *Answering the Question: What is Postmodernism?*, published in *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge*, "Manchester University Press", Manchester, 1984, p. 75.

⁶⁸ Compare: F. Schiller, *Bukuria në art*, Mehr Licht, Nr. 37, p. 38 – 39.

itself skips realism through abstract forms, to arrive again in a new realism, this time abstracting.

Seen as forms or tropes speech, realism is coming around the guess after which, a specific presentation can offer an approximate recognition opportunity, in connection with a reality, through the subjects' conscience and use of the language not simply to mark it. The concept realism presents like this a totally different view from the descriptive-presenting realism. Firstly, he seeks to be presented as forms and tropes speech, aiming to make place in the writing-literary map as an opportunity, as a possibility, but not as a canonical speech. From this point-of-view, the perception of realism holds a special importance in literature and in other forms of art, becoming a speech of forms and possible approaches. From there, the aesthetic debates about realism cease to be of simply and only political or literary nature, as are presented in this quote of Louis Aragon: "Realism is changed in a ship that boarded and plundered from all parts; the right pirate screams: 'Death to realism!'", meanwhile the left pirate chuckles: 'I am Realism!'"⁶⁹

On the contrary, they begin to be seen mostly with philosophical picture, as for example the case of social realism, of moral realism, idealist realism, analytical realism, phenomenal realism, *global realism* or the case of surrealism or even of the magic realism, in literature. Seen from this point, "*...to collect realism in art means to immediately enter in philosophy's territory*", affirms the researcher Terry Lovell. Then, he continues arguing: "*to collect the realism in art means to enter in the ontological and epistemological questions: in questions that are collected with all that exists in general, as in connection with the way how can we know all that exists.*"⁷⁰ Such realism has been, is and will always remain the humans' endeavor part, beyond any doubt.

Seen in itself, thus, the descriptive realism movement that lived in the second half of the XIX century, to be extended in other expressive art realities, we can say that betrayed and alienated the essence of this *realism as anytime presence*. While the latter was and will continue to remain a permanent adventure in which lives, *the descriptive realism*

⁶⁹ Compare: L. Aragon, *op. cit.*

⁷⁰ L. Terry, *Picture of Reality: Aesthetics, Politics and Pleasure*, "BFI", London 1980, p. 6.

tried to impose to the readers of a specific reality even a canonized and standardized approach of it. Since there, every kind of pretention towards realism should keep in mind these manifestations, it should face not only with plenty of difficulties, as belongs to the definition and limitations, not only with “the extreme relativity of the concept “realism”,⁷¹ but also with some insurmountable paradoxes with which unavoidably confronts us the phenomenon we are speaking about, which bring us towards psychology, politicizing, feminism, fetishism and to blasphemy of realism as a possible approach towards material or written reality (literary, artistic or media).

⁷¹ R. Jakobson, *On Realism in Art*, published in: *Language in Literature*, “Harvard University Press”, Cambridge 1987, p. 25: “*The extreme relativity of the concept of realism.*”

Virion GRAÇI

**ATYPICAL CHARACTERS OF THE AUTHOR
DITËRO AGOLLI**

The literary and public creativity of Ditrëro Agolli extends from the middle of the XX century to nowadays. If the timely extension has the usual astronomic linearity, seen as cultural time and speech paradigm, then we have an unusual density. D. Agolli's active life coincides to the zenith rise and is of the undisputable consolidation of the socialist realism method; coincides by forbidding until heresy of the best European and world literature; coincides with the further forbidding of the great Albanian tradition authors; coincides by forbidding of many young authors, his fellow peers, and some even younger than Agolli himself, excluded authors from the publishing activity, victimized and punished as people, to their own life loss. The change of ages, the soft exit from the communist dictatorship and the entry in a new Calvary of events and historic clashes, finds Agolli politically among his peers, among the former members of the Party of Labor and new socialist formations. Until today, nearly 20 years after the dissolution of the *mother party*, Agolli has achieved to position himself as patriarch of the Albanian left wing; his journalistic follows the same path of self-tradition, of daily thematic spirals according to the hour; ideologically, a little bit stripped from the revolutionary Marxist pathos, reviewed in terminology; in media is seen as a man with close connections with the Albanian reality, peaceful and opportunistic in his observations and intrusions, but always through the rose party optics; culturally, the post-dictatorship Agolli, is seen as a reborn author. In this creative reborn for the first time, poetry shows up. *Pelegrini i vonuar*, *Lajmëtar i vdekjes*, *Vjen njeriu i çuditshëm* are among his new books during the pluralistic age, qualitative and peak synthesis of a rich creative activity with works and events.

Since the first publishing of D. Agolli, more than half a century ago, to his eightieth anniversary, are changed many components in our spiritual and cultural life: there are changes of the tastes, the cultural trends have occurred partial or complete rotations; the distinguish creative models from the world's cultures have been present for our readers in the last twenty years. When we say that the cultural components and tastes have changed, we have in mind the leading figures of our literary tradition, the restituted in the place where they do belong, the anathematized from the totalitarian regime: Skiroi, Fishta, Arapi, Mit'hat Frashëri, F. Konica, A. Pipa, M. Camaj, to the latest as B. Xhaferri, A. Delvina, F. Rreshpja, etc. Thus, important authors and works begun to take the right place in the Albanian culture pantheon. When we say the tastes have changed, we also have in mind the publishing and the zealous read from the Albanian reader of the forbidden authors from the world literature: Dostoyevsky, Joyce, Proust, Hermann Hesse, Kafka, Faulkner, Camus, Günter Grass and important contemporary authors: Doris Lessing, Mario Vargas – Llosa, José Saramago, F. Roth, O. Pamuk, John Maxwell– Koxi, Herta Müller, etc. The only cultural model — the socialist realism, so much connected in our country even with the name and the work of Dritëro Agolli, has left the place to a diversity of creative samples, derivatives of the latest achievements of the respective literary kinds, totally personalized and always in search of originality and audience.

The method of socialist realism one of the most powerful levers of the party-state for the communist education of the masses, with the privileged armada of the Writers and Artists League, chaired so long by Dritëro Agolli, ceased to be daily active because of the fall of political system which has powerfully machinated and sponsored it. That ruling method now belongs to tradition, history, with its achievements and limitations. Even its most distinguished authors, who lived after the nineties and are still today creative, theoretically and practically have made efforts, in masses and in different qualities to take distance from it. In any case, the socialist realism method has been analyzed by the scholars and contemporary critique by evidencing its complex negativity as propaganda weapon, its productive authors, the principal ones, those who have given to the authority and the required efficacy from the state-party and dictator Hoxha himself, are never made object

of discussion or such a critique, same as the method. Albanian paradox! Moreover, that time writers and artists, employed by the state as full time professional writers, have been no more than *official writers and artists*. And from this official pyramid of writers and artists, Dritëro Agolli has been one of the most important, as its chairman to the dissolution of the communist system.

Differently from us that unconditionally honor the patriarch, the wise of the nation, the virtuous among the intellectuals, the democrat, the tolerant, the popular Dritëro Agolli, the scholar Aleksandre Zotos, friend and translator of Agolli, professor in Saint Etienne, translator and distinguished promoter of the Albanian literature in France, is the first until now, that in a scientific conference has spoken about the moral and intellectual responsibilities of Agolli and Kadare for what has happened in the Albanian society, respectively in literature and arts. Analyzing Agolli and Kadare in their dual relationships with the political system of the time, he writes:

“We will try, especially to put in evidence the violations more or less secret that both writers have made, which I would refer more than the others, having in mind the place and their respective responsibility in the Albanian life: Ismail Kadare and Dritëro Agolli.”¹

This scholar further adds: “The second opinion pushes us to principally stop at the notion of the official writer: this label seem that better suits them, even in twofold way, because Dritëro Agolli, except his function as Chairman of the Writers League, entered in the alter of the Party's Central Committee, while the growing international fame of Kadare made him member of the People's Assembly and later to the post of deputy chairman of the Democratic Front.”²

In this Agolli's anniversary, returning to his literary activity, we find enough priceless parts, qualitative, survived for the tastes and the intellectual-spiritual necessities of the contemporary reader. Not only we can put in evidence with pleasure this fact, but we can prove to explain the reason of this survival. A preliminary explanation on the durability of Agolli's work is given by Shaban Sinani when he writes: “The man is the inner power of Dritëro Agolli work.”³

¹ *Letërsia si e tillë*, Akte të konferencës shkencore, mars 1996, p. 251.

² *Po atje*, f. 251.

³ Sh. Sinani, *Për letërsinë shqipe të shek. XX*, Botimet Naimi, 2010, p. 267.

Certainly, here is not about only for the new man, nor for the previous one, the bourgeois, the conservatory, the enemy, the kulak, but is the universal concern of the creative man about the common Albanian man in general. A. Zotos points out the same characteristics when he analyzes one of the problematic Agolli's narratives and novels, published during the monist period:

"Telo Gora's story introduces us to a world where the human relations are destroyed and this has not to do with the remains of the old patriarchal system, as the text suggests in first plan: the endless emptiness of a poor uniform region, where is dreamt about sad Tirana as it was a *Luna park*."⁴

Some of Agolli's priceless novels capture an untouchable theme, massively and schematically cultivated, a theme where are stopped and severely controlled the concessions, the softening, the improvisations, the contradictions, the dilemmas: is the theme of the partisan war with heroes and black and white characters, standard prefabricated according to the compulsory recipe of the official historiography. Agolli, with an uncontrollable strength, realist in itself, dedicates to this theme and taboo period one of his most mature novels, perfect ones not only in the framework of personal creativity, but in entirely Albanian literature. Has been noticed from the censorship times this partial escape of Agolli from history's official version, when many of his novels were obstructed to be published and circulate; has been observed in the nineties from the scholar Aleksandre Zotos this challenging gift of his:

"Dritëro Agolli made the unforgivable sin – the changing of National Liberation War's theme. Through a visible manifestation, he transforms it by giving the understanding of a call to stop the civil war that was nourished by the communists since the beginnings of their reign. On Pasho Velçani's history as also on that of the 'Dissipated nephew', we have something more than the call to put the civil war at an end: the refuse to create a yellow star, on behalf of the red star."⁵

Unforgivable "sins" of Agolli we find in his renowned novels: *Komisari Memo*, *Njeriu me top*, *Shkëlqimi dhe rënia e shokut Zylo*.

On "*Komisari Memo*" we have some artistically mature characters, meanwhile the novel has been kept and propagated, not by mistake, as

⁴ *Letërsia si e tillë*, Akte të konferencës shkencore, mars 1996, p. 267.

⁵ *Letërsia si e tillë*, Akte të konferencës shkencore, mars 1996, p. 269.

the model of the socialist realism model, with well-grounded political content, with educative values. The commissar Memo Kovaçi, as can be read today, represents the communist's figure, with all the attributes that has given to himself the young communist: he announces concrete verdicts against his political opponents without being a judge; he seizes the goods and the stuff of others without being an executive in the first meaning of the word, and freely distributes the stock that was not his without being activist of charity associations. While being a guest in the house of doctor Borova, the commissar becomes arsonist, and breaks the statue of the guest; he is healed there and his life is saved but has endangered the life of the hosts, and meanwhile rushes to become the leader, the model, moralist, judge and lawmaker there.

Unfortunately, Memo Kovaçi, as if he wishes to exactly illustrate the charges of the opponent political propaganda, acts and appears in the limits of the ruiner of family harmony and love of two of a love affair. With all the positive pathetics on which D. Agolli tries to give life to Memo, his main character, it cannot be read today in a positive light, inspiring and humanitarian, as the author once wished. It seems that this character was out of author's control, as well as Sali Protopapa, the antipodal character. Leaving aside the cinematographic illustration of this character, the beginnings of the grotesque image of the respective actor and vulgar grimaces during the smokescreen interpretation, Sali Protopapa the character of the novel, *Komisari Memo*, in a near future, free from the pseudo-aesthetical-patriotic prejudices and doctrinal pre-education, could be considered a realized artistic figure, incarnation of pride, typical of a warrior — the Albanian warrior, manly and hot-tempered, the freedom lover and the arrogant, ambitious and traditional, bravely jumping into the war waves, and also disoriented by the vortexes and background of that bloody game big in dimension.

Njeriu me top, another important novel by Dritëro Agolli, generally has the elements of a social realism that sensitively overpasses the canonical framework of the socialist realism. Mato Gruda, Mere Fizi, Hajredini, aunt Esma, Agush, etc., by means of critical realism on which the author made their individualization, i.e., the detailed physical and social portrayal, the specific spoken, individualized, specifics mentalities, the shades, the speech slang, the detailed design of the

scene and the time event, etc., totally neutralize the communist rhetoric effects of the direct representatives of the new world such as Murat Shtaga. By agreeing with the interpretation of Sh. Sinani about Mere Fizi's family as a model of organization according to Bektashi tradition, we would also add that, even in other Agolli's novels, where this family organization model misses, again the author successfully overpasses the limits of the only allowed creative method and brings in the fond of the Albanian literature novel confessions of the critique realism model, developed in France and Russia in the XIX century; models of critique realism but originally applied by an author with ideals and obligations of a communist agitator.

Another work of the golden fond of the Albanian literature, "*Shkëlqimi dhe rënia e shokut Zylo*," is presented as a typical work, where the creative intuition, the narrator's born talent – humorist, are against the author, his ideological, class and party consciousness. At first sight, this novel lacks the basic discovery for a majeure satire work, lacks that essential contradiction between the parts, that dramatic incompatibility between the visibilities and essences, lacks the serious-dramatic noodle, which wrong solution, the "original" one overpasses what creates the comic situations and reveals in the light of the sun hilarious characters. It is normal for a high official to have speeches prepared by the staff, from the respective secretary, this is a daily quota, an ordinary fact, we are at the limits of a systematic work prepared and fixed with professionalism. The novel, *Shkëlqimi dhe rënia...*, aims to report this ordinary daily quota as a shortcoming, a serious deformation, a hostile manifestation, irreconcilable with the revolutionary-socialist energies, burst and practicality.

This novel written in line with the directives of Party of Labor of Albania, to *wage war against bureaucracy*, welcomed by the readers of different generations, and liked a lot by the high leadership of the state, as the former premier M. Shehu says in his letter sent to E. Hoxha, when considering it a widely grotesque spectacle. This framework, in our opinion, does not lie in the relations of the high official Zylo with his speechwriter Demkë, but also in the secondary gallery of characters, the supporters: art critics, musicians, intellectuals, future "geniuses" and other ongoing characters of the younger generation. Therefore, willy-nilly, on *Zylo* is stigmatized the whole new Albanian

“aristocracy” of the time, the high nomenclature artificially and hastily established from the poor strata that makes up the regime’s moral bases: the peasantry and the working class. Is this new “aristocracy” of the time that is found figured with comic-grotesque expression means, is the strata where the growth has occurred, the journey and the brilliance of the author Dritëro Agolli himself and of his colleagues’ writers, artists and high officials of the totalitarian state. *Shkëlqimi dhe rënia...* sketches the intelligentsia and the newly established elites from the Albanian socialism and all the “civilizing” reforms, sourcing from the socialist emancipation of the country. Unlikely, it wasn’t author’s principal creative intention.

Appraisals and analyzes have been made, and many papers, and journal articles have been written about the official-writer phenomenon D. Agolli. Willing to find that *Ariadnes thread* that the author has followed to succeed from the sterile labyrinth which he chaired with devotion, we are selecting only some arguments that seem enough as a starting point, for the current stage of our research on this author. About Agolli's survival enigma we still agree with Sh. Sinani:

“Dritëro Agolli has created in his novel mainly ‘crazy people’ instead of the new ‘angel’ man; people with progressive inclinations to the time where they lived, but at the same time even disobedience towards the time we were living, disobeying towards the scheme; ruled from the kindness spirit, but without the pure unstained dogma.”⁶

Another right approach from the same scholar is made about the nature of Agolli’s stories, especially on those short stories that are not connected with the actuality but with the heroic past: “There is so much of ethnographies in most of the stories dated in the ‘60s, that not only the environment and the phenomena remember the old traditional Albania, but also the people that live there who are ideologically uneducated from author's political awareness and approach Kuteli's characters such as the reckless chieftains and valiant of the popular literature, with the old Albanian, warrior and rebel of the ancient times.”⁷

The term “ethnographical” used by Sh. Shabani to denote that essential and central strata of Agolli’s prose creativity, nonetheless

⁶ Sh. Sinani, *Për letërsinë shqipe të shek. XX*, Botimet Naimi, 2010, p. 271.

⁷ Ibid, p. 274.

right, does not support all our efforts to reason why the characters and the narrative endeavors of such a sophisticated author, with professional dedication towards the literary are out of his hands. To explain this positive and complex phenomenon of Agolli's characters and their relations with their author, the systematic reasoning of the philosophers Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari in their common work, *What is philosophy?*, seems more appropriate. Commenting this great work of two brilliant philosophers, mainly the literary characters of *Zarathustra* type, e.g., created and used from the philosophers to clearly and directly explain their point-of-view and relations with the world, Deleuze and Guattari come out with the definition of *conceptual character*. Is this kind of character that is out of the author's hands to multiply the possibility of confession, to overpass the limitation of different kinds that could constrain or obstruct his creator by widely being expressed?

"The conceptual character is not philosopher's representative, quite his opposite: the philosopher is only a cover of his conceptual principal character and all the others that are put in. The conceptual characters are philosopher's heteronyms, while the philosopher's name, only a nickname of his characters ... (abbrev. V.G.) ...philosopher's destiny is to come back in the character or in the own conceptual characters, at the same time that the characters alienate their being in historic ones, in mythological being or in daily ones."⁸

Deleuze – Guattari do take into consideration that the artistic literature created by the philosophers in service of philosophy and the artistic literature only as such, so for the sake of itself, is the view and the part of the same activity, therefore to clarify the functional distinction between the respective central characters and the differences among the conceptual characters that might be considered created as the incarnation of the pure thought of usual literary characters, created as pure incarnations of different aesthetic categories:

"The differences between conceptual characters and aesthetic figures relate to the power of the concepts for the first and the power of affects and perceptions for the second [...abbreviated V.G.] ...the great aesthetic figures of thought and prose, but also of painting, sculpture

⁸ Deleuze – Guattari, *Ç'është filozofia?*, Botimet Zenit, 2008, pp. 82-83.

and music, produce affects that overpass the usual affections and perceptions, as much as the concepts overpass the daily opinions... ”⁹

The unavoidable benefit and role of the conceptual characters, Deleuze – Guattari see dictated by objective causes, from the epoch specifics conditioned by big ambitions of the creators, may they be philosophers -writers or simply writers, without genuine philosophic claims:

“From Plato to Bergson, dominates the idea that the concept is a matter of articulation, cut and assemblage. It is a totality, because it turns into one all its whole components, but a fragmented totality. Only being such, the concept can be detached from the mental chaos, chaos that watches and is attached from behind eager to absorb it again.”¹⁰

The convergences and the similarities between the art and philosophy are heralded; they attest their common origin and receptor, despite the evolution in independent times and activities. In these twin natural similarities and convergences between the art and philosophy, we find out one of the most important answers and conclusions about the issues in this paper discussed.

“*The art and the philosophy are waiting and can face the chaos*”, say Deleuze and Guattari, “The art does not think less than the philosophy, but it thinks through affections and perceptions.”¹¹

Dritëro Agolli, by creating mainly conceptual characters instead of aesthetic figures; preferring conceptual characters instead of characters with functions aesthetically focused on, succeeded in exiting from the vicious circle of the official illustrative Albanian literary, to achieve a permanent place in the best Albanian literary fond. As we have spoken in the beginning about contradictable Agolli: official, writer and man of power, we would in the end estimate that he totally changes from many authors of that time, disciples of his, blind followers of socialist-realism dogma. This category of mediocre writers, poor from gifts and creative virtues, were grew up as privileged artists of the regime’s and were unjustly popularized from the national publishing mechanisms, of the commissioned critique and of ready publicity. On the contrary, Dritëro Agolli from the top of the pyramid of the socialist realism seems to

⁹ *Po aty*, f. 84-85.

¹⁰ *Po aty*, f. 25-26.

¹¹ Deleuze – Guattari, *Ç’është filozofia?*, Botimet Zenit, 2008, f. 85.

avoid his born, undisputed talent, especially in the field of prose and satire; frequently, he wrote/published far from his real possibilities, under his potential level. Why?! To be opportunistic towards the regime? To be self-complacent with the privileged position of the high official?! Perhaps! Anyway, the paradox Dritëro Agolli continues...

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Akademia e Shkencave e Shqipërisë; Instituti i Gjuhësisë dhe i Letërsisë, *Letërsia si e tillë*, Akte të konferencës shkencore, march 1996.

Deleuze – Guattari, *Ç'është filozofia?* Botimet Zenit, 2008.

Novels by Dritëro Agolli: *Komisari Memo*; *Shkëlqimi dhe rënia e shokut Zylo*; *Njeriu me top*; *Njerëz të krisur*.

Sinani, Sh., *Për letërsinë shqipe të shek. XX*, Botimet Naimi, 2010.

Valter Memisha

**THIMI MITKO ON THE ALBANIAN LANGUAGE THROUGH
THE RECORDS ON HIM, IN THE ARCHIVE OF THE
INSTITUTE OF LINGUISTIC AND LITERATURE¹**

In the Institute of Linguistics and Literature Archive, Center on Albanian Studies, Tirana, are found many interesting materials concerning the work and activity of Thimi Mitko, or about the studies related to this eminent personality of our National Renaissance. Those, generally, are exploited from different scholars, for personal or study purposes, as is the case of exploiting for preparation of the volume, *Vepra*, by the Institute of People's Culture, Academy of Sciences of Albania, Tirana, 1981.

Through an informing recapture on what is found in the files on Thimi Mitko in this archive, our brief paper would focus on the Albanian language, as one of the main components of his work. Seen in its multifarious dimension, through the successive coming of each record or document in these files, the mother tongue discovers a distinctive part of Thimi Mitko personality. The work, spontaneously, is descriptive and targeting and makes possible a further all inclusive study, complete and exhaustive of this question, referring to the documents that are found in the National Central Archive, also in the Institutes of Anthropology, History, Prishtina and of the documents that are found in other countries, European, African and beyond.

I. The File J/10-nr. 166, Photocopy of the microfilm K nr. 15, Thimi Mitko, *Mjaltë nga bleta shqiptare (Honey from the Albanian bee)*, collected by Dhimitër Pilika, p. 147. The materials are copy of

¹ The presentation was delivered at the International Scientific Conference, The life and Work of Thimi Mitko, on the occasion of the 195th of his birthday anniversary (Summary).

“Bleta” photos, discovered in Prague by Dhimitër Pilika, when he was a student in Czechoslovakia, and as a material is presented in the Albanian Seminary at the University of Prague, Cabinet of the Modern Philology of the Czechoslovak Academy of Sciences. The documents of this file are the at heart of all the documents on Mitko, because they are photocopy of the folklore assets registered on *handwriting* by him and have served as raw material for the preparation of “Bleta Shqiptare.” We draw the attention here that in a future and more complete publication of Mitko, this file, without underestimating the importance of the other files should occupy the principal place in the authentic publishing of author’s original work.

We are not stopping on known recaptures, but basing on “Bleta shqiptare” publishing in Vienna on 1924, realized from the Albanian consul, Dr. Gjergj Pekmezi², we are drafting some attitudes on Albanian language and questions through this language according to Thimi Mitko point-of-view. It's enough the reference on the foreword wrote by him, to understand the Albanian language, which comes out observed in some cuts:

a. With “Bleta” Mitko fulfills a *missionary work on Albanian language*, for collecting the Albanian people verbal assets and of the Albanian language itself. This required a lot of time and pains, because are already known the difficulties of linguistic record in Albanian of the songs, tales, maxims, riddles etc. at the end of the XIX century. Nevertheless, he realized that kind of job that is appreciated and now this activity with the papers that presents, continues to put in evidence unstudied sides of the enormous work of Korça's son. Thimi Mitko writes that “The aim of *Bleta shqiptare*, viz of this Albanological reading, is generally the savior and the giving for the future generation on Albanian texts, that before some years with many pains and suffering I collected them, which I believe that would have an outcome, because in these is seen the kin, the character, the manners and the customs of the Albanian race.”³

b. As other Enlightenment Renaissance figures, Thimi Mitko gives a lot of *credit to the cultured, emancipating and developing role of the*

² *Bleta shqypëtare e Thimi Mitkos*, E përshkroj me shkrojla shqype, e përktheu shqip dhe e radhitit dr. Gjergj Pekmezi, Konsulli i Shqypërisë, Vienna 1924.

³ Th. Mitko, *Bleta shqiptare*, Vienna, 1924, p. 11.

mother tongue for Albanians, for they to become and be like the other peoples, especially like the Greeks, on which he believed that with Albanians are of the same stock and since the earlier times have had a common homeland. For this role, but also to the “Bleta shqiptare” foreword he writes that “especially, it should be given a cause and encouraging for the Albanian fellows to be educated and study the mother tongue and with this natural way and self-profiting can be civilized and be equal with their Hellenic brothers.”⁴

c. Thimi Mitko accepts the enlightening role of the written Albanian for the civilizations of Albanians and their presentation as a special nation, and in the patriotic line of our national Renaissance, is raised over the religious distinctions and sees the cultivated language as a *unifying and identifying instrument*. He writes that “A nation cannot in no other way exit from barbarism, *except having his proper language* – says Herder. Even Albanians that now are divided into Moslems and Christians, and the latter into Catholics and Orthodox can be enlightened and will lose the dirt of their barbaric ignorance only by studying their mother tongue.”⁵

d. Nevertheless, Mitko under the time and environment conditions where he lived and worked, although he praises the mother tongue, *visibly tightening its role and functions*. For him, the Albanian language in the schools is perceived only in the educating function for the simple and poor people. While the riches that have financial possibilities could also learn Greek as language of culture and civilization. He writes that “The mother tongue is the first common nourishment that gives vitality to the people; as for the high class of the society let it be the most finishing and the most tested as the Greek language is.”⁶

e. Following, also in the Foreword, Mitko admits that *only through the cultivation of the Albanian language in the school can be made possible the recognition of the world civilization*, which he mostly connects with the Greek one. “The Greek civilization, as it’s seen today, can be introduced to few Albanians only, only among those who possess some knowledge. However, how can be introduced the

⁴ Th. Mitko, *Bleta shqiptare*, Vienna, 1924, p. 11.

⁵ Ibid, p. 11-13.

⁶ Ibid, p. 13.

Greek civilization in the majority of Albanians, in the craftsman family and of the industrialist, in the shepherd cabin if the Greek ideas are not diffused with the use of their spoken language?”⁷

f. Thimi Mitko raised against the obstructing policies, and also against the denigrating and annihilation of the time, and also against the orthodox circles activities in Istanbul and Athens *for non-allowing the opening of the Albanian schools and writing Albanian in them*. He strongly raises his voice when he says that “The desire of some to kill the Albanian language even through using the force, is for the Greek simply suck the Albanian race or to annihilate and to allegedly deny its existence, is a terrible mistake, an invention of a short mind, politically rotten and of every non-deserving ‘bid idea.’ Let it be as example the church activity of Istanbul’s Patriarch and of the Athens government against Bulgaria, which instead of unity brought division, and instead of absorption lead to incompatible race hatred.”⁸

g. Convinced of the common blood with the Greeks, Mitko *identifies only the assimilating menace of Albanians from the Slavs* and calls to anticipate the evil danger. The emptiness created by Albanians to cultivate their mother tongue, according to him, would be filled from the evil brought by the northern neighbors, with consequences for the existence of our kind itself. He writes that “If Albania is left in her ignorance, without national letters and without people’s schools, then the Slavs will run along stronger with radical tools to swallow the Albanian race.”⁹

h. Very interesting are the words on “Bleta” about the parts that are connected with the *linguistic phenomenon*, that are selected by the author himself. Here we are bringing for the memory of the reader three columns: *Greetings, personal names, families surnames; The Albanian-Greek vocabulary (with pre-introduction)*, and also *Shënime të ndryshme gjuhësore/Different linguistic notes*. They have become object of papers even in this conference, therefore I am dwelling more on this question. However, we have to stress that they have a great importance to see Mitko’s brand new papers and contributions even in the ethno-linguistic, onomastic, historic, lexical-semantic,

⁷ Ibid, p. 13.

⁸ Ibid, p. 13.

⁹ Ibid, p. 13.

dialectological plane of the Albanian language words borrowing process etc.

II. From the file “Plaku Stathi/Old man Stath,” where are included some sub-files. In the first, is found the original manuscript “Plaku Stathi” (*Plakustathi*, written as a single word, V. M.), the first version, a notebook with 32 pages, ink written; on the second is found the original manuscript “Plaku Stathi” (*Plakustathi*, written as a single word, V. M.), the second version, in 7 notebooks quires, who begins with the page 5 (the four first pages are missing) and is concluded with the page 140, also this version ink written. Within this file is found a special page (that is a review of the page 5 of the second version, on which the scholar Th. Gjika takes it as a third version of the work, but we are not convinced from this pretending). Both versions are brought from Egypt by Prof. Jorgo Bullo on March 1984. We do not know the precise year when the work has been written, although the scholar Thanas Gjika admits that this should be searched between 1880 – 1885.¹⁰ In an intermediary information about the time of the writing we find at the special page (page 5), from the right side of which we have records of a trade register (where are given the nominations of some stocks and their value in francs, and are not written by Thimi Mitko), belonging to the year 1880, what means that, minimally, the second version has started to be written in this year.

The work does not directly treat some linguistic problems, but it is a beautiful artistic accomplishment through Albanian language, demonstrating the Albanian language expressive capabilities, and also Mitko’s talent in the artistic literature, in a time when the Albanian language had many difficulties to be realized as a genuine artistic literature language, because of the late writing of hers. We are bringing in original two short parts, each for a single version, to see not Thimi Mitko’s Albanian language use (as is the aim of this paper), but *Mitko’s language* demonstrated in a work written by him, on which the scholar Th. Gjika says that “as literary work, the manuscript *Plaku Stathi* is part of an original didactic novel. This novel... marks the beginnings of the long Albanian prose. And when we say of the long Albanian prose, we

¹⁰ Th. Gjika, “*Plaku Stathi – një dorëshkrim i Th. Mitkos dhe fillimet e prozës sonë tregimtare*, kumtesë, Arkivi i IGJL, Dosja “Th. Mitko”, p. 3.

have in mind of the artistic prose with secular theme, and more concretely of the Albanian novel.”¹¹

From the first version:

Ndërtojti ngaj gjëri i tij mbë një vënt të bukurë, të xbavitçimë e të shëndetçimë të katundit shkollë (mësonjëtorë, mjeshtërore) të gjerë edhe pru njëheriesht dy mësonjësë të zotët e sendrëqarë, për të mësuar djelmurinë. Po zembërmirësija e Plakustathitë nuku mbeti gjerë këtu. Ay me fuqiën, forcën e ëmbëlsiën e madh të gëluhës së tij, mundi në pak mot të marrë zembrën e dashuriën e gjithë dielmavet të vendit. From the second version:

*Ndonëse umplak ndë dhe të huajë, Plakustathi, asnjë cas nuku haroi të dashurën mëmëdheën e tij, as tëmënë, një plakë, pra, e cila që shumë vjetra po qante vdekjen e shoqit të saj, edhe mërgimin e së birit. As lakmia e arit, as kënaqiat, përgëzimet e ëmbëlsiat e Europës, mbrapsën dot Plakustathin mbë të kthyer ndë vent të tij.*¹²

Only these two parts are enough to see the beauty and the fluency of the artistic narration. However, on this novel should be undertaken multiple studies, they can be done on pure Albanian syntax, on the careful selection of words collection, on inflection forms and word-formation, on the job done in enriching the used lexicon etc. For example, attracts the attention that in every end page, Thimi Mitko explains words that he thinks are foreigner, as new, or unknown for the reader of the time (e.g. the word *shkollë/school* is explained with the Albanian word *mësonjëtorë* and with the other Albanian word on Latin root *mjeshtërore*; the word *mjek/physician* explained with the synonym *shëronjës/healer*, the word *qishë/church* with *hyjëtorë, faltore/temple* etc.). Is a merit of the novel's author, that in every end page except the words explanation with Albanian ones or even with words in Greek etc., he gives priority to the new words of the erudite lexicon, that were taking place step by step in the sapient speeches and especially in the Albanian Renaissance literature and political writing.

III. The file “*Plaku Stathi*” - *një dorëshkrim i Thimi Mitkos dhe fillimet e prozës tregimtare*, paper from Thanas Gjika. In this material, we have an informing paper on work's versions that are found in the

¹¹ Ibid, p. 3.

¹²“*Plaku Stathi*”, second version, in Nëndosja “*Plaku Stathi*”, Dosja Thimi Mitko, Arkivi i IGJL, p. 5.

archive, drafting an initial study on the work that might help anyone for a more complete philological and publishing work, and also a research one on the novel's manuscript/manuscripts. We are stressing here that the paper also keeps traces of the time when has been drafted. Pursuing our aim about the Albanian language paradigm in the materials that are found in the Files on "Thimi Mitko" in the archive, we are giving the opinion of the scholar Th. Gjika about the language of the work "Plaku Stathi.". According to him, "This novel of Thimi Mitko, nonetheless unfinished, has important value according to the use of language. Seen as a whole, this manuscript shows that Mitko since the first half of the '80ies of the XIX century was for a literary language based on the Tosk dialect and enriched with words, expressions and grammatical forms of the Gheg dialect and of the Arbëresh language of Italy and Greece. A very sane idea that has found today full application."¹³

The assessment or the affirmation that *Mitko was for a literary language based on the Tosk dialect*, seems to us hasty. In the years when the work was written (according to Gjika, between 1880-1885), was worked and fought for the Albanian school and Albanian writing and still was out of question the idea for a literary language based on a specific dialectic aim. Mitko has written in the dialect that he belonged, in Tosk. Even if we find Gheg and Arbëresh elements in his language, this demonstrates that his job to collect folkloric assets from the mouth of Albanians, without prejudicing their ethnic-geographic origin, was not spontaneous, but conscientious. The lexicon units etc., that has drawn his attention or which his personal Tosk didn't have acquiescence units, have naturally taken place in his creativity, as an asset of the whole Albanian language. This is another side that should be appreciated on Mitko. Also, it seems to us very farsighted the affirmation that his used language fulfills a very sane idea that has found complete application in the '80s of the XX century, when the paper was presented and when the Albanian language has more than a decade that was codified and standardized. Nevertheless, also this affirmation of the scholar Th. Gjika, encourages for further research even in the field of the language of the work *Plaku Stathi*.

¹³ Ibid, p. 5.

III. The File H – 58 Letra/Letters. In this file are found 5 letters,¹⁴ coming from the Prof. Koço Bihiku, from which only one is related to Th. Mitko: *Një letër e Th. Mitkos dërguar z. Krispi, anëtar i Parlamentit italian/A letter from Th. Mitko sent to Mr. Crispi member of the Italian Parliament*. The document is a photocopy of a letter of handwriting on three notebook pages (or 3 pages of an A4 letter translated in two parts). The letter is not original, but hastily copied from someone, has shown problem to translate it from the Italian into Albanian. The letter dates in Cairo on 21 June 1879. From this letter we are detaching those parts that are connected with the Albanian language and Albanians nationality. Thimi Mitko writes to Mr. Crispi, a renowned political personality and very important at that time and, as it's said in the archival denomination of the letter, also member of the Italian parliament. In the letter, about the spirit of the time and in Mitko efforts course with other fellow countrymen on the national question, taking a stand towards the southern neighbors of the country, asking to Mr. Crispi, this important personality in the political decision-taking in Italy and beyond, to work, fight and help that also Albanians should have at all costs a *language, nationality, homeland*. Mitko writes to him that “The Greeks forbid in Albania and Greece the learning of the Albanian language... It is time that Albanians should have their language and nationality. In my national pleasure I know (have learned) that you have taken the initiative to establish in Rome a Hellenistic commission favoring Greece and Albania and I appreciate your noble and generous patriotic feelings. However, allow me to remind you that it is an absolute necessity for Albania to have the proper language and nationality and to be guaranteed her homeland.”¹⁵

IV. The file- the letters of Mitko, on inscription by Qemal Haxhihasani. The file's denomination should be reworded, because in

¹⁴ The file has documents on 1879, includes 5 letters (which are included in this file that has more direct connection with Crispi rather than Mitko):

- *Two letters of a northern Epirus group elements, sent to Mr. Crispi, member of the Italian Parliament* - *A letter of Th. Mitko sent to Mr. Crispi, member of the Italian Parliament*.

- *A letter in English*

- *A letter to C. M. Buscalioni sent to Mr. Crispi, member of the Italian Parliament*.

¹⁵ The File H-58, A letter of Th. Mitko sent to Mr. Crispi, member of the Italian Parliament, IGJL Archive, Tirana.

it, we don't have Mitko's letters, but letters on Mitko. There are 10 letters typed in three copies in the file, and each letter is accompanied with the letter where the typing has been based, swiftly handwritten by the scholar Qemal Haxhihasani. The latter has made possible these letters to be read in the today Albanian alphabet. The letters in general treat property problems, borrowing, trade etc. and in none of them we couldn't find elements bound with the Albanian or for the Albanian language.

Also in the File are two other materials:

a. "Albanian poem by *Apostol Papadhopulli the promising of the Albanian-Italians to write their language*" (21 typed pages). The poem has 80 stanzas each with six verses, in total 480 verses.

b. *Texts in Albanian laterally written in this letter*, with subtitle *Transliteration/Transliteration*. In this material, that is documented in three typed pages (three copies) we find some songs, majority of which are connected to Sul. The scholar Q. Haxhihasani is based on the film materials taken in Denmark and through transliteration, has prepared the songs for the volume Th. Mitko, Vepra, Tiranë 1981.

V. On linguistic interest in the Archive is the File K/2- nr. 166, Letters of Thimi Mitko sent to De Rada, 1881 -1887, Copied in the Albanological Archive of Prishtina, Copenhagen Record (Taken by Koço Bihiku and Jorgo Bullo on November 1978). The material comes also copied from the Copenhagen Royal Library (Denmark) from Emil Lafe and Ali Dhrimo (material that is situated as photocopy in the file Ç/10- 76, pp. 15-17, 28-29 and 32-53).

In the cover page of the file K/2- nr. 166 is written *26 peace of letters*, but there are found only 13 with 23 pages in total. From the letters we have selected the information connected on the Albanian language, as primal sign of Albanians identification, to write their alphabet, on obstructions and obstructers of this process, on the efforts that were made to open Albanian schools in Albania etc. In brief we are listing:

a. The letter of De Rada, 20 January 1881 (photocopy), Mitko writes that "For our misfortune (per nostra disgrazia) the books in

Albanian cannot be sell (non possono vendere)... this is bad, because ... it have to be open Albanian schools across the country.”¹⁶

b. In the letter for De Rada on 23 April 1881 BMK, F G/3, nr. 117, p. 1 (photocopy), the author of the letter treats a known problem for the time, the problem that the Greek government and specific circles, as Athens Patriarch etc., wouldn't allow the Albanian language to be written. Mitko sends De Rada the poem *Mbë shqiptarët/On Albanians* and among others writes “Do gjenjesh një pun’istori brenda për grekërit, që së lënë sa të bënë shkronjëza (letere) shqypëje shqiptarët/You'll find a story within on Greeks, that forbid Albanians to have their letters.”¹⁷

c. In the letter for De Rada, on 18 July 1881, BMK, D Ç/10, nr. 76, pp. 36-37 (photocopy), that coincides with the time of the Albanian League of Prizren (that: is living as men, but the worst thing is that not the entire country stood up), Mitko asks that “Why the government does not permits nor within nor outside to freely write?”¹⁸

d. In the letter for De Rada, on 31 May 1882, BMK, D Ç/10, nr. 76, pp. 39-40 (photocopy) the patriot raises an important problem that in his country Albania, couldn't be opened Albanian schools, couldn't be written the Albanian language and couldn't be published books in Albanian, if would be lack of money. As shows the entire correspondence not only with De Rada, and also with other fellow countrymen across the world etc., the main finance source on this, continuously, has been the charity of the abroad Albanians (emigrants in different settlements in Turkey, Romania, Egypt, Greece etc.). Mitko writes in the letter, among others, also for the fact that “today Vreto went in Constantinople, after doing here a good job. Was written a lot on your help in Egypt and all Albanians have desire to give money for the language...”¹⁹

e. In the letter for De Rada, 18 March 1883, BMK, D Ç/10, nr. 76, pp. 41-42 (photocopy) Mitko writes, always in the line on writing the Albanian language across the country that “Joyfully I took the coltsfoot

¹⁶ Th. Mitko, *Vepra*, botim i Institutit të Kulturës Popullore, ASHSH, Tiranë, 1981, p. 647.

¹⁷ Ibid, p. 649.

¹⁸ Ibid, p. 652.

¹⁹ Ibid, p. 656.

awaited so long. He was happier for the beautiful job done by Leonardo de Martino in Shkodra to renew our language. I am happier and I want to buy that so much useful book. Let's start to see the light our unfortunate language, and God's willing your printing house will give a strong encouragement to it."²⁰ We remind that in "Bleta's" Foreword he sees Shkodra threatened by the Montenegrins and their language, therefore his joy on this letter on the job done for the Albanian language in the ancient northwestern city and in the cradle of the centennial patriotism is more than justifiable.

f. In the letter for De Rada, 10 November 1883, BMK, D Ç/10, nr. 76, pp. 43-44 (photocopy) among others Mitko treats an issue of the Tosk dialect phoneme: "The major part of Albania has a vowel as y (u in French) and an *i* Greek e.g., *sy/eye (oeil)* that unfortunately the southern Albanians, Çamëria and Epirus do not have. I think is more than necessary to have it."²¹

g. While in the letter for De Rada of 22 January 1885, BMK, D E/9, nr. 103, (photocopy), he writes that "In Bucharest of Romania is done a beautiful Syllogism for our language. Also the papers of Europe are writing good for Albania,"²² showing that the job of Albanians in the settlements abroad (The Albanian Community in Romania has a special place in the Renaissance movement) has been determinant for the writing of the Albanian language and for the opening of the Albanian national school.

h. In the letter for De Rada on 20 May 1885, BMK, D C/10, nr. 76, p. 46 (photocopy), Th. Mitko raises over the personal stands that he kept towards other drafted alphabets of the time, even against his own tradition of writing with Greek alphabet and supports Istanbul's alphabet of the *Printing Albanian Letters Association*: "Welcome with Bucharest alphabet, which as I heard was published, but I haven't seen it yet".

And further with this letter, corresponding with De Rada, he keeps a stand towards the Corfu Committee for his anti-Albanian activity: "Few days ago I sent a coltsfoot to the Corfu Committee as you can see. Believe me, that committee serves to Greece and lies to Albania. I

²⁰ Ibid, pp. 660-661.

²¹ Ibid, p. 662.

²² Ibid, p. 670.

know this very well. It is required “Flamburi” and other Italian language diaries to fight against that mendacious Committee (inganatori).”²³

i. In the letter for De Rada, 16 February 1886, BMK, D Ç/10, nr. 76, pp. 47-48; (photocopy) becomes apparent another component of Mitko's missionary work about the national question. He sees the Arbëresh population of Italy as part of the pan-Albanian population and wishes and asks that it shouldn't lose the identity and the connection with the homeland. Directly or indirectly this is visible from numerous correspondences with De Rada, but also with other Arbëresh as Camarda, Crispi etc. In this letter he wishes to be fulfilled a dream and an earlier effort to introduce the Albanian language in the Arbëresh schools. He writes to De Rada that “God willing may the Albanian language enters among your schools, as a first step (per principio), as ‘Flamburi’ writes.”²⁴

j. In the letter for De Rada, 14 February 1887, BMK, D Ç/10, nr. 76, pp. 52-53; (photocopy), among others, we find the gratitude for Anastas Avramidhi (head of “Dituria” association of Bucharest), one of the most contributing figures for the Albanian language and one of the most respected personalities by Mitko. He writes that “We, the Albanians of Egypt are sending a gratitude letter to A. Avramidhi with some 50 – 60 signatures of Christians and Moslems, for his generosity of giving (25.000 napoleons, not sterling) for our language and we will send him to Bucharest. If you can, my Lord, is better for you to sign it because he will be pleased and is in his intentions to give more money except these.”²⁵

k. In the letter for De Rada, 29 October 1887, BMK, D Ç/10, nr. 76, pp. 50-51; (photocopy), we have an information about the requests that Mitko has for himself, and already writes with Istanbul's alphabet. He writes to his friend: “Tell me how does it looks like my writing. I want to push a little this case (causa), as our savants may come out, and everybody might have an opinion on this.”

In the letter is also noted, his continuous interest about the Albanian Saint Adrian College, where De Rada was a teacher. Mitko

²³ Ibid, pp. 673-674.

²⁴ Ibid, p. 678.

²⁵ Ibid, pp. 689 - 690.

asks him that “You shall write me if our language was driven in at your college?” And at the end of the letter we find: “I desire and try as much as I can send 2-3 boys there to the most excellent schools of our nation, but because we don’t have cases; sometimes they tell me yes, sometimes no. Therefore, I beg for your pardon. “The young Albanian” will take the Albanian alphabet.”²⁶

1. In the archive of the Institute of Linguistic and Literature is found another letter of Mitko sent to De Rada, 1 March 1887, that is not included in the volume *Vepra*, 1981. In the letter we have an information for a reply of A. Avramidhi for Korça's metropolis and for tens of persons that Mitko calls them *Korça's traitors* by writing “*kjë kishin shcrojtur pljot me ipocrizië e me dialëszë posi Judha Iscarioti*”. *Pach nga chëto emëra janë për të hedhur ndë pasë (in pece), këtë mohojën gjuhën e tyre, se të shumitë janë të gcënjyerë prej denacut Metropolit, e nuch i kjendronën chetij as 10 emëra të vërtetë mikj/They are full of hypocrisy and malice like Judas Iscariot.*” Few from these names are to be thrown away, they deny their language, because many are deceived from the liar Metropolis and he doesn't have even 10 friends among them.”

Reading the letter we observe that “Kjevernja e Rumuniësë ndih fort shumë Shkjypëriësë për gjuhën me anë të Naciosë, këtë të të mundojë me chëtë udhë të shpërndanjë edh’ajo gjuhën Rumune nëpër Shkjypëri/The Romanian government helps very much Albania through the nation, and through this it can spread the Romanian language throughout Albania.”

In this letter we also have linguistic information on some words that belong to the Arbëresh lexicon and on which Mitko says that are not found in the Albanian language in this part of the sea. He writes to De Rada that “Your words – *mosse, mbiatu, pocca* – among us are not found at all. Instead of them we have *gjithënjë, ngaherë, gjithmonë = sempre/always; saacakje, ndëciast, filkal = subito/immediately; papo, prapo, adha, paspo = dunque/therefore.*”²⁷

VI. The File Ç/10- 76, Kartyty e Thimit Mitkoit (Miscellanea Euthymii Mitcoi), Mikrofilmi P/9-nr 63, (Copied in Denmark, Theka

²⁶ Ibid, p. 701.

²⁷ After the letter of Th. Mitko, March 1, 1887 sent to De Rada. IGJL Archive, dosja Letra për De Radën.

III -2), with 52 photographic letters). This file in the 4-5 pages has a damaged manuscript from humidity with two columns in Albanian and Italian (We don't understand why this page is selected as photography for the volume Th. Miko, Vepra, Tiranë 1981); from the pages 6-9, marked as Tetty Ilipusha of Euthimity Mitkoity written with grammatiaty ty gkrikja (sent to Dimitrity e Camardes?) we have the photocopy of the original manuscript of the poem *Mbë shqipëtarët* of Mitko, published on 1881 (see the file E/1- 97, Konka e Mitkoity ty Kurtshotitu, Poiema albanou pros tous albanous. Microfilm Q/3- nr. 67, taken in Denmark.) From page 10-14 of the documents of the file we have *Ty bonuraty e shkokjerisy "Drita" ndy Bukarest*, manuscriptum Euthymi Mitconis, with the note of great importance/multi interest. While on the pages 18-19 we have the column with Mitko's questions for De Rada. These have linguistic importance, because the author through the columns *Cë do-methënë (cosa significo/what does it means)* asks for words and explanations, for word writing and inflection paradigm elements or for other linguistic problems that present difficulties for him etc. We are giving as example a word: "*shqotë* skjottë (ndër ne/among us) tskjottë = dborë e butë gjithë tsopaszë si pambuk (cattone) pa erë/soft snow as cotton with no smell."

In the following pages are given two texts written by the hand of Thimi Mitko, one is a hymn for Anastas Avramidhi (pp. 21-22), the next is the poem "Korça" of N. Frashëri, one of the most known poems in the Albanian word. Ongoing are done the photographic copies of 14 letters that Mitko has sent to De Rada (above-mentioned).

Always at the function of paper's theme, we are focusing on three stanzas of the *Ymnë (Himn/Hymn) on Anastas-Avramidin Cortsarin në Bucuresh*, from which the last two treat the Albanian language.

The poem begins with the verses:

*Ngrehu Shqipëri të thotë
sado je shtrirë mbi gjumë,
Helmjuarë shtrirë mbi botë
Me varra me plaga shumë...*

And continuous (remembering us the monumental verses of Naim Frashëri, *Ti Shqipëri me ep nder, më ep emërin shqiptar!):*

Ti më dhe gjuhë edh'emër

*Më kale afsh të dëlirë
Më çele mënt edhe zemër
Më dhe zakon të mirë.*

While the third stanza selected by us, distinguishes A. Avramidhi's work:

*Ditënë që Avramidi
Hapi për gjuhën kuvendin
Ndë Skjypëri zbriti
yli Gazsi mbuljoj vendin.
Cairë, martë (Cairo, Tuesday, 1885)*

VII. The File 7, nr. 83, with 76 pages, from which 73 are copies of the microfilm 0/3, nr. 43 (Theka II, 13) taken in Copenhagen, with the denomination "*Doratyshkruara t'arbyresha e Timi Mitkoit ty shkruara me alfabetin i Gkrikjyvet*". The material is published in the collection Th. Mitko, Vepra, 1981. Important for us is that the last four pages (73-76) present linguistic interest, because gives a vocabulary. The author himself in original entitles this four pages as *Leksegrafia*. And in it prevails the double words Greek-Albanian (we are giving as example with the Albanian words *Uthull/sour, i ahtëtë; enë; n' enë gja, resk / resku / reskun*; Also, presents interest for studies the illustrative examples, *si ku rafsha mos u vrafsha/happy-go-lucky; thashë të bënë, s'e bëra dot* etc.

VIII. The sub-file E/1- 97, Konka e Mitkoity ty Kurtshotitu, Pojema albanou pros tous albanous. Microfilm Q/3- nr. 67, taken in Denmark. The poem is in two columns, the left column is in Albanian, while the other, the right one is the translation in Greek of the poem *Mbi Shqipëtarët/On albanians*. The publishing, two-pages and with 72 verses, is of 1981 in Egypt.

In the publishing of the People's Culture, Vepra, Tiranë, 1981, we have a shorter version of the poem with 57 verses (15 verses less), also here entitled *Mbë shqiptarët/On Albanians*, with comments connected to the events of 1881, when Ulqin is surrendered to Monte Negro from the Great Powers.

In the publishing of the People's Culture we have another poem, *Mbë shqiptarët/On Albanians*, with a version of 151 verses (also this

published in Cairo of Egypt on 1880). In the published version, we are detaching some verses, where is shown the role of the language as an identification, unity and harmony instrument:

*Sa flasin shqipen të tërë,
Edhe quhen shqipëtarë
Perëndia i ka bërë
Në fëmijë (familje) të pandarë.*²⁸

IX. The File Ë / 2- nr. 108, entitled De Rada's Paper published in *Fiamurin e*

Arbërit on 2 January 1883 on Thimi Mitko. The material is a copy of the microfilm R/6- nr. 80, copied in Florence. The file contains 6 pages, three of which belong the writing of the Arbëresh Renaissance figure. The paper shows once more the cooperation of Mitko with De Rda, and the appraisal that is made from *Fjamuri i Arbërit* to the publishing of *Bëljetës Shqipëtare*, on 1878, in Alexandria of Egypt.

Also interesting in the Archive are some materials of Albanian scholars on Th. Mitko. We are showing up two of them:

I. The file Ilo Mitkë Qafëzëzi, "Thimi Kostë Mitko," a monograph with 23 quires that include 422 half pages A₄. If we stop only to the chapter *Leksilogu apo vokabulari shqip i "Mbletës shqiptare" të Mitkos*, among other things is written that "Th. Mitko introduces on the lexicographer approximately almost 1000 foreign words, Turkish etc., among which we have put in evidence, by leaving out only a small number. According to the opinion of the writer, all these foreign words need to get out of Albanian language and to be replaced by Greek words."²⁹

I. M. Qafëzëzi has also translated Mitko's foreword, that presnets a big interest for our paper: Pre-introduction. The following "*Leksilogu shqip-greqisht/Albanian-Greek lexicographer*" mostly enrolls those foreign words that have entered in the Albanian language and on which

²⁸ Th. Mitko, *Vepra*, botim i Institutit të Kulturës Popullore, ASHSH, Tiranë, 1981, p. 597.

²⁹ I. M. Qafëzezi, Thimi Kostë Mitko – leksilogu shqip i tija, in "Thimi Kostë Mitko", p. 366.

still are met in the folklore collection, which are most usual in speaking Albanian among the dialects of big Albania and also a number of rare Albanian words, close to the latter, similar words with the ancient Greek language.

Among these few examples from the small glottologic comparison, the Albanian people will understand because even who does not recognizes the Albanian language, will know that these words are first of all foreigner and do not have any kind of relations with Albanians and the Albanian language, having a sort of close kinship with the ancient Greek, has no connection with the Turkish; or with the Persian or the Arabic and neither with the Slavic, from whom these foreign words have been introduced, that are among all excessive, unnecessary and ugly for the Albanian.

So, such words, on foreign origin and roots, the Albanian people will throw them away because except the fact that is excessive, they corrupt the language as inappropriate with the words in Albanian. When we talk of real linguistic necessities, that's the way it should be to borrow words from the Greek as from a natural source.

I didn't consider to touch those foreign words and to change them in Albanian, for not to be presupposed that I harm the true origin of the songs and other works of the people. For this aim, by collecting these words, I am collocating on this work to make them known.³⁰

We are not focusing anymore in a further examination of the dictionary. It is part of the publishing "Thimi Mitko, Vepra, Tiranë, 1981 (p. 479, 522). While the Academy of Sciences and the scholar Dh. Qirjazi have made one of the best scientific publishing, bringing Mitko's dictionary, *Fjalëtore shqip - gërqisht, gërqisht - shqip dhe ndihmesa të tjera leksikografike*³¹ in a contemporary format and with a complete theoretical essay. Also recently, has been published *Thimi Mitko, Fjalor greqisht - shqip*, on two volumes (the first volume is authentic publication of the manuscript; the second volume, the transliteration and the Albanian vocabulary), Tiranë, 2013, prepared by Shpëtim Sala.

³⁰ I. M. Qafëzezi, *Thimi Kostë Mitko – leksilogu shqip i tija*, in "Thimi Kostë Mitko", pp. 368-369.

³¹ AShSh, Dh. Q. Qirjazi, *Fjalëtore shqip - gërqisht, gërqisht - shqip dhe ndihmesa të tjera leksikografike*, Tiranë, 2014.

In the Archive at the File of I. M. Qafëzezi, are also some letters of Th. Mitko about the personalities of the time. We focus on some of them to treat among other things the problem of the Albanian language and its writing.

a. In the letter on Thimo Krei, 17 May 1877 (translation from the Greek, copy), Mitko, after expresses that "I'm happy for your noble zeal towards our homeland and I appreciate your work on describing Albania" writes that "about the backwarded Albania's culture, would be a very successful work the establishing in Egypt a typography with some modification to continuously print Albanian books and newspaper... By working like this, a good society will achieve to write our language, by establishing one or two schools in the center of Albania, also will make money by selling different works."³²

b. In the letter for Thimo Krei, 9 December / May 1877 (copy), Mitko demands to Mr. Th. Krei on explaining two Albanian words. He writes that "Please accept my apologies because I want to ask you on two Albanian words, because only you may enlighten me. At the end of my letter I am writing you those two or three words."³³ (The words are *orë*, *korë*, *kodhe*). In the letter is visible the careful work of the Renaissance figure on the folkloric assets that he has collected to accurately give every material and catches the eye the humbleness and the modesty to ask the others, especially on words that do not belong to the languages he knows and by searching them before on the Albanian lexicon record or on those who know better than him the assets of the mother tongue.

c. In four other Th. Mitko's letters, by perceiving that many alphabets harm the Albanian question, unjustly raises against the work of Jani Vreto for an Albanian alphabet, even why constantly justifies this stand. There he shows himself extreme, controversial and contradictory, even using a "language", which sometimes lacks the elements of the culture and civilization (in his letters on Jani Vreto we find such epithets as, *short-sighted*, *ignoble*, *superficial*, *stupid* etc.).

c. 1. In the letter for Thimo Krei, 3/15 June 1878 (translation from Greek, copy), he is against the alphabet drafted by J. Vreto and also opposes Th. Krei who supported Vreto's achievement. In the letter he

³² Th. Mikto, *Vepra*, Tiranë, 1981, p. 619.

³³ Ibid, p. 621.

writes: "I am deeply afflicted that you are completely conquered by the wrong idea of Vreto's alphabet, because with partial and disordered things we are providing an opportunity for the foreigner to make joke of us and from the other side, we are removing to the Albanian people the zeal towards his language and the conviction for a right end of this question"³⁴.

Among other things in the letter, he also informs that "temporarily I am writing Albanian with Greek letters, as the Gheg write with Latin words. By standing for a national alphabet, we have on the late... (probably he means on Theodhor Haxhifilipi, V.M.), the Elbasan letters which are of Albanian property and not those ridiculous of Vreto..."³⁵

c. 2. In the letter for Thimo Krei, 10 / 22 June 1878 (translation from Greek) following the correspondence with this figure, Mitko rudely writes and even insults J. Vreto's work on the Albanian alphabet. In the latter are given 5 arguments to topple Vreto's work.

c. 3. In the letter to Thimo Krei, 12 July 1878 (translation from Greek, copy), he continuous the same unjustified stand on J. Vreto's alphabet. There is written that "According to Vreto, in my opinion, I respect and love him only for the sake of his feelings, but not for his useless insistence on his unreasonable alphabet. Vreto's alphabet, as you remember, we agreed to present for approval to the competent men, but he refused to come to the negotiation with Camarda. Therefore, as consequence, I myself presented it to another philologist, which does not approve it. My dear, I think that you will believe after that, nonetheless I have as witness the opinion of Anastas Berati, who read it."

After demanding argument after argument to justify his stand against Vreto, Mitko writes "For you to publish something good in our language, may it be with Greek letters (in absence of our letters), or in Latin, or in Chinese, this is a good work, but to use Vreto's method (the alphabet) with the idea to be introduced on the Albanian people (through Spiro's charities) such a thing is ridiculous and as consequence, a big harm to the homeland, and I assure you on my honor dear friend, that I am sorry for you to be guilty for this. Such intrigues and others that our enemies fabricate, pushed by evil and

³⁴ Ibid, p. 623.

³⁵ Ibid, p. 623-624.

cunning passions, sacrifice for the sake of their sorrow, everything that is gracious and sacred, through division and disunity, and by other means, only to satisfy the proper passion.³⁶

c. 4. Also in the letter to Thimo Krei, 2 August 1878 (translation from Greek, copy), again we are in the line of arguing and presenting the causes why he opposes J. Vreto. Among others he writes that "You of Shibin (city in Egypt where lived and worked Thimo Krei, V.M.), if you would help with money to publish another Albanian work with seemingly a brand new alphabet, you're wrong and will harm very much the homeland, instead of bringing benefits." While, below, emphasizes that "also the cultivation from the grammar side of the language is not achieved but with a powerful society. If this has not been made yet because of a caressless stand, we cannot fulfill with such measures, which cause more confusion, coldness and disgust on the nation." At the end of the letter he reminds to Th. Krei that, how another Albanian in Athens has informed him (is talking about A. Kullurioti, V.M.), who intent to publish another Albanian alphabet and newspaper."³⁷

In the archive is also found the File "Ziaudin Kodra" in which are included three sub-files / quires:

a. Ziaudin Kodra, Papa Kristo Negovani – martyr teacher of the Albanian school (17 pages);

b. Ziaudin Kodra, the love for the homeland on the Renaissance figures (117), where we have different typed writings and manuscripts.

c. Ziaudin Kodra, "Bleta Shqiptare" – on the occasion of the 70 anniversary of Mitko's death. The author of the paper emphasizes that "from the way how Mitko worked on 'Bleta' we understand that he loved with all his heart the Albanian people and language", it stresses the fact that "Bleta's publishing had its extraordinary importance among others that, renewed on Albanians the national sensibility and the love for the Albanian language." Also in the paper is stressed that "Mitko's Bleta Shqiptare became an important support for the foreign scholars of the Albanian language; there they could find precise material on Albanian language" (mentioning among other things that

³⁶ Ibid, pp. 627-628.

³⁷ Ibid, pp. 629 - 630.

Gustav Meyer has published all the 12 tales of Bleta in Archiv Für Lieteraturgeschichte).

Very interesting is the affirmation of Mr. Kodra that “except Albanian and Greek, as its comes out from some notes, that has made Bletën e Vogël/the Little Bee, Eftim Mitko knows very well the Italian and the French. Those notes in Italian and French written with a secure language and without orthographic mistakes.”³⁸

By concluding this paper, more informing rather than analyzing, I emphasize once more what we said at the beginning, that the Albanian language through the Files of Th. Mitko in the Archive of the Institute of Linguistic and Literature, requires a more complete work, more time and more research. Let's promise that we shall fulfill it as soon as possible.

³⁸ For the quatations on this half-title see Dosja Ziaudin Kodra, 38, Arkivi i IGJL.

REVIEWS

THE CONTRIBUTION OF KOLEC TOPALLI ON THE ISSUE OF THE ALBANIAN ARTICLES (On the monograph "Nyjat e shqipes", Toena, Tiranë, 2009, 380 pp.)

Among his many studies on specific problems of the historical grammar of the Albanian language, the issue of articles has especially drawn the attention of Kolec Topalli, by dedicating to it a special monograph. "Nyjat e shqipes/The Albanian articles" is a complete monographic study for all the kinds of Albanian articles, of special interest for the fact that the Albanian language, unlike other European languages, presents the specificity of two types of articles, the prepositive and the post positive article. Basing on the foregoing knowledge and in the present science's achievements, the author has introduced the whole complex issue of the Albanian articles and has been attempting to resolve the problems left in suspense or solved unpersuasively. The previous opinions and theories have been subjected to critical judgment, and, after being analyzed under valuated to stand to the language facts, are taken as basis to further develop the author's personal theses, or are used as negative arguments on which is raised a new theory, different from the previous ones.

This approach lies on the basis of one the main issues of the monographs, that is the way of rising of the articles, on which the author has given an important contribution by presenting in the scientific debate a new view to explain this problem, one of the most unclear and complicated in the history of the articles of Albanian language and its historical grammar. Until today there is not a unique

stand for this problem¹, but as it's known, there are two main theses, that of La Piana - Çabej and that of Pedersen - Riza, which mainly distinguish from each other by the precedence chronological priority that the first thesis gives to the prepositive article, and the second to the postpositive article. These theses view the starting point of the rising of the articles in the structure noun + adjective.

Pedersen, starting from the similar structures of the Danish language (dan. *brond hin dyhe* → *bronden dyhe* → *bronden hin dyhe*, shq. *pus i thellë* → *pusi thellë* → *pusi i thellë*), considers the prepositive article of the adjective as primary in relation to the postpositive article of the noun and the latter derived from the former². Meanwhile, he traces the accusative article *në-* back to an ancient proto-Albanian basis and in this point he is in the same line with La Piana, which argues the greater antiquity of the postpositive article, prior the penetration of Latin borrowings³. In this way, according to Pedersen theses, the accusative article would make an exception from the other postpositive articles of Albanian language. Pedersen's formula is supported and explained by N. Mjeda⁴, Al. Graur for the Scandinavian, Romanian and Albanian languages⁵ and further argued by S. Riza⁶ and B. Bokshi⁷, which starts from an opposite order: pre-articulated adjective + noun (**i thellë pus*). Çabej, on the contrary supports the thesis of the greater antiquity of the postpositive article, as well as La Piana, and this he argues in a very explanatory and

¹ For a historical treatment of the Albanian articles see S. Riza, "Historiku e kritika e trajtimeve të deritanishme të nyjave të shqipes nga gramatikanët përshkrues", *Studime filologjike*, nr. 3-4, 1991, p. 87-115.

² H. Pedersen, "Bidrag til den albanesiske sproghistorie", *Festskrift til Vilhelm Thomsen*, 1894, p. 248.

³ M. La Piana, *Studi Linguistici Albanesi I*, Palermo, 1939, p. 29 v.

⁴ N. Mjeda, *Vrejtje mbi artikuj e premna pronës të gjuhës shqipe*, Shkodër, 1934, p. 20.

⁵ Al. Graur, "Questions latino-roumaines. 2. A propos de l'article postposé", *Romania*, 50, Paris, 1929, p. 475 vv.; Ibid, "Autour de l'article postposé", *Bulletin Linguistique*, V, Paris – București, 1937, p. 204v.; Ibid, "De nouveau sur l'article postposé en roumain", *Revue Roumaine de Linguistique*, nr. 1, Bucarest, 1967. For the Albanian this thesis is supported even by E. Likaj, "Disa çështje të zhvillimit historik të nyjave në gjuhën shqipe", *Studime Filologjike*, nr. 4, 1977.

⁶ S. Riza, "Nyjat e shqipes", *Buletin i USHT. Seria Shkencat Shoqërore*, nr. 4, 1958, p. 11 v; Ibid, "Probleme të nyjave të shqipes", *SF*, nr.1, 1982, p. 121 v.

⁷ B. Bokshi, *Rruga e formimit të fleksionit të sotëm nominal të shqipes*, Prishtinë, 1980; Ibid, *Prapavendosja e nyjës në gjuhët ballkanike*, Prishtinë, 1984.

convincing way⁸. In accordance with Jokl, Çabej extends the chronology of the articles formation to the period of the Latin age as a *terminus post quem non*. Çabej thesis is approved by Sh. Demiraj⁹ and, in general lines, also by K. Topalli.

These two main theses about the formation of the Albanian articles are passed through the screen of the critical examination in Topalli's study and weaknesses are found. One of his main remarks for the theses of the prepositive article of the adjective as antecedent and cause of the postposition of the article to the noun, is the argument that the adjectives have not the definite category and cannot define, as they express a quality of the noun, so the adjectives articles cannot have a definition function. He agrees more with Çabej's arguments, but with the reservation that this scholar has not clarified how the postpositive article of the noun was formed, from which derived the prepositive article. He especially does not accept as real Çabej's assertion that "the deictic pronoun who accompanied the noun and then became article, has been time ago enclitic and in this position was early melted with that noun". The author relies on the facts of modern Albanian and of other European languages that have articles, that show that the demonstrative pronoun has always been in the position before the noun: *ai burrë, ajo grua*, in Italian, *quest'uomo, questa donna*, Engl. *this man/that women*, Germ. *dieser Mensch* etc.

As to chronology, the enclitic position cannot be of the ancient Indo-European age where the determinatives could have had freer word order, but of a later period, when in Albanian the declension of the nouns was partially or totally lost, and in these conditions the order of the determinatives tends to fixing, in order to distinguish the word functions. So, the main problem for the author is to explain the postposition of the demonstrative pronoun in Albanian language, as an exclusion from the general rule of the preposition of demonstrative pronouns in the Indo-European languages that have formed articles.

⁸ E. Çabej, "Rreth disa çështjeve të historisë së gjuhës shqipe", in *Studime Gjuhësore IV*, Rilindja, Prishtinë, 1977, p. 111v. First published in *BUSHT SSHSH*, nr. 1, 1963. See further arguments in his reply towards S. Riza's objections about the issue of articles in: "Për disa çështje të morfologjisë historike të shqipes dhe të metodës shkencore", *Gjurmime albanologjike (Shkencat filologjike)* 41/42, Prishtinë, 2011/2012, p. 21-51.

⁹ Sh. Demiraj, *Sistemi i lakimit në gjuhën shqipe*, Tiranë, 1975, p. 164 v.; *Ibid*, *Gramatikë historike e gjuhës shqipe*. Tiranë, 1985, p. 308 v.

To solve this problem, the author has searched new ways basing on the record of today's Albanian. He constructs a formula, which unlike the schemes of previous scholars, doesn't see the starting point in the structure noun + adjective, but in the genitive determined phrase: noun + noun in genitive¹⁰. His scheme is **i mish i dash*, meaning "this meat of this ram" where both elements are defined. This formula starts from the preposition of the demonstrative pronoun(*a*)*i* reduced in a contracted demonstrative, which realized the definiteness by analytical means. In the defined genitival construction, the demonstrative pronoun with function of definiteness, prepositioned to the second definite substantive joined the foregoing substantive in the phonetic syntactical process, thus becoming a definite article¹¹. Such processes of the syntactic phonetics have often occurred in the Albanian language as consequence of the tied pronunciation¹².

This formula has been put forward as a new thesis about the formation of the articles in Albanian language, but without definitively solving this problem, which is destined to remain at the level of hypotheses, as it deals with old, undocumented stages of language, mainly reconstructed through logical deductions, although basing as well in real and documented language facts. However, some remarks can be made to this thesis, which were also presented in the discussion of the work "The articles of Albanian" at the Grammar department of the Institute of Linguistics and Literature. I shall focus on two principal remarks.

1. The starting from the genitive phrase (noun + noun in genitive) and not from the adjective phrase, helps the author as it seems to avoid the difficulty caused by the assumption of the existence of the definite article at the adjective, which has not the category of definiteness. Indeed, this has never been stated in the various theses on the formation

¹⁰The thesis about the birth of the article from the genitive case of the nouns according the initial model *noun + adpositional element + noun* (later *noun + adpositional element + determinative*) was put forward for scientific discussion in the same time also by Aristotel Spiro, in "The parallel evolution of postpositive and prepositive articles in Albanian", *Albanohellenica* 2, 2000-1, 45-50. Anyhow he doesn't accept a prepositional anaphoric demonstrative in this scheme.

¹¹K. Topalli, *Nyjat e shqipes*, Toena, Tiranë, 2009, p. 47-70.

¹²See W. Cimochowski, "Recherches sur l'histoire du sandhi dans la langue albanaise", *Lingua Posnaniensis* II, 1950.

of articles. When it comes to the formation of the article in the Balkan Latin, in the phrase *homo ille bonus* it is supposed that the adjective, preceded by the demonstrative pronoun *ille*, followed a *definite* noun (semantically defined). In this case the demonstrative served as a morphological and syntactic emphasis of the adjective. So, the formula *homo ille bonus* is supposed to be once analyzed as *homo [ille-bonus]* "the man, the good one". In the same way, the original Pedersen's formula for Albanian language: **pus i thellë* would be semantically analyzed as "the well, that deep one". Also Çabej¹³ and Demiraj¹⁴ make a clear distinction between the prepositive article of the adjective, that never had a definition function, and the postpositive article of the noun with definite function. Riza as well, in his first thesis, starting from the prepositive article of the adjective as primary, thinks that in old Albanian this has been substantiated, that means in appositional function¹⁵.

Moreover, the starting from the genitival phrase, on which the author works, presumes the formation of the enclitic article originally in substantives of the same masculine gender in the phrase: **i mish i dash*, temporarily excluding the cases of masculine nouns + noun in the feminine genitive case. Otherwise, if the second noun was a feminine (**i mish e lopë*), as in Alb. the article accords in gender with the foregoing noun, the first substantive would have changed gender receiving the article *e*: **i mishe lopë* → **mishe e lopë*¹⁶. Whereby the author is constrained to operate with the concept of the grammatical analogy to justify the spread of the process in phrases with constituents of different gender. Theoretically, the process of the analogy is possible and in Albanian language has played indeed an important role in language evolution, as has been proved by the studies on historical grammar. However, keeping in mind the real discourse situations seems difficult to think that a linguistic phenomenon starts off a specific gender. Sh. Demiraj, from his part excludes the possibility of the appearance of the definite article in the genitive, because this case in

¹³ E. Çabej, "Rreth disa çështjeve të historisë së gjuhës shqipe", op. cit., p. 114.

¹⁴ Sh. Demiraj, *Gramatikë historike e gjuhës shqipe*, UT, 8 nëntori, Tiranë, 1986, p. 307-308.

¹⁵ S. Riza, "Nyjat e shqipes", op. cit.

¹⁶ S. Mansaku, remark made on the department discussion about the study "Nyjat e shqipes" by K. Topalli.

the i.-e. languages has mainly served to express the determinative of a noun. Also, according to him, the article could not appear in the genitive case, if it would not exist in the other cases as well, especially in the nominative case¹⁷.

2. As above mentioned, for the author is a problem the assumption of a postposition of the demonstrative pronoun in the proto-Albanian, whereas in the today Albanian and in other indo-European languages the proclisis is the normal topics. The proclitic position of the pronoun is precisely the basis of his thesis on the formation of articles. However we should considerate the specificity of Albanian as a typologically Balkan language, where the postposition is inherent, as in Romanian (Çabej, Demiraj, Rosetti, Banfi, Brâncuş et al.). As Çabej has asserted: "Every research within an ancient period of Albanian necessarily leads us to other Balkan languages. From this point of view the main place among them is held by Romanian."¹⁸ The enclitic article in Romanian is believed to be conceived in the nominative phrase with the post-positioned demonstrative of the Balkan Latin *homo ille bonus*. Thus, while the western Roman languages continued the Latin topics *ille homo bonus*, the Romanian language followed the order of the Balkan vulgar Latin *homo ille bonus*, with the demonstrative *ille* moved after the noun¹⁹, according the preferred position for every adjective²⁰ and after re-analyzed as belonging to the noun [*homo-ille*] *bonus* → *omul bun*. Çabej himself has supported with solid intra-linguistic arguments the primacy of the post-positioned Albanian²¹.

¹⁷ Sh. Demiraj, *Gramatikë historike e gjuhës shqipe*, op. cit., p. 307- 308.

¹⁸ E. Çabej, op. cit., p. 106.

¹⁹ In later western Latin texts influenced by the spoken language there are cases of *ille* in function of a determinative postpositioned to the noun, e.g. *montes illi* "mountains these", *speluncam illam* "cave that" in *Peregrinatio Egeriae*, a text written around 400 A.D. See G. Brâncuş, "Shënime mbi prapavendosjen e nyjës së shquarsisë", in: *Lidhje linguistike rumuno-shqiptare. Kërkime mbi fondin trako-dak te gjuhës rumune*. Publishing of the Romanian Institute for Thracology, Thracologic Library. 1999, p. 74. (Translated from the Romanian: Luan Topçiu.).

²⁰ See Maria Manoliu, "The conversational factor in language change. From pre-nominal to post-nominal demonstratives", in: Laurel J. Brinton (ed.), *Historical linguistics 1999: Selected Papers from the 14th International Conference on Historical Linguistics*, Vancouver, 9-13 August 1999, John Benjamins, Amsterdam, 2001, p. 188.

²¹ E. Çabej, op. cit., p. 111-113.

Çabej's thesis is lately supported and reinforced with comparisons to Romanian language by the Romanian linguist Grigore Brâncuș in his book "Romanian-Albanian linguistic relations"²². Among the Albanian linguists, Prof. Shaban Demiraj has the merit for having studied the problem of Albanian articles in comparison with Romanian and other languages that have enclitic articles as the Scandinavian and Armenian languages²³. He supports the opinion of the conceivment of enclitic articles from the anaphoric demonstrative post-positioned to the noun. The conclusion of his arguments about the causes of the postposition of articles' in Albanian and Romanian is the existence of a common linguistic tendency inherited from an earlier phase, and exactly the tendency to the postposition of un independent determinants, where adjectives, possessives and ordinals are also part, which in Albanian and in Romanian are regularly placed behind the noun. This topic in Albanian must be relatively very ancient, inherited from an earlier phase of its evolution²⁴.

Even the Balkanologist E. Banfi thinks that the postpositive article is intrinsic for the Balkan peninsula, probably reinforced by the continuous inter Balkan contacts documented on a bilateral and multilateral basis in different linguistic traditions²⁵.

About the postposition of the demonstrative article in Balkan Latin, Sh. Demiraj believes it could have been an influence of the ancient Balkan substratum²⁶. Among the Romanian linguists we can mention Al. Rosetti, which sees the preference of Albanian and Romanian for the postposition of demonstratives, including the definite article, in the Thracian-Illyrian substratum.²⁷

Today, more and more scholars agree on the influence of the substratum or the proto-Albanian in some common phenomena of Romanian Albanian languages. The Albanologists S. Schumacher and

²² G. Brâncuș, "Shënime mbi prapavendosjen e njëjës së shquarsisë", op. cit. p. 75v.

²³ Sh. Demiraj, *Gramatikë historike e gjuhës shqipe*, op. cit., p. 305 v., 309, 326-337, 541 v.

²⁴ Ibid, op. cit, p. 336.

²⁵ E. Banfi, *Linguistica balcanica*, Zanichelli, Bologna, 1985, p. 69.

²⁶ Sh. Demiraj, op. cit., p. 335 v.

²⁷ Alexandru Rosetti, *Istoria limbii române*, de la origini până în secolul al XVII-lea, Editura pentru Literatură, București, 1968, p. 235-236, quoted after M. Manoliu, op. cit. p. 188.

J. Matzinger emphasize the key role of the Albanian in the Balkan linguistic league, especially on the enclitic definite article as source of this phenomenon in the Balkan languages²⁸.

On the phenomenon of a parallel position and accent shift in Romanian and Albanian languages, Eric Hamp has sustained that "historically the Romanian is Latin spoken in the accentual system of the Albanian" or "the late Danube Latin of Dacia filtered through the grammar of a group of proto-Albanian speakers"²⁹. After what we have exposed, we don't see any reason to reject the postposition as an inner and old characteristic of the Albanian language.

The work of Kolec Topalli contains other innovations in treating different issues connected with the historical evolution of articles, as it is the argumentation of the greater antiquity of the *I* article towards the *u* article by explaining the *y* vowel of the demonstrative pronoun not as a evolution degree (Pedersen: **so* → (*a*)*i* in the path /o/ > /u/ > /ū/ > /y/ > /i/), but as an inner development within the pronouns paradigms. He explains the *y* vowel of the Albanian pronoun system (*ky*, *ay*, *yt*, *ynë*) starting from the second person plural *yj* of Buzuku, that is formed in the way: *i* (as in *im*) + *u* (from feminine *juaj* = *jo* + *u*) + *j* (phonetic addition) → *yj*. This pronominal form, which indeed is very rare and limited on a single author, according to the author has influenced other forms as *yt* and *ynë* and then has been lost. Thus, by avoiding the vowel *y* as a degree in the evolution of the demonstrative pronoun, the theses of the greater antiquity of the *i* article towards the *u* article and the latter has derived from thesis reinforced³⁰.

We have an original explanation about the way of formation of the prepositive article *e* of the adjectives, which presents difficulties to be explained in the syntagma noun feminine+ adjective/noun in the genitive, where the post-positive article does not coincide with the prepositive one: *lëkura e bardhë*, *lëkura e lopës*. The author starts from

²⁸

<https://www.fwf.ac.at/de/wissenschaft-konkret/projektvorstellungen-archiv/2008/pv200805-1/>

²⁹ E. Hamp, "Yugoslavia – a crossroad of Sprachbünde", *Zeitschrift für Balkanologie*, 25, R. Trofenik, 1989, p. 47, quoted after B. Joseph, "Romanian and the Balkans. Some Comparative Perspectives", in: *Emergence of the Modern Language Sciences: Studies on the Transition from Historical-Comparative to Structural Linguistics in honor of E. F. K. Koerner*, John Benjamins, Amsterdam, 1999, p. 222.

³⁰ K. Topalli, *Nyjat e shqipës*, op. cit. p. 71-79.

a feminine paradigm of nouns that has been in similar conditions as the nouns of masculine gender, where the prepositive article has come out from the redoubling of the postpositive article. This is a historical, now obsolete paradigm, of feminine nouns that once ended with consonant, e.g. *et* ~ *etja*, *djep* ~ *djepja*, *lot* ~ *lodja*, *mort* ~ *mortja*. For this type of nouns the author reconstructs a definite form with the postpositive article *-e*: **ete*, that later has taken also the newer definite article *-a*: **etea*, and thus has been formed *etja* "thirst"³¹. The definite article *-e* also according to Çabej has once existed in the feminine gender before the *-a* article, which is formed from the *ë+e* union.

The author has his own opinion about the preposition of article in adjectives in which he follows a different process from that of article generation at nouns, since the adjectives can't have the category of definiteness, as they mark a quality of the noun. Thus, he thinks that the postpositive article of the definite nouns was repeated before the adjectives, in the phrase definite noun +adjective, becoming a marker of the grammar categories of gender, number and case alone, but not of the definiteness. The author has his own opinion even about the question of the existence of two types of adjectives, of article adjectives and article-less adjectives, reinforcing the conclusion of Prof. Demiraj about the formation of article-less adjectives through conversion from the corresponding nouns or with common suffixes.

An important chapter of the book is that of the origin of articles, about which are presented detailed and reasoned explanations, where are faced even various difficulties that come his way. Meyer's thesis about the origin of the feminine article *e* from the i.-e. pronoun **iā*, is reinforced with convincing arguments by bringing a number of examples for the *ia>e* development.

In the book there are considered also the functions of the articles, where, after the description of different usages of the post and prepositive articles, it is explained the variety of the latter with their different sources, which are grouped in four.

One of the principles of Prof. Kolec Topalli research work is the observation of phonetic features in their development in the act of speech. This principle helps the author to explain many questions of the historical development of articles as for example the relative antiquity

³¹ K. Topalli, *Nyjat e shqipës*, op. cit., p. 93-99.

of the article *të* of the accusative case towards the article *e* in basis of syntactic phonetics, as it coincides with the postpositive definite article of the plural and neuter, while the *e* article has been used to avoid the cacophony. In the same way of reasoning is explained also the origin of the *të* article of the accusative case, by supposing it as formed in another accusative paradigm, that was then expanded in the definite nouns with the article *në*, and exactly in the prepositional accusative, or in the so-called "locative case", today becoming obsolete. Through the act of speech is explained even the fall of the *ë* vowel of the postpositive article of genitive-dative case of the masculine nouns (*atit(ë)*) through the word metric in the phrase or wider, in concordance with the Albanian accent(cadence)'s nature.

According the same principle, in the book are analyzed the phonetic characteristics that the articles have undergone during their development in time because of their unaccented position in a phrase or sentence, in the sandhi conditions. The cases *bir i mbretit*, *e bukr' e dheut*, *konak' i djalit* are explained as fall of the postpositive article which is phonetically identical with the prepositive one especially in the masculine nouns, but very diffused is the fall of the postpositive article at feminine nouns (e.g. *fush' e Korçës*, *dhi e malit*, *bagëti e bujqësia*, *histori e Skënderbeut* etc.). It is appropriate to mention here an explanation of the Arbëresh linguist M. La Piana, about a psychological factor that often intervenes to modify the Albanian syntactic phonetics:

When the syntactic function of a word in a sentence is defined by another outer element, the same marker of this function can fall. For example, the adjectives in Albanian are declined in gender, number, case like the corresponding noun paradigms of noun inflection. However, if an inflected noun is followed by an adjective, this remains uninflected: *burri i mirë*, *burrit të mirë* etc. When the adjective is prepositioned followed by the noun, the adjective is inflected while the noun remains uninflected: *i miri burrë*, *të mirit burrë*, *të mirin burrë*. The reason for this is that, as the syntactic relation is defined in the first word, there is no need to be repeated in the second, therefore it falls, for a kind of linguistic economy³². This explanation can be properly used

³² M. La Piana, "I dialetti siculo-albanesi", in: M. Mandalà (ed.), *Albanesi in Sicilia*, A.C. Mirror, Palermo, 2003, p. 80 v.

in the above mentioned. The noun that governs the phrase is semantically definite by the attributive determinant as second element of the phrase and, for reasons of linguistic economy, the definite ending feels redundant and can fall. Certainly here influences also the same or similar sound of the definite ending with the prepositive article that follows.

In the monographs treated quite exhaustively also the indefinite article *një*, in which are treated its differences with the postpositive article, its origin as well as the explanation of its short vowel, the existence or not of its grammar categories or their remains, as the existence of the case in the old Albanian texts, its different forms with their relative chronology and the time of the formation of the word form *nji*, its developments in the conditions of syntactic phonetics and its differences with the numeral *një*.

Finally, the question of the age of the articles has not been left undisputed, where are put in evidence the different opinions of the scholars, even their extreme objections about this issue, and is argued the authors personal stand of a non-ancient age of the articles, in the historical period of Albanian language development, between IV and VI centuries.

These were some of the principal contributions of Kolec Topalli in the totality of the problems that present the Albanian language articles, as one of the most conspicuous traits of its morphological structure.

Bibliography

Banfi, E., *Linguistica balcanica*, Zanichelli, Bologna, 1985.

Bokshi, B., *Prapavendosja e nyjës në gjuhët ballkanike*, Prishtinë, 1984.

Bokshi, B., *Rruga e formimit të fleksionit të sotëm nominal të shqipes*, Prishtinë, 1980.

Brâncuș, G., "Shënime mbi prapavendosjen e nyjës së shquarsisë", në: *Lidhje linguistike rumuno-shqiptare. Kërkime mbi fondin trako-dak te gjuhës rumune*. Botim i Institutit Rumun të Trakologjisë, Biblioteka Trakologjike. 1999, <http://www.scribd.com/doc/29211546/Lidhje-linguistike-rumuno-shqiptare-Brancus-Grigore-1999>.

Çabej, Eqrem, "Rreth disa çështjeve të historisë së gjuhës shqipe", në *Studime Gjuhësore IV*, Rilindja, Prishtinë, 1977. Botuar së pari në BUSHT SSHSH, nr. 1, 1963.

Demiraj, Sh., *Gramatikë historike e gjuhës shqipe*, UT, 8 nëntori, Tiranë, 1986.

Demiraj, Sh., *Sistemi i lakimit në gjuhën shqipe*, UT, Tiranë, 1975.

Graur, A., "Autour de l'article postposé", *Bulletin Linguistique*, V, Paris – București, 1937.

Graur, A., "De nouveau sur l'article postposé en roumain", *Revue Roumaine de Linguistique*, nr. 1, Bucarest, 1967.

Graur, A., "Questions latino-roumaines. 2. A propos de l'article postposé", *Romania*, 50, Paris, 1929.

Hamp, E., "Yugoslavia – a crossroad of Sprachbünde", *Zeitschrift für Balkanologie*, 25, R. Trofenik, 1989.

Joseph, B., "Romanian and the Balkans. Some Comparative Perspectives", në: *Emergence of the Modern Language Sciences: Studies on the Transition from Historical-Comparative to Structural Linguistics in honour of E. F. K. Koerner*, John Benjamins, Amsterdam, 1999.

La Piana, M., "I dialetti siculo-albanesi", në: M. Mandalà (ed.), *Albanesi in Sicilia*, A.C. Mirror, Palermo, 2003.

La Piana, M., *Studi Linguistici Albanesi I*, Palermo, 1939.

Likaj, Ethem, "Disa çështje të zhvillimit historik të nyjave në gjuhën shqipe", *Studime Filologjike*, nr. 4, 1977.

Manoliu, M., "The conversational factor in language change. From prenominal to postnominal demonstratives", në: Laurel J. Brinton (ed.), *Historical linguistics 1999: Selected Papers from the 14th International Conference on Historical Linguistics*, Vancouver, 9-13 august 1999, John Benjamins, Amsterdam, 2001.

Mjedja, N., *Vrejtje mbi artikuj e premna pronës të gjuhës shqipe*, Shkodrë, 1934.

Pedersen, H., "Bidrag til den albanesiske sproghistorie", *Festskrift til Vilhelm Thomsen*, 1894.

Riza, S., "Nyjat e shqipes", *Buletin i USHT. Seria Shkencat Shoqërore*, nr. 4, 1958.

Riza, S., "Probleme të nyjave të shqipes", *Studime Filologjike*, nr.1, 1982.

Riza, S., "Historiku e kritika e trajtimeve të deritanishme të nyjave të shqipes nga gramatikanët përshkrues", *Studime filologjike*, nr. 3-4, 1991, f. 87-115.

Spiro, A., "The parallel evolution of postpositive and prepositive articles in Albanian", *Albanohellenica* 2, 2000-1, 45-50.

Topalli, K., *Nyjat e shqipes*, Toena, Tiranë, 2009.

REVIEWS

A. A. NOVIK, JU. V. BUČATSKAJA, D. E. ERMOLIN, A. S. DUGUSHINA, M. S. MOROZOVA, “PRIAZOVSKIJ OTRJAD. JAZYK I KULTURA ALBANCEV UKRAINY”, ČAST I, TOM 1 (672 P.), TOM 2 (XXX F.), SAINT PETERSBURG, 2016

The collection work in two volumes “*Expedition in the Azov sea. Ukraine's Albanians language and culture*” published by the Russian Academy of Sciences and authored by A. A. Novik, Ju. V. Bučatskaja, D. E. Ermolin, A. S. Dugushina, M. S. Morozova, is a valuable contribution of the Russian Albanologist to the enlightenment of the language and culture of an Albanian linguistic island less known and unstudied by the Albanian dialectologists and ethnologists.

The work target that includes two volumes of 1600 pages, is the study of the traditional culture and of the language of three villages in Ukraine inhabited by a population with distant Albanian origin. The two volumes of this work are an implementation of a wide project aiming to make a complete study of the tradition and the culture of these villages, as principal characteristics of the identity that has been generally well preserved, although they left the motherland 4 - 5 centuries ago. The authors consider this project very palpitating in the circumstances when the Albanian Diaspora is in the conditions of the active interethnic linguistic and cultural contacts risking to lose this cultural tradition and language due to the “formation of the so-called super-ethnic phenomena and realities.” Because of the impetuous political-social developments in the last two centuries — the added contacts with the languages of neighboring communities, the pressure of the official language in the spheres of life and the free movement of population — can accelerate the gradual extinction of the inherited language and culture of these linguistic islands. That's why it is a

scientific responsibility the registration of the language and the spiritual culture material. This process is of vital importance for the preservation of the cultural heritage at the same time.

The villages where the ethnological and linguistic expeditions were carried out, were established from the Albanians of the southeastern Albanian territories who went to Bulgaria during the XV–XVI centuries and during the XVIII–XIX centuries were definitively established in Ukraine. Today, they live in the villages Karakurt (Buxhak) and Gammovka (Xhandran), Georgievskaja (Qushki) and Devninskoje (Taz) (Azov's region). According the census of 2001 in Ukraine, there were living 3308 Albanians: 892 in the region of Zaporozha, 1862 in Odessa and 554 in other regions. 198 inhabitants of Zaporozha declared Albanian as mother tongue, 608 Russian, 63 Ukrainian and 23 other languages. In the Odessa region, 1484 Albanians declared Albanian as mother tongue, 300 Russian, 23 Ukrainian and 55 other languages.

It's a merit of the Russians Albanologist, who in the '70s of the past century and especially in the beginning of this century, have made a lot of linguistic and ethnologic expeditions in this area with subsequent publications about the language and culture of this ethnicity. This work has the origins in the first notifications about the Albanians of Ukraine by the academician Derzhav. The history of these studies continues with the scholars L. Ja. Demko (in the '70s), Julia Ivanova, Ina Voronina, M. Domosileckaja, L. Sharapova etc. and with the younger scholars, Aleksandra Dugushina, Aleksandar Novik, Denis Ermolin, Julia Bučatskaja and M. Morozova, who are the co-authors of this project and authors of these two volumes.

The two volumes are an example of a very careful publishing work and have requisites for a proper scientific publishing. These volumes represent a very detailed scientific apparatus that has the bibliography of the exploited archival sources, the index of geographical names, of proper nouns, the thematic index and the list of the abbreviations used.

The second volume is made up of 762 pages and includes in its the first part a foreword by Alexander Novik. In his foreword he explains the history of the project, the aims and duties that the authors have set for themselves to create a corpus with ethnological and linguistic materials from the linguistic community of the Azov's Albanians and

for the complete study of this corpus. The three following chapters speak about the popular medicine (chapter III, by A. Novik and), traditional coating (chapter IV, by A. Novik), and language (chapter V, by M. Morozova), respectively. The volumes end with an appendix on dialectical texts, compiled by M. Morozova, the list of circumstances (near 200), the list of publication of the authors, the index of the geographical names and of proper nouns and themes, with the list of abbreviations and of resumes of the works in both volumes in Russian, English and Albanian. It is rich in photographic illustration of this area inhabitants, sketches and photos of different environments, tools and clothes of the inhabitants of these areas and their extension map.

The third chapter, "Popular medicine practices as source of life insurance on Georgievska, Devninskoje and Gamovka villages" (pp. 13–150), by which starts this second volume, is authored by Alexander Novik and Julia Bučatskaja. This chapter is dedicated to the healing practice of diseases at home conditions using popular aromatic and medicinal plants that are used in the above mentioned villages. For the first time has been collected a rich material on facts from the researches and through field observation and from the interviews with popular physicians of the zone. The inheritance, generation after generation of this rich tradition of popular medicine has been widely developed since the past century, and also in the beginning of this century, relates to the concrete circumstances of life of the inhabitants of these villages, their isolated life, lack of financial means, insufficient professional medicinal aid and to the lack of the medicine equipment at the centers of public health. In such conditions, natural sources, physiotherapy, teas with wood leaves and different aromatic and medicinal plants, farming and apiculture and sacred formulas were used to improve health conditions of the people. The book describes in details the use of medical plants by inhabitants of the area, wood leaves, of apiculture and farming and of objects taken from the holy places to cure the different diseases. An important role in the past have played the popular physicians, *bulot*, women that served as accoucheurs (midwife), and also for the healing of diseases, and the *dedot* (men). They addressed popular physicians the severe health conditions such as wrenches, bone sticking, psychotherapy, mental illness etc. One of the medicines that these physicians were using were the indigo (chemicals

for healing the diseases), wax, asperges, flour, round stones, fibers etc., and also oral formulas (words, phrases, prayers and Albanian texts).

The medical practices of the Albanians of the Azov Sea are compared with the popular medicine of the neighboring countries Albania, and especially Bulgaria, because of these villages originated from the Bulgarian territories, and similarities and differences between these two practices are evidenced. The authors concluded that centuries-old relations Ukraine Albanians with the Russians and the Ukrainians is the source of the exchange of the diseases practice healing, that according to makes “the dissociation of the today particularity of the popular medicine of the Ukraine Albanians” impossible (p. 127), especially according of home treatment and the use of aromatic and medicinal plants. The use of the magic formulas in Albanian, of relics from Jerusalem and the concept of popular medicine as specific phenomenon of Azov's Albanian population are typical Albanian characteristics of the of popular medicine in these villages.

The fourth chapter, “Traditional clothing of Albanians in the region of Azov sea and Buxhak” (pp. 153–418) authored by Alexander Novik is a wide monograph, to whom the author has dedicated 20 years of work. The chapter describes the popular clothing of Ukraine Albanians, comparing it with the Bulgarians clothes displaced in the Russian Empire in the beginning of the XIX century with those of Albanians of Mandrica in Bulgaria, exiled from the eastern areas of Albanian territories during 1600–1650.

The traditional clothing is considered by the ethnologists a pure symbol of a community ethnicity. The popular costume represents a code of decoded symbols and becomes particularly valuable in the contact areas.

The traditional female clothing that is here described in details is: *shirts with sleeves*, called *çukmáni* (dress without sleeves wear over the shirt with sleeves called *të shirtos ustan* “embroidered dress”), *vraham* (dress with sleeves), *kiráska* (a kind of blouse or vest dress), *farta* (an apron, which they call *a zeza fartë me gërshirë* “black apron with braids”), *qoptári/koptári* (woolen pelerine without sleeves, woolen libade), *çombéri* (tucker, embroidered tucker), *shalçiku* (neckerchief, usually woolen), *borési* (handkerchief 1x1 m), cotton handkerchief they

call *bardha stembél* “white handkerchief” and the bellowed clothing: *long underwear, socks, kallcunkat* (leggings).

As traditional men clothing is mentioned *këmisha*, *keptári* (the vest), *dëmitë* (woolen bloomers also called *poturkë/wide breeches*), *podshitanikët/poshtanikët* (long underwear), *brezi*, *pixhaku* (jacket, also called *zhiket*, introduced on the men clothing at the end of XIX century), *píthet* (*të lëkurta pithe* “leather pithe”), *jopingët* (leather Albanian shoes like moccasins), *jovdjálet* (pack to wrap the legs), *feska* (the fez of soft peaked-skullcap similar to the hat), the ulster (half spherical black spud of wool or fur, which the locals traditionally call ulster), *kubanka* (cylindrical spud, introduced on the clothing inventory under the Russian and Ukrainian influence), *gëzohu* (the fur).

The author was not content in describing the clothing of these villages’ inhabitants alone. In addition, for the first time he compared those even with the clothing of Albanians of Albanian territories and Albanians of Mandrica.

Based on the rich ethnographic material collected through field observation and from museum collections, the author rebukes the previous opinion that the Albanian, the Bulgarian and the Gagauz clothes in the region of Azov are similar, arguing with concrete evidence that this opinion is not true. According the information taken from these villages, the elder instructed the family members they wanted to be buried “as true Albanians - with the traditional clothing (as custom, the older clothing) that they preserved at home and wore them at traditional celebrations” (p. 163). This is could be noted from the photos and the many sketches of clothing that accompany the work, long underwear of men and women of different ages. The white woolen drapery and the embroideries and the braids on it, the Albanian leather shoes like moccasins with clumps etc. are undisputable testimony of the same origin of the Ukraine's Albanians clothing with those of the Albanians from the ethnic territories.

The fifth chapter “The spoken of the Ukraine Albanians: short description of grammar (pp. 422–538), by Maria Morozova, is a short description of the spoken grammatical system of Ukraine Albanians, which is based on linguistic corpus collected by the author in the Albanian speaking villages of Buxhak (2011–2013) and of Azov's region (2005, 2010, 2012). We stress that this work is the last of a

series of monographs dedicated to this community, who start with the monograph of I. Voronina, M. Domosileckaja and M. Sharapova “The spoken of the Ukraine Albanians” (1996) and the dissertations “The spoken Albanian of the Karakurt region” (1972) of L. Demko and “The spoken of the Ukraine Albanians: the evolution of the linguistic system in the conditions of the linguistic contact” (2013) authored by the author of this chapter. These monographs and a serial of other studies are a valuable contribution of the Russian Albanologist to the spoken language of an unstudied region from the Albanian Albanologists.

There are two reasons why the spoken of the Albanians of Ukraine was of great interest for the the Russian Albanologist: first, the Albanian language in these villages is well preserved in these villages, although they are located far away and did not have any contact with the Albanian language of the ethnic territory for 4-5 centuries; second, the observation of the phenomena of what happens in such linguistic islands as consequence of their isolated historic development and of pressure by speaking the language which they have contact with. The study of these aspects is of great value for the Albanian dialectology and grammar, and also for the sociolinguistics.

In the beginning, the author gives a general view of the country where this language is spoken in the Albanian dialectic structure, putting in evidence some characteristics of an older phase of Tosk dialect and of Albanian in general, as the preservation of groups *kl*, *gl* and *lk*, *lg* (*klumësht*, *giuha*, *ulk*, *balgë*), and also an innovation derived from the conditions of isolated development and of the influence of contact with other languages, as diphthongization of *ua*, *ye*, *ie* respectively in *u*, *y* and *i* (*gru* for *woman*, *pys* for *ask*, *mill* for *flour*) etc. In parallel with these facts, in the volume are given data about the level of the use of the Albanian language in these villages, evidencing that different villages have different levels of preservation; better in Zhovtnjevo village and less in the Azov villages, where is used by the older and the middle generation, while the younger generation do not like using it. This might cause the distinction of the spoken Albanian in the Priazov region.

The work describes the grammar system. The characteristics of the nominative and verbal system of this spoken Albanian are presented as archaic phenomenon, inherited or as innovation in the independent

conditions from Tosk dialect and of the influence of the languages which she is in contact with. The novelties are analyzed from the origins, of causes and time when these has happened and with approach inclinations of the Albanian languages developments.

The linguistic corpus shows that these spoken languages have the same speech and the same grammar categories with the Albanian language, viz. the skeleton of the linguistic building is the same. The novelties are seen in classes or subclasses of different grammar categories. Undoubted, the lexicon has major changes. The lexicon issue does not fall in with the subject of this paper. The lexicon is one of the novelty's factors, because the borrowing of words with different phonetic structure has forced changes in the inventory of the closed words classes such as conjunctions, particles and prepositions; and also the changeable parts of the speech created from the new specimen inflections.

The nominal system of this spoken language has the same categories as the Albanian language in the Motherland, although archaic and new characteristics could be noted. The gender category is well preserved. This could be noted in the spoken Albanian of these villages, where even the borrowed names take the proper gender, starting from the endings (the borrowed names from the Gagauz language, which has no gender) or starting from the gender that the name has in the given language, but even in preserving the neuter, although in the unarticled names has started to vacillate. Thus, while keeping the names such as *klumështët*, *krytë*, *milltë* etc., the other part has even secondary, some masculine and some feminine: *mishtë* and *mishi* (meat), *ujët* and *uji* (water), *leshtë* and *leshi* (wool), *djathët* and *djathi* (cheese); *gjalpët* and *gjalpa* (butter), *dyllët* and *dylla* (wax), *mjaltët* and *mjalta* (honey).

The preservation of the neuter gender is an archaic characteristic of these spoken languages, meanwhile some of the novelties follow the path of the Albanian language of the Motherland (the withering of the neuter gender), some other have been impacted by the local languages. Here me can mention a special type of proper nouns and words of kinship relations, that come with unaccented -o: *Mariko*, *Stano*, *Sofijo*, *Kirço*, *Dimço* etc., *dedo* "gËjsh (grandfather)", *babo* "grandmother (maternal)", *mamo* "nënë (mother)", *çiço* "uncle-brother of the father",

toto “sister of the father or mother” etc. Part of this category are even the borrowed names of the gender relations with *-e* ending.

Regarding the number's category, alike the Motherland Albanian, in this spoken Albanian the names have a specific theme for the plural, that is formed in the same way (with suffixes, with changes and with particles and changes), although with different density or new versions, as *-ra*, that has a high density, coming even in the versions of *-re* and *-ro*, that are procreated in the land of this spoken language: *shi–shira*, *bilë–bilëra*, *nuse–nusere*, *mamo–mamoro* etc.

Other archaic characteristics of this spoken language in the case system is the preservation of the locative (*ma ljugët*, *ni malt* etc.), the formation of the predicative case in the singular definite form from the indefinite predicative (*djal–në*, *ulk–në*), although the new form is also encountered (*djali–n*, *ulk–inë*) that is formed from the theme of the definite nominative, as in the official Albanian and the preservation of the article *-t* of plural in the indirect cases (*gra–vet*, *kafadar–ë–vet*). The procreated novelties in this system is the declension of indefinite (the loss of endings of indirect cases in singular and of endings *-ve* and *-sh* plural) as the extinction of the ending *-vet* of definite plural even in the indefinite cases.

The adjectives of this spoken language have the same grammatical characteristics as the official Albanian; the only novelty relates to the adjective syntax, placed before the noun, because it is influenced by Bulgarian: *i miri djalë*, *i bukur njeri*, *a re nuse*, *a babos ditë*. However, there are cases when the adjective is placed after the noun: *djalë i mirë*, *pashka a vogël* etc.

Regarding the verbal system, in this spoken form are preserved the archaic characteristics of the Tosk dialect and of Diaspora. The verb categories are: person, number, time, mood and voice. The modal meanings, as in the official Albanian, are expressed with the particles *du* (want), *duhet/duqet*, *nok/nog* (nuk–don't), *mos/don't*. The conceived novelties because of impact of the local languages which they have contact, is the obliteration of the compound tenses, remaining only five tenses: present, imperfect, simple past tense, past tense and the future tense. More novelties are seen in the construction of the simple past tense, where are movement from one sample to another. Thus, the verbs that in the official Albanian take the non hiat-*v-*, in this spoken

form they take *-t/-jt*: *punojta*, *vdieta* (gjeta-found), *këndojsa* etc.; the indistinguishment between the first person and the second person in singular, by putting in evidence the most verbs with *g*, *h* and those with more vocalization verbs they receive with *-v-* ending with *-o* ending (unë/ti *ndiho*, I, ti *lavo*), and the other verbs taking an *-a* in the first person and *-e/-ë* in the second person (unë *gjegja*, ti *gjegje/gjegjë*; unë *dola*, ti *dole/dolë*). While in the third person the majority of the verbs take *-ë*, those more in post lingual sound with *-u*: *ai punojtë*, *këndojtë*; *ndihu*, *jiku*. But the non-phonetic verbs, as in the official Albanian, come without ending: *mbet*, *dul*, *mur*, *zër* (zuri-get) etc.

Another novelty is the analogical extension of the sigma sample even in the non-sigma verbs: *u nglazufi* “u gëzova”, *u mësushi* “u mësova”, *u martushi* “u martova”, although it should be said that such contraction could be found even the Lab dialect (u *gëzuash* shumë).

An interesting phenomenon could be noted in this spoken form from the Russian borrowed verbs that seems to be still active. To express the aoristic meaning of these verbs is used the scheme of these verbs *běj + infinitivi rusisht*: *bëra noçevat*, “bujta, kalova natën/passed the night”, *un bura sluzhit* “shërbeva-I served” etc.

In the imperfect, the two singular persons have the same ending *-na/-në*, while the third person has *-ni/-në*: I, you *këndo-na/në*, *ai këndonin/në* (sung-këndoja, këndoje, këndonte), *lë-na/në*, *lë-nin/në* (lija, lije, linte), *bu-na/në*, *bu-nin/në* (bëja, bëje, bënte), even in the verbs *kam*, *jam*, *them*: *kish-na/në*, *ish-na/në*, *thosh-na/në*, but on the third person has no ending: *kish*, *jish*, *thosh*. While in the three plural persons have special endings as in the Tosk dialect, but with two types: *punonim/punojim*, *punonit/punojit*, *punonin/punojin*. Nevertheless, are seen even forms with *-ëshim*, *-ëshit*, *-ëshin* (mësonëshim etc.). Although the second forms of the plural are found in the today Albanian of the ethnic territories, we can speak for preservation of the old condition.

The future tense has the particle *od/ot* (this before consonants), that come with *ad/at* and only with *o*, as in the Gjirokastra dialect: *od/ad la* “do ta lë”, *od/ad/o dal* etc.

According the mood category, except the demonstrative, subjunctive, admirative, imperative and participial, the author says that in this spoken are registered even forms with *-sh* ending, interpreted as

present forms and of the interpreted causative perfect, that are found in conditional sentences lead from the conjunctions *ni/ndi/nji* “*në*”: *ni gëlltishe*, *ni këndoshe*, “*në këndofsha*” etc. If in general, the causative in these spoken language has been replaced by the subjunctive's present and imperfect tenses. Other difference is the admirative that in this spoken language has only simple tenses, that are formed as in the official Albanian. The imperative has two forms, the singular ends in *-j*: *duftej* (*dëfto/show*), *pënoj* (*puno-work*), although forms like *puno/work* are met; while the plural comes ends in *-ni*.

Rami MEMUSHAJ

EDMOND MALAJ, *DRISHTI-HISTORIA DHE FIZIONOMIA E NJË QYTETI MESJETAR SHQIPTAR* (Drivasto. History and physiognomy of an Albanian Medieval city), Kristalina-KH, **Tirana 2015, p. 452**

Lately the monograph *Drishti-historia dhe fizionomia e një qyteti mesjetar shqiptar* (Drivasto. History and physiognomy of an Albanian Medieval city) authored by Professor Assoc. Dr. Edmond Malaj has appeared in print, published by the Institute of History of the Center of Albanological Studies. This publication is an added value to the Albanian mediaeval history because the medieval history has been little studied.

The monograph is of great importance for the Albanian historiography as it enlightens the rich medieval history of Drishti. Abundant historical documents have been used. Undoubtedly, the monograph reflects the diligent personality of the author.

The monograph has 10 chapters divided into two parts following a chronologic-thematic criterion. The first part is comprised of six chapters and addresses particular aspects of the history of medieval city of Drishti.

The first chapter that corresponds with introduction explains the purpose of the author, the current situation of the studies on the medieval history of Drishti, and methodology used.

The second chapter analyzes in a chronological order the general history of the city, from the origins to the Venetian period (XV century). It informs about the geographic position, the etymology and city's structure, in addition to the Balshaj's rule and the Ottoman threats. This is a short chapter considering the time period it covers, but it is rich in historical data about the main political-military events that occurred in Drishti during this millennial period.

The two following chapters explain in details and from the same point of view the Venetian period to the Ottoman occupation. These

chapters devote some space to the establishment of the Venetian rule in Shkodra's area and the agitated events of the first two decades of this study. All these data prove the serious efforts made to analyze the political confrontations of the new rule with the people of the city and with the previous rulers, especially with the Balshaj, but also with the Ottomans.

The fifth chapter informs about the administrative aspects of the city, the architecture, population composition, Drishti's families etc. The chapter gives in details information about the different levels of power and administrative hierarchy. Although these relations are not always clearly described in the documents, the author succeeded in giving a detailed and clear reflection of these aspects. Even the following chapter where the social aspect of Drishti's history is explained, is rich in details about the structural composition of the community. In a very detailed way is described the Engjëlli family, the origins and biographic data for the well-known members of this family like Andrea Engjëlli and Pal Engjëlli. Other noble families of the city like Belli Humoi, Lepore Mazreku, Palomba, Prekali Suma, Shpani, Ungri as though Barba Biancha, Bariloch, Dushmani, Manganja, Skepudar Sporo, Svinis, Tossil, Zaon, Zogi and less documented families are also mentioned.

The author managed to explain the ethnical and social composition of this population. Groups with limited rights are the Arbër (albanenses), the Foreigners (Forenses), the Meguls (Megulsi) and the Slavs.

The seventh chapter explains the Drishti's economic and cultural aspects. This chapter was written using abundant documents and gives a detailed information about its content. The author explains the production and trade problems, the different professions, coins and other cultural aspects.

The eighth chapter explains the migration of population and the new Drishti's Diaspora in Venice. The people's migration and the Drishti Diaspora citizens in Venice, and especially the Drishti noble families in exile as Shpani and Engjëlli (Angelus) with the respective genealogies is here detailed. In addition, a document dated in 1547 about the Engjëlli properties in Drishti and the Shën Gjergji (Saint George) order and its connections with the Engjëlli family. In the

subchapter “Pasuritë e Engjëllorëve sipas dokumentit (Ëngjëlli family wealth according the documents)”, rightfully the author questions the pretention of the document about the Engjëlli family wealth.

The second part of the monograph informs the reader about the ecclesiastical history of the Drishti dioceses. It is comprised of three exuberant chapters that give a general understanding of what the rich Christian world of medieval Drishti looks like. The author shows some aspects of this institution. He starts with the data about this city's churches and the churches in the surrounding area, then he continues with the history of the bishops, the statues of the Drishti Cathedral, and concludes with the Drishti's clerics activities in Ragusa, Venice and other countries.

The chapter, “Të dhëna historike mbi Ipeshkvinë dhe klerin e Drishtit (Historical data on Drishti's Bishopric and clergy)”, gives historical data about Bishopric and clergy in Drishti throughout the centuries and makes a logic division between bishopric history of Drishti up to XVI century and beyond. It also informs about the official bishops from the XVI century.

The chapter, “Monumentet kishtare dhe klerikët (Ecclesiastical monuments and the clergy)”, is very rich in information and proves that the author is a proficient analyzer of this information. Here the documentary information on churches documented in this city are intertwined with the anonymous church ruins. The author made great and undisputed efforts to identify the ruins of the churches using the available documentary data at his disposal.

The last chapter informs about the presence and the activity of the Drishti clergymen in Ragusa, especially their secular role as attorney and tax-collectors. Also, interesting information is given about the pilgrimage of these clergymen.

The documentary appendix is an integrated part of this monograph. The illustrative photos have been wisely selected and are very representative.

The listing sources used and the bibliography are exuberant. The author used the majority of the available documents, and of the bibliography on the study's object. In addition to the sources used, the index of names and places of the persons cited in the text show the

scientific responsibly of the author and make this book interesting for the reader.

All the illustrations and photographs are an added value to this monograph as they are realized by the author himself and show the originality of the book.

There is a long history in the realm of historiography in Albania and the monograph by Prof Edmond Malaj is undoubtedly an added value to the Albanian historiography. This work helps everyone interested in history to quench the curiosity about this medieval Albanian city.

Ardian MUHAJ
Hasan BELLO

ANA LALAJ, PRANVERA E RREJSHME E '56 (The false spring of '56), Publishing house: Infbotues, **Tirana 2015, 322 pages**

The history of the III Conference of the Central Committee of the Party of Labor of Albania [hereinafter: PLA] in Tirana (hereinafter: The Conference of Tirana), held in April 1956, is one of those events, which the Albanian communist leadership would prefer to ignore. However, while the text books during the communist regime refused to mention the event, and this event was only unfolded by the archives only when one of the "rebel" delegates was raising his voice, the public opinion continued to raise questions and discuss about it in a low voice. After the fall of the communist regime, this event naturally awakened the interest of both the public opinion and scholars. A lot has been written about it by those who participated in this event, analysts and journalists, but a scientific approach was still missing. The book, "*Pranvera e rrejshme e '56 (The false spring of '56)*" by Prof Dr Ana Lalaj fills gap, because it is based on a wide range of may historical sources and on an impressive literature.

Book explores the efforts for a sort of a liberalism by the communist regime in the Communist Eastern Europe, which is fueled by the political changes that occurred in the Soviet Union shortly after the Stalin's death in 1953. Prof Lalaj has based her analyses in four main pillars:

Initially, she brings a detailed panorama of the internal and external situation of Albania during the '50s, contextualizing in this way the Conference of Tirana. The author informs us about the economic difficulties Albania was facing at the beginning of the '50s using statistics and documents.

The book confronts the reality of the time with the PLA propaganda for the impetuous economic and social development of the country through a range of Albanian and Soviet documents, which shed

light over the wrong economic policies followed by official Tirana, as: insufficient investments and the wrong tax policy on Albanian village; the low living conditions of the Albanian population and the need to improve it; the very high expenditures for the armed forces and the need to be reduced in number etc.

Among the external factors that played an important role to the political developments of Albania during the '50s, the author rightfully defines the changes that happened in the Soviet Union after the death of Stalin. When Khrushchev began to rise to power, the Communist Block was overwhelmed. His theses on peaceful coexistence between East and West gave the international political affairs a new dimension. The secret report kept by Khrushchev, denouncing the crimes of Stalin condemning and punishing his cult of the individual, caused a tempest among the communist leadership of the Eastern Block. The book points out that the liberal spirit on the economic and social policies, Khrushchev's efforts to bring back into the Communist Block Tito's Yugoslavia, expelled in 1948 and, especially the rehabilitation of some former higher Eastern European leaders, condemned as consequence of Stalin-Tito break, brought fresh air within the Block. In some cases, this wind of change encouraged civilian movements in Warsaw and in Budapest. The protester worded demands addressing the essence of the political system. In Tirana, the Albanian communist leaders worried and had difficult dilemmas. They had supported the legitimacy of the regime over the "right and principled stand" that they kept towards Tito's Yugoslavia and his local agents, who one of the most distinguished names was that of Koçi Xoxe, former minister of interior, and organizational secretary of the PLA. The rapprochement with Yugoslavia or the rehabilitation of Koçi Xoxe was impossible for Enver Hoxha and the high communist leaders, because their power would unavoidably be risked. Prof Lalaj explains in a very detailed and realistic way the stand of Koçi Xoxe towards Yugoslavia and his relations with Enver Hoxha.

The second pillar of the book lies in the reasons why Tirana's communists raised their voice during an ordinary party conference. The book exposes the reader to the atmosphere of the time and makes him understand that the political climate in Albania was caused dissatisfactions due to the wrong direction the country was taking, and

gap that was growing deeper and deeper between high communist leaders and the people. "The leadership block" was not only a simple and impenetrable neighborhood at the center of Tirana, but an oasis of payments, food, stocks of nourishment, health care privileges etc. The gap between the leaders of a country that were propagating parity would cause dissatisfaction, that was day after day supported even from the signals coming from Moscow for more democracy within the party and to reflect on the past. There were precisely these fraught in time dissatisfactions who found the way to explode at the Tirana Conference.

The third pillar of the book lies in the analyzes of the days of the Conference and the powerful turn that the situation took during its development. The documented facts are written in black and white and have been collected from Albanian and foreign archives. Historical analysis as much as human inform us about the events' occurrence during the conference, violence anatomy and of repression the communist regime used against its citizens. Enver Hoxha's change from an understandable, reasonable and allegedly fatherly person, into an arrogant that attacks, investigates and gives verdicts, illustrates a painful realism. Prof Lalaj says that with such a behavior Enver Hoxha wanted to surpass the conference's walls. More than a message to the delegates who dared to oppose, his stand was a warning for all the others. With a sorrowful realism is also brought in the book and transformation that the "rebel" delegates of the Conference suffered, who dared to raise the voice in front of the daily injustices, but collapsed from the strength and the weight of the authoritarian power.

The reasons for objection have a special place in the analyses of Prof Lalaj. The majority the of delegates of the Conference were intellectuals who were idealistic communists and had contributed in different ways to establish and strengthen the regime. All of them, then and after, stated that they didn't want the collapse of the regime. This is veraciously affirmed by the author herself, but more than that, she gives us a methodological and theoretical approach. She explains that the regime had established purposefully a fluid and contradictory concept on the critics and opponents. Superposing these concepts, the regime suppressed the critique, dogmatically accepted, because all those that raised the voice were considered enemies of the regime. Even in the

case of the critical delegates towards the communist leadership, was applied the same strategy. Prof. Lalaj makes the right definition of these delegates considering them critics towards specific undertaken policies, but not opponents of the regime. So, she gives the real weight of the Conference in the history of Albania.

The analyses of the Tirana Conference consequences, as for the main actors also as much as for the Albanian society, is the last and pillar and the essence of the whole book. The Tirana Conference had dramatic consequences for all those who dared to say the undeniable truths, not as opponents that were seeking the collapse of the regime, but rather as idealists who wanted to bring it closer the ideals they had fostered. More than personal necessities, the course of the events during the Conference killed the hope for change even within the regime.

According to the author the external factors influencing the Tirana Conference events help us understand the anatomy of violence. The political and scientific discourse during the years of communism addressed the critics for the Yugoslavs as organizers of the Conference. This stand has prevailed even in the historiography after the '90s. Prof Lalaj says that these documents are not neither Yugoslav nor Albanian. In a convincing analyze that she makes to the indicted elements as collaborators with the Yugoslavs, condemned as such and as organizers of the Tirana Conference we could mention Tuk Jakova, Bedri Spahiu, Liri Gega, Dhora Leka etc., the reader might raise the reasonable question about what has been written in the so far historiography about this issue. Denying every foreign intervention on the organization of the Conference, she goes even further. She concludes that "the conference has a spirit, but not organization", defining in this way the reason of its failure.

It is said that a good scientific work succeeds in touching the minds, promotes the thinking, raising questions about what is known until now. "*Pranvera e rrejtshme e '56*" by Prof. Ana Lalaj appeals the reader. The book gives the reader a new dimension of what has been written about Albania during the '50s and in general about this conference due to research work in the many national and foreign archives. The book succeeds in tampering the human feelings, not only about the fate of the "rebel" delegates of the conference, but also on the

abduction of man under a dictatorial regime. As book analyses, the carefully selected corpus of documents and equipped with complete notes and explanations, offers a scanner over the “toughs” to shut the mouths up, to oppress the individuality and to depersonalize the society. In this context, the book “*Pranvera e rrejshme e '56*” is a work on the past, but who speaks loud even today.

Sonila BOÇI

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Kolec Topalli	
<i>Some archaic features in De Rada's work</i>	3
Ioannis Vitaliotis	
<i>The fresco decorations of the churches of Voskopoja / Moschopolis in the context of post-Byzantine painting (17th-18th century)</i>	11
Genciana Abazi-Egro	
<i>An attempt for early literature heritage assessment : Zef Jubani and the « beyteci » literature</i>	31
Shaban Sinani	
<i>Naim Frashëri and Rumi, in the context of the Persian-Iranian Culture presence on the Albanian tradition</i>	45
Floresha Dado	
<i>Franz Nopcsa, from albanological approaches to poetic creation</i>	57
Hamit Kaba	
<i>Rapprochement efforts: Albania's relations with the USA and England during the '70-80</i>	63
Arian Leka	
<i>Socialist realism facing other schools based on realism</i>	89
Virion Graci	
<i>The atypical characters of the author Dritëro Agolli</i>	133

REVIEWS

Valter Memisha	
<i>Thimi Mitko on the Albanian language through the records on him, in the archive of the Linguistic and Literature Institute, Tirana</i>	143

Anila Omari

Kolec Topalli's contribution on the issue of the Albanian articles (On the monograph “*Nyjat e shqipes*”, edit. Toena, Tiranë, 2009).....165

Rahmi Memushaj

A. A. Novik, JU. V. Bučatskaja, D. E. Ermolin, A. S. Dugushina, M. S. Morozova, “*Priazovskij Otrjad. Jazyk I Kultura Albancev Ukrainy*”, Čast I, TOM 1 (672 P.), TOM 2 (XXX F.), Saint Petersburg, 2016.....177

Ardian Muhaj, Hasan Bello

Edmond Malaj: *DRISHTI. HISTORIA DHE FIZIONOMIA E NJË QYTETI MESJETAR SHQIPTAR* (Drivasto. History and physiognomy of an Albanian Medieval city), Kristalina-KH, Tiranë 2015, 452 p.187

Sonila Boçi

Ana Lalaj, *PRANVERA E RRJESHSHME E '56* (The false spring of year fifty-six), Tiranë 2015, 322 p.191